

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### III. CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS, CONTINUED

#### CERD

- Costa Rica, CERD, A/57/18 (2002) 21 at para. 74.

74. The Committee is concerned at the situation of indigenous people, in particular:

(a) Information according to which indigenous people living in remote regions suffer, *inter alia*, from lack of health care, education, drinking water and electricity;

...

The Committee invites the State party to continue to pay due attention to the specific needs of this population...

- Lithuania, CERD, A/57/18 (2002) 35 at para. 175.

175. The Committee expresses concern in relation to information regarding the discriminatory treatment of Afghan asylum-seekers, and the disregard of basic procedural guarantees. Having taken into account the assurances given by the delegation concerning legislative provisions in this regard, the Committee nevertheless recommends that the State party ensure equal treatment for all asylum seekers, including Afghan nationals, in refugee determination proceedings. The Committee recommends that educational rights and assistance in administrative matters be granted to children of asylum-seekers, including those of Afghan nationality.

- Republic of Moldova, CERD, A/57/18 (2002) 41 at para. 214.

214. The Committee welcomes the decrees which the State party has adopted with the purpose of ensuring the functioning and development of languages of ethnic minorities and the development of the national culture of minorities, including Ukrainian, Russian, Jewish and Bulgarian groups. The Committee commends that the State party continue its efforts aimed at facilitating access to education in their mother tongue for members of minorities.

- Armenia, CERD, A/57/18 (2002) 50 at para. 280.

280. While noting the adoption in 1999 of the Education Act, guaranteeing the right to education without discrimination, the Committee remains concerned about inadequate access by minority children to education in their mother tongue and reiterates its recommendation that the State party take measures to ensure, wherever possible, such access.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Canada, CERD, A/57/18 (2002) 56 at para. 337.

337. The Committee is concerned about allegations that children of migrants with no status have been excluded from the school system in some of the provinces and hopes that the situation will be remedied.

- Hungary, CERD, A/57/18 (2002) 63 at para. 382.

382. The Committee notes that, notwithstanding the measures provided for in the "Medium-Term Package of Measures", the drop-out rates among Roma students remain high, especially in secondary education and even more so at university level. The Committee strongly recommends that the State party reconsider its policy of assigning Roma children to schools and classes for the mentally disabled. The Committee is also concerned about discriminatory practices resulting from the system of separate classes for Roma students and from private schooling arrangements. While noting that the State party intends to improve the education of Roma, the Committee further recommends that new programmes integrate Roma children into mainstream schools, as far as possible, in order to avoid discrimination.

- Ecuador, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 22 at para. 59.

59. While welcoming the sincerity with which the State party recognizes the existence of *de facto* discrimination against indigenous people, Afro-Ecuadorians and members of other minorities, the Committee is concerned that a disproportionately high percentage of persons belonging to ethnic minority groups often do not enjoy equal access to the labour market, land and means of agricultural production, health services, education and other facilities and, accordingly, a disproportionately high percentage of members of these groups live in poverty. The Committee urges the State party to intensify its efforts to raise the living standards of these groups, with a view to ensuring their full enjoyment of the economic, social and cultural rights enumerated in article 5 of the Convention...

- Fiji, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 25 at paras. 77 and 95.

77. The Committee expresses its appreciation for the inclusion, in the 1997 Constitution of Fiji, of a Social Justice Chapter (sect. 44), calling for the elaboration of programmes designed to achieve, for all groups or categories of persons who are disadvantaged, effective equality of access to education and training, land and housing, and participation in commerce and all levels and branches of State public services.

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

95. While welcoming the assurance given by the State that schools are not racially separated in Fiji, the Committee wishes to receive more information on the consequences and the practical implementation of the Education (Establishment and Registration of Schools) Regulation, which states that “while a registered or recognized school may, when selecting pupils for admission give preference to pupils of a particular race or creed, no admission shall be denied solely on grounds of race or religion”. The Committee also wishes to know whether the State party enhances and financially supports multiracial schools...

- Ghana, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 30 at para. 121.

121. The Committee is concerned about the existing educational gap between populations of certain geographic areas of the country, which has an ethnic dimension. The Committee encourages the Ghanaian authorities to pursue and increase the efforts already undertaken to remedy this situation...

- Poland, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 35 at para. 163.

163. The Committee notes efforts to meet the specific educational needs of Roma children, but is concerned that in some cases these efforts have led to segregated classes having a lower standard of education than the Polish counterparts. The Committee recommends that new programmes integrate Roma children into mainstream schools as far as possible, in order to avoid discrimination, and that the State party recruit more teachers and teaching assistants from the Roma minority...

- Saudi Arabia, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 41 at para. 206.

206. The Committee...notes the high number of schools that have been authorized to offer programmes for the education of children of migrant workers that have been designed in their country of origin.

- Slovenia, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 45 at para. 238.

238. The Committee appreciates the flexible approach of the State party as regards the education of Roma children by attempting to address the issue in each given community. However, the Committee is concerned at the existing practice of educating some children in vocational centres for adults and others in special classes. Recalling its general recommendation XXVII on discrimination against Roma, the Committee encourages the State party to promote the integration of children of Roma origin into mainstream schools.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Uganda, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 50 at para. 268.

268. The Committee notes the considerable investment made by the Government in the area of education and welcomes the information provided by the delegation regarding the extension of the Universal Primary Education programme to all children of school-going age.

- Czech Republic, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 65 at para. 386.

386. While appreciating the complexity of the problem of special schooling and noting the accompanying measures taken by the Government with a view to promoting adequate support to Roma children, the Committee remains concerned, as does the Committee on the Rights of the Child (see CRC/C/15/Add.201, para. 54), at the continued placement of a disproportionately high number of Roma children in “special schools”.

Recalling its general recommendation XXVII, the Committee urges the Government to continue and intensify the efforts to improve the educational situation of the Roma through, *inter alia*, enrolment in mainstream schools, recruitment of school personnel from among members of Roma communities, and sensitization of teachers and other education professionals to the social fabric and world views of Roma children and those with apparent learning difficulties.

- Latvia, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 75 at para. 453.

453. While recognizing the possibility of establishing private schools offering, *inter alia*, education in minority languages, the Committee urges the State party to ensure that the manner in which funding to private schools is provided is in conformity with the Convention.

- Republic of Korea, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 83 at para. 489.

489. The Committee...welcomes the amendment to the education regulations that allows foreign children of compulsory school age, including those of undocumented migrant workers, equal access to local schools.

- Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 85 at para. 511.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

511. The Committee is concerned that no information has been provided by the State party on the economic, social and cultural situation of minority groups. It is further concerned that persons of Carib ancestry tend to be viewed as the base of the social pyramid and experience discrimination. In general, access to health care and educational opportunities depends on the level of family income.

...The enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights, including access to public services, must be ensured for all without discrimination, in accordance with article 5 of the Convention.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 88 at para. 542.

542. The Committee expresses concern about the discrimination faced by Roma/Gypsies/Travellers that is reflected, *inter alia*, in their higher child mortality rate, exclusion from schools, shorter life expectancy, poor housing conditions, lack of available camping sites, high unemployment rate and limited access to health services.

The Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general recommendation XXVII on discrimination against Roma and recommends that the State party develop further appropriate modalities of communication and dialogue between Roma/Gypsy/Traveller communities and central authorities. It also recommends that the State party adopt national strategies and programmes with a view to improving the situation of the Roma/Gypsies/Travellers against discrimination by State bodies, persons or organizations.

- Malawi, CERD, A/58/18 (2003) 93 at para. 559.

559. The Committee expresses concern over the State party's reservations to the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees which, in particular, reduce the protection offered to refugees in the field of employment, access to property, right of association, education and social security.

The Committee welcomes the draft Refugee Act, which reflects the intention of the State party to withdraw these reservations, and encourages the State party to give high priority to this process. The Committee recommends, in particular, that the State party take steps to ensure that child refugees are, in practice, given access to education.

- Nepal, CERD, A/59/18 (2004) 24 at para. 133.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

133. The Committee is concerned that, although the system of agricultural bonded labour known as *Kamaiya* was abolished in July 2000, the emancipated *Kamaiyas* are facing many problems, including lack of housing, land, work and education for their children.

The Committee recommends that the State party ensure effective enforcement of the Bonded Labour Prohibition Act 2002 and programmes adopted to put an end to the practice and discrimination against *Kamaiyas*.

- Spain, CERD, A/59/18 (2004) 32 at para. 167.

167. The Committee...notes with satisfaction the extensive measures taken in the social, economic, cultural and other spheres in connection with the Gypsy community, including *inter alia*:

(a) The further implementation of the Gypsy Development Programme, aimed at promoting access for members of the Gypsy community - on terms of equality with the rest of the population - to public education, health, housing, employment;

...

(c) The Gypsy Education Group aimed at improving the current situation regarding education for Gypsy children and young people.

- Suriname, CERD, A/59/18 (2004) 36 at para. 198.

198. The Committee is disturbed at the continuing lack of health and education facilities and utilities available to indigenous and tribal peoples. It regrets that no special measures have been taken to secure their advancement on the grounds that there are no available data suggesting that they need special protection.

The Committee recommends that greater efforts be undertaken by the State party, in particular as regards the education plan of action for the interior. It also recommends the inclusion in agreements with large business ventures - in consultation with the peoples concerned - of language specifying how those ventures will contribute to the promotion of human rights in areas such as education.

- Sweden, CERD, A/59/18 (2004) 41 at paras. 219 and 221.

219. While the Committee welcomes the new Equal Treatment of Students in Higher

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Education Act, which entered into force on 1 March 2002 and which contains prohibitions on direct and indirect ethnic discrimination against students and applicants in the field of higher education, it takes note that the Act is reportedly not being implemented with respect to some Swedish universities.

The Committee invites the State party to provide an assessment of the implementation of the new Act.

...

221. While the Committee acknowledges with satisfaction the initiatives taken by the State party to improve the situation of the Roma, such as the establishment of a Council for Roma Issues in 2002 as an advisory body to the Government, it remains concerned about the difficulties still faced by a large part of the Roma community in areas such as employment, housing and education.

The Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general recommendation XXVII on discrimination against Roma and encourages the State party to intensify its efforts to implement national strategies and programmes in these areas, including the biennial strategic programme of the Ombudsman against Ethnic Discrimination, with a view to improving the situation of the Roma and their protection against discrimination.

- Argentina, CERD, A/59/18 (2004) 45 at para. 235.

235. The Committee welcomes the entry into force of Immigration Law No. 25871 in January 2004, which replaces the former Immigration Law No. 22439, and provides, *inter alia*, for the following:

...

(b) Migrants' access to basic rights such as education and health irrespective of their migration status;

...

- Slovakia, CERD, A/59/18 (2004) 70 at para. 385.

385. While the Committee welcomes the extensive measures adopted by the State party in the field of education aimed at improving the situation of Roma children, including the "Roma assistants" project, it continues to express concern at *de facto* segregation of Roma children in special schools, including special remedial classes for mentally disabled children.

The Committee recommends that the State party prevent and avoid the segregation of Roma children, while keeping open the possibility of bilingual or mother-tongue education. The Committee further recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to raise the level of

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

achievement in school by Roma children, recruit additional school personnel from among members of Roma communities and promote intercultural education.

- Saint Lucia, CERD, A/59/18 (2004) 86 at para. 449.

449. The Committee notes that access to education and training by indigenous peoples appears very limited and is concerned at the fact that Kweyol is not taught in the education system.

The Committee encourages the State party to take measures to facilitate access to education by members of indigenous peoples and to ensure, as far as possible, that members of indigenous peoples have the opportunity to learn Kweyol and to receive instruction in this language.

- Australia, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 13 at para. 39.

39. While noting the improvement in the enjoyment by the indigenous peoples of their economic, social and cultural rights, the Committee is concerned over the wide gap that still exists between the indigenous peoples and others, in particular in the areas of employment, housing, health, education and income (art. 5).

The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to achieve equality in the enjoyment of rights and allocate adequate resources to programmes aimed at the eradication of disparities. It recommends in particular that...the State party set up benchmarks for monitoring progress in key areas of indigenous disadvantage.

- Azerbaijan, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 18 at para. 62.

62. While welcoming the information provided on minority groups, the Committee regrets the insufficiency of information on the participation of these groups in the elaboration of cultural and educational policies. It is also concerned at the lack of programmes to support minority languages, and that those languages are not used in the educational system to an extent commensurate to the proportion of the different ethnic communities represented in the State party's population (art. 5).

The Committee invites the State party to facilitate the participation of ethnic minorities in the elaboration of cultural and educational policies. The Committee also recommends to the State party that it take the necessary measures to create favourable conditions that will enable persons belonging to minorities to develop their culture, language, religion, traditions



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

and customs, and to learn or to have instruction in their mother tongue...

- Bahrain, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 22 at para. 86.

86. The Committee notes with concern the reportedly disparate treatment of and discrimination faced by members of some groups, in particular the Shia, that may be distinguishable by virtue of their tribal or national origin, descent, culture or language; the Committee is especially concerned about apparently disparate opportunities that are afforded to such groups.

The Committee recommends that the State party ensure that everyone, without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, enjoys the rights to work and to health and social security, adequate housing and education in accordance with article 5 (e) (i), (iii), (iv) and (v) of the Convention.

- France, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 26 at paras. 107 and 112.

107. The Committee is...concerned at the unfavourable situation faced by immigrants and population groups of immigrant origin in the field of employment and education, despite the State party's substantial efforts in this area.

The Committee encourages the State party to follow the recommendations set out in the Court of Audit's report on employment and education for immigrants and population groups of immigrant origin. The Committee draws the State party's attention to its general recommendation XXV on gender-related dimensions of racial discrimination, and also invites it to bear more specifically in mind, in all measures which are adopted or planned, the situation of women, who sometimes fall victim to twofold discrimination.

...

112. The Committee takes note of the information supplied by the State party on the implementation of the Act of 15 March 2004 governing the wearing of symbols or clothing denoting religious affiliation in State primary and secondary schools, in pursuance of the principle of secularism.

The Committee recommends to the State party that it should continue to monitor the implementation of the Act of 15 March 2004 closely, to ensure that it has no discriminatory effects and that the procedures followed in its implementation always place emphasis on dialogue, to prevent it from denying any pupil the right to education and to ensure that everyone can always exercise that right.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Ireland, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 30 at para. 142.

142. The Committee, noting that almost all primary schools are run by Catholic groups and that non-denominational or multid denominational schools represent less than 1 per cent of the total number of primary education facilities, is concerned that existing laws and practice would favour Catholic pupils in the admission to Catholic schools in case of shortage of places, particularly in the light of the limited alternatives available (art. 5 (d) (vii) and 5 (e) (v)).

The Committee, recognizing the “intersectionality” of racial and religious discrimination, encourages the State party to promote the establishment of non-denominational or multid denominational schools and to amend the existing legislative framework so that no discrimination may take place as far as the admission of pupils (of all religions) to schools is concerned.

- Lao People’s Democratic Republic, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 35 at para. 171.

171. The Committee notes with concern that, according to certain reports, a major obstacle to the education and vocational training of persons belonging to ethnic groups is the fact that education is provided only in Lao. Language barriers are also apparently responsible for the many problems encountered in obtaining access to social services (art. 5).

The Committee recommends to the State party that it take all possible measures to ensure that persons belonging to ethnic groups receive education and vocational training in their mother tongue and that it increase its efforts to ensure that they learn Lao.

- Barbados, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 43 at para. 219.

219. While taking note of the State party’s observation that education in Barbados is “socially guaranteed”, the Committee expresses concern that the right to education as well as other economic and social rights are not adequately protected in domestic law.

The Committee recommends to the State party that it ensure equal enjoyment of economic and social rights including the right to education contained in article 5 (e) of the Convention.

- Nigeria, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 54 at paras. 284 and 293.

284. The Committee notes with appreciation the provision of mobile schools for children of nomadic communities.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

...

293. The Committee is concerned about the persistence of discrimination against persons belonging to various ethnic groups in the fields of employment, housing and education, including discriminatory practices by people who consider themselves to be the original inhabitants of their region against settlers from other states...

The Committee recommends that the State party continue to promote equal opportunities for all persons without discrimination in order to ensure their full enjoyment of their rights, in accordance with article 2, paragraph 2, and article 5 of the Convention...

- Turkmenistan, CERD, A/60/18 (2005) 61 at paras. 321 and 325.

321. The Committee is concerned about information that persons belonging to national and ethnic minorities are impeded from exercising their right to enjoy their own culture. In particular, it is concerned about the reported closure of minority cultural institutions and of numerous schools teaching in minority languages, in particular Uzbek, Russian, Kazakh and Armenian languages...

The Committee recommends that the State party fully respect the cultural rights of persons belonging to national and ethnic minorities. In particular, the State party should consider reopening Uzbek, Russian, Kazakh, Armenian and other minority language schools. The Committee suggests that the State party reconsider the requirement that students belonging to national or ethnic minorities wear Turkmen national dress...

...

325. The Committee is deeply concerned by information that the State party has adopted measures drastically limiting access to foreign culture and art, foreign media and the Internet. While taking note of the abolition of the exit visa in 2004, it also remains concerned about the reported impediments imposed on Turkmen students wishing to study abroad (art. 7).

The Committee recommends to the State party that it respect the freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art or other media, in order to foster common understanding and tolerance amongst nations and ethnic groups. The Committee also recommends that the State party allow students to study abroad...

### ICCPR

- Togo, ICCPR, A/58/40 vol. I (2002) 36 at para. 78(22).

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

(22) The Committee is worried about continuing discrimination against women and girls with respect to access to education, employment, inheritance and political representation in Togo. Moreover, as the State party itself has acknowledged, certain cultural practices, as well as women's unawareness of their rights, give rise to many violations of women's rights.

The State party should eliminate all forms of discrimination against women, increase its efforts to educate girls and make the population more aware of women's rights, and carry out new programmes with a view to giving women access to employment and political posts.

- Mali, ICCPR, A/58/40 vol. I (2003) 47 at para. 81(13).

(13) The Committee states its concern about reports that women do not enjoy rights on an equal basis with men as regards political participation and access to education and employment.

The State party should strengthen its efforts to promote the situation of women in the areas of political participation, access to education and access to employment...

- Slovakia, ICCPR, A/58/40 vol. I (2003) 52 at para. 82(18).

(18) The Committee notes the introduction of programmes such as pre-school grades at elementary schools, the inclusion of Romani language education and the inclusion of teacher's assistant positions for Roma pupils. However, the Committee is concerned about the grossly disproportionate number of Roma children assigned to special schools designed for mentally disabled children, which causes a discriminatory effect in contravention of article 26 of the Covenant.

The State party should take immediate and decisive steps to eradicate the segregation of Roma children in its educational system by ensuring that any differentiation within education is aimed at securing attendance in non-segregated schools and classes. Where needed, the State party should also provide special training to Roma children to secure, through positive measures, their access to education without segregation.

- Latvia, ICCPR, A/59/40 vol. I (2003) 25 at para. 65(20).

(20) While noting the explanation provided by the State party for the adoption of the Education Law of 1998, particularly the gradual transition to Latvian as the language of

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

instruction, the Committee remains concerned about the impact of the current time limit on the move to Latvian as the language of instruction, in particular in secondary schools, on Russian speakers and other minorities. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned about the distinction made in providing State support to private schools based on the language of instruction (arts. 26 and 27).

The State party should take all necessary measures to prevent negative effects on minorities of the transition to Latvian as the language of instruction. It should also ensure that if State subsidies are provided to private schools, they are provided in a non-discriminatory manner.

- Colombia, ICCPR, A/59/40 vol. I (2004) 35 at para. 67(19).

(19) Although the Committee has taken note of the information provided by the State party on the reduction in the number of internally displaced persons in 2002 and 2003, it remains concerned about the continued high number of displaced persons in Colombia and the lack of socio-economic assistance provided by the State party to these people, especially in fields such as the education of children and medical care...

The State party should intensify programmes aimed at providing economic and social assistance to internally displaced persons so that they may, in conformity with article 26 of the Covenant, enjoy as many of the benefits provided by State institutions as possible...

- Germany, ICCPR, A/59/40 vol. I (2004) 39 at para. 68(4).

(4) The Committee appreciates the measures taken to improve the protection of children, in particular legislation granting children a right to education in a non-violent environment...

- Suriname, ICCPR, A/59/40 vol. I (2004) 43 at para. 69(19).

(19) While noting the State party's effort to establish a "nucleus centre" to provide schooling in the interior of the country, the Committee remains concerned at reports indicating that as few as 40 per cent of children living in the interior of the country attend primary school, thus depriving many children of the possibility of attending school on an equal footing with children in other parts of the country (art. 26).

The State party should ensure that all children are afforded equal opportunities for access to schooling, and that school fees do not prevent them from receiving primary education.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Serbia and Montenegro, ICCPR, A/59/40 vol. I (2004) 68 at paras. 75(18) and 75(24).

(18) The Committee is concerned about the lack of full protection of the rights of internally displaced persons in Serbia and Montenegro, particularly with regard to access to social services in their places of actual residence, including education facilities for their children, and access to personal documents... While noting the State party's view that internally displaced persons have equal status with other citizens of Serbia and Montenegro, the Committee is concerned at the lack of enjoyment of their rights in practice. The Committee notes that Roma from Kosovo displaced during the 1999 conflict are a particularly vulnerable group (arts. 12, 26).

The State party should take effective measures to ensure that all policies, strategies, programmes and funding support have as their principal objective the enjoyment by all displaced persons of the full spectrum of Covenant rights. Furthermore, internally displaced persons should be afforded full and effective access to social services, educational facilities, unemployment assistance, adequate housing and personal documents, in accordance with the principle of non-discrimination.

...

(24) The Committee is concerned that widespread discrimination against the Roma persists with regard to all areas of life. The Committee is particularly concerned about the deplorable social and economic situation of the Roma minority, including access to health services, social assistance, education and employment which has a negative impact on the full enjoyment of their rights under the Covenant (arts. 2, 26, 27).

The State party should take all necessary measures to ensure the practical enjoyment by the Roma of their rights under the Covenant, by urgently implementing all strategies and plans to address discrimination and the serious social situation of the Roma in Serbia and Montenegro.

- Albania, ICCPR, A/60/40 vol. I (2004) 25 at paras. 82(17) and 82(21).

(17) While noting the progress made in establishing registration centres, the Committee is concerned about the continuing high number of citizens who have migrated internally in recent years but were not registered at their new domicile and for this reason face problems of access to social welfare, education and other services (arts. 12 and 16).

The State party should take effective measures to ensure that all citizens are registered in order to facilitate and ensure their full access to social services.

...

(21) While noting measures undertaken to improve the living conditions of the Roma community, the Committee is concerned that the Roma community continues to suffer

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

prejudice and discrimination, in particular with regard to access to health services, social assistance, education and employment which have a negative impact on the full enjoyment of their rights under the Covenant (arts. 2, 26 and 27).

The State party should take all necessary measures to ensure the practical enjoyment by the Roma of their rights under the Covenant, by urgently implementing and reinforcing effective measures to address discrimination and the serious social situation of the Roma.

### *See also:*

- Slovenia, ICCPR, A/60/40 vol. I (2005) 74 at para. 93(17).
- Yemen, ICCPR, A/60/40 vol. I (2005) 65 at para. 91(21).

(21) The Committee notes with concern that the Personal Status Act allows children aged 15 to marry, and that early marriage of girls, sometimes below the age fixed by the law, persists. It is also concerned about marriages of under-age children contracted by their guardians. This practice jeopardizes the effectiveness of the consent given by spouses, their right to education and, in the case of girls, their right to health (arts. 3, 23 and 24).

The State party should raise the minimum age of marriage and ensure that it is respected in practice.

- Thailand, ICCPR, A/60/40 vol. I (2005) 83 at paras. 95(21) - 95(23).

(21) The Committee is concerned about the significant proportion of children, often stateless or of foreign nationality, in the State party who engage in labour and, as explained by the delegation, are often victims of trafficking (arts. 8 and 24).

...The State party should make every effort, including preventive measures, to ensure that children who engage in labour do not work under conditions harmful to them and that they continue to have access to education...

(22) Notwithstanding the corrective measures taken by the State party, most notably through the Central Registration Regulations 1992 and 1996, to address the issue of statelessness among ethnic minorities, including the Highlanders, the Committee remains concerned that a significant number of persons under its jurisdiction remain stateless, with negative consequences for the full enjoyment of their Covenant rights, as well as the right to work and their access to basic services, including health care and education...

The State party should continue to implement measures to naturalize the stateless persons

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

who were born in Thailand and are living under its jurisdiction...

(23) The Committee is concerned about the lack of full protection of the rights of registered and unregistered migrant workers in Thailand, particularly with regard to liberty of movement, access to social services and education, and access to personal documents...

The State party must take measures to effectively implement the existing legislation providing for the rights of migrant workers. Migrant workers should be afforded full and effective access to social services, educational facilities and personal documents, in accordance with the principle of non-discrimination...

### ICESCR

- Sweden, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 106 at para. 744.

744. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that education in independent schools, including those that have been established in the form of private companies with shareholders, is in full conformity with article 13 of the Covenant, in particular paragraph 1, on educational aims and objectives, and with the Committee's General Comment No.13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant).

- Colombia, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 110 at paras. 776, 777 and 797.

776. The Committee notes that article 67 of the Constitution guarantees free public education, except for those who can afford to pay fees. It notes with concern that the imposition of fees prevented a number of children from having access to free primary education and that their families had to institute legal proceedings in order to obtain such access. This practice by the State party is contrary to articles 13 and 14 of the Covenant.

777. The Committee is concerned about the poor quality of education at all levels. It is also concerned that the State party has one of the lowest adult literacy rates in the region.

...

797. The Committee recommends that the State party launch an effective campaign to address the quality of education and access to it with a view to providing, *inter alia*, free and compulsory education. In this regard, the Committee refers the State party to its obligations under article 14 of the Covenant, according to which it must "secure ... compulsory primary education, free of charge". The Committee recommends that the State party, in implementing its Decennial Plan for Education, take into account the Committee's General Comments No. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant) and establish an effective



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

monitoring system for the plan. The State party is also encouraged to seek technical advice and assistance from UNESCO in relation to the implementation of its plan.

- Algeria, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 116 at paras. 825, 826, 833 and 843-845.

825. With regard to education, the Committee is deeply concerned about the high drop-out rates, which was acknowledged by the delegation during the dialogue with the Committee.

826. The Committee notes with concern the data in the UNDP *Human Development Report, 2001* that indicates a significant decrease in public spending on health and education in the 1990s, as a percentage of both GNP and GDP, and relative to military expenditure, which more than doubled as a percentage of GDP.

...

833. The Committee recommends that the State party withdraw the interpretative declarations on articles 8 and 13 of the Covenant.

...

843. The Committee recommends that the State party increase its expenditures for health and education...

844. The Committee urges the State party to take all appropriate measures in order to address the problems relating to the high dropout rates in the country's school system, as well as the relatively low enrolment rate in secondary schools.

845. The State party is urged to pursue the development and adoption of a comprehensive National Education for All Plan, as anticipated in paragraph 16 of the Dakar Framework for Action adopted at the World Education Forum in April 2000. When formulating and implementing its plan, the State party should take into account the Committee's General Comments No. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13) of the Covenant and establish an effective monitoring system for the plan. The State party is also encouraged to seek technical advice and assistance from the UNESCO in relation to both the formulation and implementation of its plan.

- Croatia, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 125 at paras. 902 and 919.

902. With respect to the right to education, the Committee commends the near-achievement of universal and free compulsory primary education, in conformity with article 14 of the Covenant. However, the Committee is concerned by reports that some children from certain minority groups, in particular the Roma, and children of undocumented aliens may not be going to school. The Committee is concerned about reports that the curriculum and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

textbooks used in schools contain derogatory references to minority groups.

...

919. The Committee recommends that immediate steps be taken to ensure that all children residing within the territory of the State party, regardless of their ethnic origin or the status of their parents, are able to go to school and are protected from discrimination.

- Jamaica, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 130 at paras. 942 and 955.

942. The Committee expresses particular concern about the inadequate level of State expenditure on education, accompanied by a decline in the quality of education. It is reported that recent statistics from the State party show that 40 per cent of children who complete primary education can neither read nor write.

...

955. The Committee urges the State party to take immediate steps to address the declining quality of education, including by seeking assistance from UNESCO in this regard. The Committee refers the State party to its General Comment No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant).

- Czech Republic, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 25 at paras. 90 and 111.

90. The Committee is deeply concerned about the over-representation of Roma children in so-called "special schools" which are primarily designed for mentally retarded children, resulting in discrimination, substandard education and the stigma of mental disability.

...

111. The Committee urges the State party to take immediate and effective measures to eliminate discrimination against Roma children by removing them from "special schools" and integrating them into the mainstream of the educational system.

- Ireland, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 29 at para. 150.

150. The Committee urges the State party to enact legislation that extends the constitutional right to free primary education to all adults with special educational needs.

- Benin, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 34 at paras. 179, 180 and 198-200.

179. The Committee is concerned at the persistently high illiteracy rate in the State party, which is higher among women than men. It also notes with concern the cultural preference given in educational matters to male children, as can be seen in the markedly higher primary

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

school enrolment rates for boys than for girls.

180. The Committee is concerned at the fact that primary education is not free of charge and that parents pay direct and indirect school fees.

...

198. The Committee recommends the State party to step up efforts to provide girls and boys with equal access to education. It urges the State party to take effective measures to improve the literacy rate, particularly of women.

199. The Committee recommends the State party to undertake, by all available means including technical cooperation, the progressive introduction of free primary education. The Committee appeals to the State party to abide by the provisions of article 14 of the Covenant and to adopt, within two years, a detailed plan of action for the progressive implementation, within a reasonable number of years, to be fixed in the plan, of the principle of compulsory education free of charge for all.

200. The Committee urges the State party to get down to the formulation and adoption of a wide-ranging plan of national education for all, as called for in paragraph 16 of the Dakar Framework for Action adopted at the World Education Forum in April 2000. It is invited to take account, in formulating and carrying out that plan, of the Committee's general comments no. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and no. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant), and to institute an effective follow-up system. It is invited to seek advice and technical assistance from UNESCO in formulating and carrying out its plan.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 39 at paras. 225 and 244.

225. The Committee notes with concern that the introduction of tuition fees and student loans, which is inconsistent with article 13, paragraph 2 (c) of the Covenant, has tended to worsen the position of students from less privileged backgrounds, who are already underrepresented in tertiary education.

...

244. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures to ensure that the introduction of tuition fees and student loans does not have a negative impact upon students from less privileged backgrounds, in accordance with paragraphs 14, 20 and 45 of the Committee's general comment no.13 (1999) on the right to education...

- Trinidad and Tobago, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 45 at para. 267.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

267. The Committee is deeply concerned that the minimum age for work, which is too low, in certain cases as low as 12 years, leaves children more vulnerable to exploitation and prejudices their right to education.

- Slovakia, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 50 at paras. 323 and 338.

323. The Committee is alarmed about the low rate of primary school enrolment and the high drop out rates at secondary schools among Roma children.

...

338. The Committee urges the State party to intensify its efforts to increase the school attendance of Roma children, especially at the primary level, and to address the problem of dropouts among secondary school pupils...

- Poland, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 54 at paras. 355, 364, 377 and 386.

355. ...The Committee...expresses its concern at the high dropout rates among Roma students.

...

364. The Committee expresses its concern that the relatively high incidence of child labour in rural areas, as acknowledged by the State party's delegation, has a negative impact on children's health and on their right to education.

...

377. ...The Committee...urges the State party to adopt effective measures to combat the low school attendance and high dropout rates among Roma students and to provide for their integration into regular classes on an equal footing with other Polish children.

...

386. The Committee...recommends the adoption of legislation in order to regulate child labour in rural areas in such a way that the right to health and right to education of working children are fully protected.

- Georgia, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 59 at paras. 425, 426 and 444.

425. The Committee regrets the lack of detailed information on the situation of primary education in the information provided by the State party. The Committee is concerned that, although primary education should be provided free of charge, as stipulated by law and in article 14 of the Covenant, parents are faced with payments for various purposes.

426. The Committee is further concerned about the high number of school drop-outs, particularly in secondary education.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

...

444. The Committee recommends that the State party undertake measures to ensure that access to free primary education is not impeded in reality by additional material costs and by informal fees. In addition, the Committee suggests that the State party continue its reform of the school system, which aims, *inter alia*, to reduce the number of dropouts.

- Solomon Islands, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 65 at paras. 462, 463, 476 and 477.

462. The Committee is deeply concerned that primary education is not compulsory in the State party, as provided for in article 14 of the Covenant. The Committee notes furthermore that the cost of textbooks, stationery and teaching materials is unaffordable for many parents and makes primary education inaccessible to many.

463. The Committee is concerned that fewer girls than boys enrol in primary schools and that there is a high drop-out rate among girls in both primary and secondary schools.

...

476. The Committee further urges the State party to take steps to ensure that all children are able to fully exercise their right to free and compulsory primary education, in accordance with article 14 of the Covenant, and to seek assistance from UNESCO in this regard. The Committee refers the State party to its general comment no. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant).

477. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures, including programmes which explicitly target parents, to eliminate gender disparity in enrolment rates both at primary and secondary education levels.

- Estonia, ICESCR, E/2003/22 (2002) 68 at paras. 514 and 538.

514. The Committee notes with concern the high drop out rates among children in primary and secondary schools.

...

538. The Committee requests the State party to take all appropriate measures to address the problem of high drop out rates among children in primary and secondary schools.

- Luxembourg, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 24 at para. 103.

103. The Committee notes the imminent establishment of a national university (Université de Luxembourg) and recommends that education at the university be free from the outset, or that tuition fees be kept at a minimum level with a view to introducing progressively free

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

higher education, as required by article 13, paragraph 2 (c), of the Covenant.

- Brazil, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 28 at paras. 118 and 119.

118. The Committee notes with appreciation constitutional amendment No. 14 (adopted on 12 September 1996) which established the Teaching Development and Enhancement Maintenance Fund, reorganized the primary education system and earmarked more resources for education.

119. The Committee welcomes the creation within the State party of independent special rapporteurs responsible for monitoring economic, social and cultural rights, particularly the right to food, to health and to education.

- New Zealand, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 35 at paras. 193 and 208.

193. The Committee is concerned about persistent inequalities between the Maori and non-Maori people in access to education and the high dropout rates, especially among Maori children and young people and the disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

...

208. The Committee urges the State party to take remedial action to ensure that the indigenous Maori people have equal access to education...

- Israel, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 42 at paras. 252, 262, 278 and 288.

252. The Committee notes that, while gaps still remain, the State party has achieved some positive results towards expanding basic education and special education for non-Jewish sectors.

...

262. The Committee deeply regrets the refusal of the State party to provide in its second periodic report additional information on the living conditions of population groups other than Israeli settlers in the occupied territories as requested in its 2001 concluding observations. The Committee continues to be gravely concerned about the deplorable living conditions of the Palestinians in the occupied territories, who - as a result of the continuing occupation and subsequent measures of closures, extended curfews, roadblocks and security checkpoints - suffer from impingement of their enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights enshrined in the Covenant, in particular access to work, land, water, health care, education and food.

...

278. ...The Committee...calls upon the State party to give full effect to its Covenant

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

obligations and, as a matter of the highest priority, to undertake to ensure safe passage at checkpoints for Palestinian medical staff and people seeking treatment, the unhampered flow of essential foodstuffs and supplies, free movement to places of employment, and the safe conduct of students and teachers to and from schools.<sup>23/</sup>

288. The Committee...encourages the State party to develop the system of mixed schools for Jewish and Arab pupils, in order to promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among the citizens of the country.

---

### Notes

...

<sup>23/</sup> [Official Records of the Economic and Social Council], 1999, Supplement No. 2 (E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26), chap. IV, para. 265.

---

- Republic of Moldova, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 49 at paras. 319 and 341.

319. The Committee is concerned about the high rates of non-attendance and high dropout rates in primary and secondary education. It notes with particular concern that the main reason for non-attendance is acute family poverty. The Committee is also concerned about the lack of pre-school education.

...

341. The Committee urges the State party to reinforce its efforts to ensure that children are not prevented from attending school because of poverty in the family. It also recommends that the State party consider establishing new pre-school educational institutions...

- Yemen, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 55 at paras. 367 and 386.

367. The Committee is concerned that the policy of compulsory education has yet to be fully implemented. It further notes the high dropout rates, especially among girls in rural areas, and the inadequate training of teachers.

...

386. The Committee urges the State party to implement fully its national education for all plan for, taking into account the Committee's general comments Nos. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant).

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Guatemala, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 59 at paras. 403, 404, 419, 421, 422 and 437.

403. The Committee is concerned about the persisting discrimination against indigenous peoples, with regard to access to, *inter alia*, landownership, work, education, health services and adequate nutrition and housing.

404. The Committee is concerned about the *de facto* inequality between women and men, which is perpetuated by traditional prejudices and social conditions, in spite of an important number of legal instruments adopted by the State party.

...

419. The Committee is concerned that only 30 per cent of children living in rural communities complete primary education and, in the case of indigenous children, only 20 per cent complete it. The Committee also expresses its concern about the limited access for indigenous peoples to enjoy education in their mother tongue and to use it in their dealings with public authorities.

...

421. The Committee recommends that the State party increase its efforts to combat discrimination against indigenous peoples, in particular in the areas of employment, health services, landownership, adequate nutrition, housing and education.

422. The Committee calls upon the State party to ensure equality between men and women in all spheres of life, in particular by taking effective measures to combat discrimination in the education of the girl-child, in access to employment, in equal pay for work of equal value and in access to land and credit services...

...

437. The Committee urges the State party to make efforts to increase school attendance of children, particularly of indigenous children. The Committee recommends that the State party broaden its intercultural bilingual education and allocate adequate funds and human resources to the Department of Intercultural Bilingual Education, and improve the working conditions of teachers by paying them better salaries and providing them with training as well as hiring additional teachers to cover rural areas fully.

- Russian Federation, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 64 at paras. 452, 454, 479, 480, 482 and 507.

452. The Committee is deeply concerned about the poor living conditions in the Republic of Chechnya and notes with regret that sufficient information was not provided on this problem in the State party's report. While acknowledging the difficulties posed by the ongoing military operations, the Committee is concerned about the problems faced by people in the Republic of Chechnya with regard to the provision of basic services, including health care and education.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

...

454. The Committee is concerned about reports of cases where the lack of registration of place of residence and other identity documents in practice places limitations on the enjoyment of rights, including work, social security, health services and education. The Committee is also concerned about reports that some groups of people, including the homeless and the Roma, face particular difficulties in obtaining personal identification documents, including registration of residence.

...

479. The Committee remains concerned about reports that a sizeable number of children, owing to migration, homelessness and neglect, do not attend school.

480. The Committee urges the State party to allocate sufficient funds to reinstate basic services, including the health and education infrastructure, in the Republic of Chechnya.

...

482. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that the lack of residence registration and other personal identity documents do not become an obstacle to the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights.

...

507. The Committee recommends that the State party reinforce its efforts under the federal programme entitled “Youth of Russia (2001-2005)” to ensure that no child is deprived of the right to education...

- Democratic People’s Republic of Korea, ICESCR, E/2004/22 (2003) 71 at paras. 516, 533, 534, 549 and 555.

516. The Committee...notes with appreciation the full implementation of a free and universal 11-year education system.

...

533. The Committee remains concerned about the declining attendance rate in schools, from 99 to 85 per cent according to the State party, as a consequence of national disasters.

534. The Committee remains concerned that children with disabilities, whenever possible, are not included in the regular school system.

...

549. The Committee calls upon the State party to continue its efforts in assisting those children who have suffered from the consequences of natural disasters to return to school.

...

555. The Committee recommends that the State party change the present system concerning the education of children with disabilities by allowing these children to be educated in the regular school system. Moreover, the State party should take measures to raise awareness among students, teachers and families of the special needs of these children and train

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

teachers to assist them effectively in regular classes.

- Greece, ICESCR, E/2005/22 (2004) 23 at paras. 131, 132, 139, 148, 153, 160 and 170.

131. While acknowledging the State party's efforts to promote the social integration of Greek Roma, the Committee remains deeply concerned about the persistent discrimination against Roma people in the fields of housing, health and education...

132. The Committee notes with concern that economic, social and cultural rights normally also guaranteed to non-citizens, such as the right to non-discrimination or the right to free education, are reserved to Greek citizens under the State party's Constitution.

...

139. The Committee is concerned that, according to information received, an alleged approximate number of 5,800 children below the minimum working age of 15 years illegally work in the streets.

...

148. The Committee is concerned that a high percentage of Roma and Turkish-speaking children are not enrolled in school, or drop out at a very early stage of their schooling. While it is possible to receive bilingual instruction in Turkish and Greek at the two Muslim minority secondary schools in Thrace, the Committee notes with concern that no such possibility exists at the primary level or outside Thrace, and that members of other linguistic groups have no possibility to learn their mother tongue at school.

...

153. The Committee recommends that the State party harmonize its relevant constitutional provisions with its obligation to guarantee that the Covenant rights will be exercised without discrimination, based on the prohibited grounds as enshrined in the Covenant.

...

160. The Committee recommends that, in compliance with article 10 of the Covenant, the State party institute criminal proceedings and takes other effective measures against parents or other persons who may be exploiting children below the minimum working age of 15 years illegally working in the streets. The State party should also take measures to ensure regular school attendance by these children, as provided for by article 13 of the Covenant.

...

170. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures to increase school attendance by Roma and Turkish-speaking children, including at the secondary level, to ensure, to the extent possible, that children belonging to minority linguistic groups have an opportunity to learn their mother tongue, including regional dialects, at school, and to ensure an adequate staffing with teachers specialized in multicultural education.

- Kuwait, ICESCR, E/2005/22 (2004) 29 at paras. 198, 199, 218 and 219.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

198. The Committee is concerned that ages for admission and completion of free compulsory primary to intermediate education have not been clearly set.

199. The Committee is concerned that the State party does not provide free compulsory education to non-Kuwaiti children as a right enshrined in the Covenant.

...

218. The Committee recommends that the State party set ages for admission to, and completion of, free compulsory primary to intermediate education. In this regard, it refers the State party to the Committee's general comments Nos. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (article 14 of the Covenant) and 13 (1999) on the right to education (article 13 of the Covenant).

219. The Committee urges the State party to adopt the necessary measures to ensure that non-Kuwaiti children living in Kuwait have access to free compulsory education as a right enshrined in the Covenant...

- Spain, ICESCR, E/2005/22 (2004) 34 at paras. 232 and 249.

232. The Committee is concerned that, in spite of the existence of a range of programmes at the national and regional levels aimed at improving the situation of the Roma (Gypsy) population, including the Second National Plan of Action for Social Inclusion (2003-2005) and the Gypsy Development Programme, the Roma remain in a vulnerable and marginalized situation in the State party, especially with regard to employment, housing, health and education.

...

249. The Committee encourages the State party to continue and strengthen its efforts to address the situation of the Roma population, increasing at the same time the involvement of Roma associations in the planning and implementation of such programmes...

- Ecuador, ICESCR, E/2005/22 (2004) 39 at paras. 297 and 323.

297. The Committee is concerned about the high rate of illiteracy and school dropouts in the State party. The Committee is particularly concerned in this regard about the situation of young girls and of indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian children.

...

323. The Committee urges the State party to take all possible measures to combat illiteracy, particularly amongst the most disadvantaged and marginalized groups...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Italy, ICESCR, E/2005/22 (2004) 54 at paras. 435 and 456.

435. Reiterating its concluding observations on Italy's third periodic report, the Committee remains concerned about the plight of Roma immigrants living in camps with poor housing, unhygienic sanitary conditions, limited employment prospects and inadequate educational facilities for their children.

...

456. The Committee urges the State party to step up its efforts to build more permanent housing settlements for the Roma immigrants and take all the necessary measures to promote their integration into local communities, offer them job opportunities and make adequate educational facilities available to their children.

- Azerbaijan, ICESCR, E/2005/22 (2004) 59 at paras. 498 and 524.

498. The Committee is concerned that pursuant to article 19 of the Law on the Legal Status of Foreigners and Persons Without Citizenship, the State party does not provide free compulsory education to non-Azerbaijani children. The Committee also expresses concern that the education standards in the State party have experienced a fall over the last decade owing to a number of factors, including lack of State investment in education.

...

524. The Committee calls upon the State party to take effective measures to ensure that all children under its jurisdiction have access to free compulsory education as a right, as stipulated in the Covenant, and to significantly increase the public expenditure on education. In this regard the Committee further encourages the State party to consider amending the Law on the Legal Status of Foreigners and Persons without Citizenship...

- Chile, ICESCR, E/2005/22 (2004) 67 at paras. 555 and 585.

555. While noting the progress made in increasing education coverage, the Committee is concerned at the disparity in the quality of education offered in municipal and private schools. The Committee is also concerned about the relatively high drop-out rates, especially among teenage girls.

...

585. The Committee recommends that the State party continue to strengthen efforts to improve the quality of education in municipal schools and to address the issue of dropouts, especially among teenage girls, including by securing adequate support for teenage mothers to continue their education.

- Zambia, ICESCR, E/2006/22 (2005) 19 at paras. 78, 100, 101 and 123-125.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

78. The Committee notes with appreciation the State's policy of allowing pregnant girls to continue in their education.

...

100. The Committee is deeply concerned about the high incidence of child-headed households, a phenomenon that it is linked to the HIV/AIDS pandemic and which negatively impacts on children's access to education.

101. While noting the activities undertaken by the State party such as the Programme for the Advancement of Girls' Education aimed at encouraging girls to stay in the school system, especially in the rural areas, the Committee remains concerned that traditional attitudes continue and that discrimination against girl children is prevalent in the State party.

...

123. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen the Ministry of Education Strategic Plan to ensure that its objective of providing nine years of free and compulsory basic education by 2015 is reached. The Committee urges the State party to set both intermediate goals and concrete and measurable benchmarks in this regard.

124. The Committee recommends that the State party take steps to provide assistance to child-headed households, including financial and other means of assistance to enable child heads of household to exercise their basic right to education.

125. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts and continue to undertake educational campaigns for all sectors of society, including traditional rulers, parents and guardians, on the value of educating girl children.

- China, ICESCR, E/2006/22 (2005) 25 at paras. 166 and 195.

166. The Committee is concerned about the continued irregularities in the State party's provision of universal access to free compulsory primary education, in particular with regard to rural communities, minority regions, disadvantaged families and internal migrant population. The Committee is also concerned about the high junior middle school drop-out rate in some rural areas.

...

195. In line with its general comments No. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant), the Committee calls upon the State party to take effective measures to ensure that all children, including migrant children and ethnic minority children, have access to free compulsory primary education. The Committee also calls upon the State party to undertake effective reforms in the current education financing policies so as to allocate sufficient funds to support the provision of free and compulsory nine-year education to all children on

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

national, state and local levels; and to eliminate all school-related fees so as to make compulsory primary education truly free for all children. The Committee further urges the State party to increase public expenditure on education in general, and to take deliberate and targeted measures towards the progressive realization of the right to education for the disadvantaged and marginalized groups throughout the country.

- China (Hong Kong Special Administrative Region), ICESCR, E/2006/22 (2005) 34 at paras. 218 and 230.

218. The Committee is concerned that the measures taken to facilitate enrolment in local schools of children of migrants from the Mainland and other foreign migrant workers who do not have the legal right to remain in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region are insufficient.

...

230. The Committee urges the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to amend its legislation to provide for the right to education of all school-age children in its jurisdiction, including children of migrants without the legal right to remain in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.

- China (Macao Special Administrative Region), ICESCR, E/2006/22 (2005) 38 at paras. 245 and 255.

245. While welcoming efforts made by the Macao Special Administrative Region to enable the integration of children of migrants in the school system, the Committee notes with regret that education provided to children of migrant workers is not free of charge.

...

255. The Committee recommends that the Macao Special Administrative Region strengthen its efforts to provide free compulsory education to all school-age children, including children of migrant workers.

- Serbia and Montenegro, ICESCR, E/2006/22 (2005) 41 at paras. 273, 274, 297, 301, 302 and 324.

273. The Committee is deeply concerned that, despite the State party's efforts to improve the economic and social situation of Roma through the national action plans for the implementation of the Decade of Roma Inclusion (2005-2015) in both Republics,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

widespread discrimination against Roma persists with regard to employment, social security, housing, health care and education.

274. The Committee expresses its deep concern about the uncertain residence status of and the limited access by refugees, returnees from third countries and internally displaced persons, including internally displaced Roma, to personal identification documents, which are a requirement for numerous entitlements such as eligibility to work, to apply for unemployment and other social security benefits, or to register for school.

...

297. The Committee is deeply concerned that a high percentage of Roma children and children belonging to other minority groups, as well as refugee and internally displaced children, are not enrolled in school, drop out at an early stage, are being discriminated against at school, or are placed in schools for children with special needs.

...

301. The Committee recommends that the State party ensure adequate participation of Roma representatives in the implementation of the plans of action adopted or envisaged by both Republics with regard to non-discrimination, gender equality, employment, social protection, housing, health and education of Roma, and to allocate sufficient funds to these and other relevant programmes.

302. The Committee calls on the State party to assist refugees, returnees and internally displaced persons by facilitating the procedures necessary to obtain personal documents, including birth certificates, identity cards and work booklets, to enable them to enjoy their economic, social and cultural rights.

...

324. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures to promote school attendance by Roma children and children belonging to other minority groups, as well as refugee and internally displaced children, by increasing subsidies, scholarships and the number of teachers instructing in minority languages. It also urges the State party to eradicate ethnically discriminatory attitudes by taking effective measures in the fields of teaching, education, culture and information, in order to promote understanding, tolerance and mutual respect among all ethnic groups living on its territory.

- Norway, ICESCR, E/2006/22 (2005) 48 at paras. 349, 360 and 370.

349. The Committee is concerned about the restrictions placed on the access to education of asylum-seekers, as asylum-seeking children only have access to free primary and lower secondary education and asylum-seekers over the age of 18 are not offered courses in Norwegian.

...

360. The Committee urges the State party to give priority to ensuring the availability of a

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

sufficient number of places in kindergartens, particularly in densely populated urban areas.

...

370. The Committee encourages the State party to ensure that asylum-seekers are not restricted in their access to education while their claim for asylum is being processed.

### CEDAW

- Fiji, CEDAW, A/57/38 part I (2002) 9 at paras. 60 and 61.

60. The Committee notes with concern that an increase in levels of poverty and adverse economic conditions are undermining Fiji's gains in women's education. These conditions have led to a higher incidence of girls dropping out of school, with connected problems of early marriage, teenage pregnancies and sexual exploitation.

61. The Committee recommends the introduction of targeted policies and programmes to reduce poverty, prevent early marriage, teenage pregnancies and girls dropping out of school.

- Portugal, CEDAW, A/57/38 part I (2002) 35 at para. 321.

321. The Committee notes with satisfaction the high level of women's educational achievement and the increasing diversification in the types of studies pursued by women...

- Suriname, CEDAW, A/57/38 part II (2002) 82 at paras. 57 and 58.

57. The Committee is concerned that, in some educational institutions, teenage mothers are not always readmitted to junior secondary schools because of the perception that "the young mothers would have a negative influence on other girls", while teenage fathers are not prevented from attending schools.

58. ...The Committee...urges the State party to adopt the necessary legal or administrative measures to prohibit schools from barring young mothers and pregnant teenagers.

- Zambia, CEDAW, A/57/38 part II (2002) 107 at paras. 229, 246 and 247.

229. The Committee commends the introduction of the Programme for the Advancement of Girl Child Education, the reservation of 25 per cent of government scholarships exclusively for women who qualify for entry into universities and the lowering of cut-off



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

points for girls to qualify for entry to grades 8 and 10 in schools in order to redress inequality in the education sector.

...

246. Despite the State party's effort in the area of education, the Committee is concerned at the low rate of female literacy, the low enrolment of girls in school in rural and urban areas and the high dropout rate of girls due to pregnancies. These negative factors are reinforced by stereotyping in textbooks. It notes that education is a key to the advancement of women and that the low level of education of women and girls remains one of the most serious impediments to their full enjoyment of human rights.

247. The Committee urges the State party to strengthen its efforts to improve the literacy level of girls and women in rural and urban areas, to ensure equal access of girls and young women to all levels of education and to prevent girls dropping out of school. It encourages the State party to introduce further special measures in the area of education, including incentives for parents to send girls to school and to encourage the recruitment of more qualified women teachers.

- Uganda, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) 164 at para. 128.

128. The Committee commends the State party for formulating and implementing the Universal Primary Education Programme, which facilitated the enrolment of 3.3 million girls in school by 2001. It also welcomes the application of temporary special measures in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention to increase the population of women students in tertiary education and the Functional Adult Literary Programme, which has particularly benefited women.

- Guatemala, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) 171 at paras. 202 and 203.

202. The Committee notes with concern the high incidence of child labour in Guatemala, in particular among girls, and its implications for their personal development and enjoyment of the right to education and health care.

203. The Committee urges the State party to take steps to ensure that all children, especially girls, have access to basic education, health care and the protection of minimum labour standards elaborated by the International Labour Organization.

- Barbados, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) 177 at para. 222.

222. The Committee commends the State party for providing free education, cash grants,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

school uniforms and grant assistance for textbooks for those in need in order to facilitate school attendance and to ensure that children, in particular girl children, up to the age of 16 years receive an education. It notes with satisfaction the female literacy rate of approximately 97 per cent.

- Greece, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) 184 at paras. 293-296.

293. The Committee expresses concern at the discrimination against minority women living in Greece, particularly Roma women, including with respect to access to education, who suffer from double discrimination based on both their sex and ethnic background, in society at large and within their communities.

294. The Committee urges the Government to take effective measures to eliminate discrimination against minority women... It also urges the State party to address the forms of discrimination including with regard to access to education, by minority women through its legal, administrative and welfare systems.

295. The Committee is concerned about the marginalization of Muslim women with regard to education [and] employment...

296. The Committee urges the State party to accelerate its efforts aimed at improving Muslim women's education and employment opportunities...

- Argentina, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) 196 at paras. 362 and 363.

362. The Committee is concerned at the fact that the crisis has affected access by women, particularly girls, to public education because they lack the resources needed either to begin or continue their studies.

363. The Committee recommends that the State party should make every possible effort to guarantee access by girls to education under conditions equal to those of boys, with special attention to girls from the most vulnerable sectors.

- Yemen, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) 200 at paras. 386, 387, 394 and 491.

386. While acknowledging the statement made by the State party that education is a cornerstone for development and a key element in the improvement of the status of women and the achievement of equality between women and men, the Committee notes with concern the high levels of illiteracy among women and girls, particularly in rural areas, and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

the high rate at which girls drop out of school.

387. The Committee calls upon the State party to strengthen its efforts to eradicate female illiteracy, especially among girls, particularly in rural areas, and to take general as well as temporary special measures to ensure primary and secondary education for girls and lower the high dropout rate among girls. The Committee recommends the introduction of measures to create an environment that increases the enrolment and retention rates of girls in schools at all levels through increased training and employment of women teachers, addressing parents' concerns related to co-education and the setting of precise targets and timetables to measure progress.

...

394. The Committee is concerned about the high rate of early marriages, which creates a serious health risk for girls and prevents them from completing their education.

395. ...The Committee urges the State party to develop awareness campaigns on the negative implications of early marriage on the health and education of girls.

### *See also:*

- Peru, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) at paras 488 and 489.

- Peru, CEDAW, A/57/38 part III (2002) 212 at paras. 490 and 491.

490. Despite the reduction in the general illiteracy rate, the Committee expresses its concern at the high rate of illiteracy in the female population, especially in rural areas. Another matter of concern to the Committee is the high number of school dropouts among girls and adolescents in rural areas.

491. The Committee requests the State party to set up programmes specially designed to reduce female illiteracy, in particular among women and girls in rural areas, and to keep girls in school.

- Albania, CEDAW, A/58/38 part I (2003) 13 at paras. 76 and 77.

76. The Committee is concerned about the situation of rural women, as the majority of the female population, who are discriminated against in practice with respect to owning and inheriting property, and who are disadvantaged by poverty, poor infrastructures, lack of credit, and limited access to education, health-care services and social insurance. Noting the decrease in the school dropout rate of girls, the Committee remains concerned about this continuing problem...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

77. The Committee urges the State party to give full attention to the needs of rural women and to develop comprehensive policies and programmes aimed at their economic empowerment, ensuring their access to productive resources, capital and credit, as well as education, health-care services, social insurance and decision-making...

### *See also:*

- Congo, CEDAW, A/58/38 part I (2003) 29 at paras. 178 and 179.
- Congo, CEDAW, A/58/38 part I (2003) 29 at paras. 170 and 171.

170. The Committee is concerned at the low rate of female literacy, the low number of girls who complete primary education in both the urban and rural areas, and the high drop-out rate of girls due to, *inter alia*, pregnancies and early marriage.

171. The Committee urges the State party to strengthen its efforts to improve the literacy level of girls and women to ensure equal access of girls and women to all levels of education and to take all appropriate measures to prevent girls from dropping out of school. The Committee further urges the State party to encourage an increase in the enrolment of girls at all levels and recommends that such efforts include further use of temporary special measures, in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention.

- El Salvador, CEDAW, A/58/38 part I (2003) 41 at paras. 263 and 264.

263. Although the overall illiteracy rate has declined, the Committee is concerned that the problem persists, especially in rural areas. It is also concerned at the high drop-out rates among girls, especially in rural and indigenous areas.

264. The Committee recommends that efforts to address this problem should be intensified, through sustainable plans and programmes, particularly in rural and indigenous areas.

### *See also:*

- Ecuador, CEDAW, A/58/38 part II (2003) 122 at paras. 319 and 320.
- Canada, CEDAW, A/58/38 part I (2003) 53 at paras. 344, 361 and 362.

344. The Committee, through the State party, commends the province of Quebec for having made available full-time kindergarten to all children in the province since 1997 and for making early childhood services available at a nominal cost in general and free of charge for parents on social assistance.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

...

361. While appreciating the federal Government's efforts to combat discrimination against aboriginal women, including the pending amendment to the Canadian Human Rights Act, and to achieve substantive equality for them, the Committee is seriously concerned about the persistent systematic discrimination faced by aboriginal women in all aspects of their lives. The Committee is concerned that aboriginal women, among other highly vulnerable groups of women in Canada, are over-concentrated in lower-skill and lower-paying occupations, they constitute a high percentage of those women who have not completed secondary education...

362. The Committee urges the State party to accelerate its efforts to eliminate *de jure* and *de facto* discrimination against aboriginal women both in society at large and in their communities, particularly with respect to the remaining discriminatory legal provisions and the equal enjoyment of their human rights to education, employment and physical and psychological well-being. It urges the State party to take effective and proactive measures, including awareness-raising programmes, to sensitize aboriginal communities about women's human rights and to combat patriarchal attitudes, practices and stereotyping of roles...

- Brazil, CEDAW, A/58/38 part II (2003) 93 at paras. 110, 111, 122 and 123.

110. The Committee is concerned about the impact of poverty on Brazilian women of African descent, indigenous women, female heads of household and other socially excluded or marginalized groups of women and about their disadvantaged position with respect to access to education, health, basic sanitation, employment, information and justice.

111. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that its poverty eradication measures give priority attention to Brazilian women of African descent, indigenous women, female heads of household and other socially excluded or marginalized groups of women through adequately funded programmes and policies addressing their specific needs.

...

122. Although women's access to education has improved, the Committee is concerned at the high rate of illiteracy and the low percentage of women having education beyond primary school. It is further concerned at the persistence of gender segregation in educational fields and its consequences for professional opportunities. The Committee is also concerned that, even though teaching is a preponderantly female profession, women are under-represented in higher education.

123. The Committee recommends that pro-active measures for women's access to all levels of education and teaching be strengthened, particularly for marginalized groups of women, and that diversification of educational and professional choices be actively encouraged for

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

women and men.

- Morocco, CEDAW, A/58/38 part II (2003) 101 at paras. 170, 171, 176 and 177.

170. While noting the efforts made by the State party to set concrete targets and develop a national strategy on education, the Committee notes with concern the continuing high levels of illiteracy of women and girls, in particular in rural areas.

171. The Committee calls upon the State party to develop gender-sensitive measures to eradicate female illiteracy, in particular in rural areas, and to strengthen measures to create an environment that increases the enrolment and retention rates of girls in schools at all levels, through increased training and employment of teachers, the development of gender-sensitive educational materials and the monitoring and evaluation of progress achieved towards time-bound targets.

...

176. The Committee notes that, although they constitute a large proportion of the population, rural women and girls continue to be marginalized in their access to government services.

177. The Committee urges the State party to take special measures to ensure that the needs and concerns of rural women are fully integrated in the formulation and implementation of all sectoral policies and programmes and to ensure that rural women and girls have full access to education and health-care facilities.

- New Zealand, CEDAW, A/58/38 part II (2003) 138 at paras. 409 and 410.

409. The Committee is concerned about difficulties women are facing at the university level, as reflected in the fact that men are more likely than women to complete postgraduate programmes, and in the decline in the number of women among university teachers in higher posts. The Committee is also concerned about the potential unfavourable impact on women of the existing Student Loan Scheme.

410. The Committee recommends that the State party promote the adoption of policies within universities aimed at creating a more favourable climate for women in order to achieve equality. The Committee also recommends that the State party review the Student Loan Scheme so that it does not result in additional difficulties for women.

- Bhutan, CEDAW, A/59/38 part I (2004) 21 at paras. 113, 114, 117 and 118.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

113. While welcoming the significant progress achieved in the increase in the enrolment rate in primary education, where girls now constitute 45 per cent of the enrolled students, the Committee is concerned about the low participation of girls and women in secondary and tertiary education, including in technology- and science-related courses.

114. The Committee encourages the State party to continue its efforts to close the gender gap in primary education and to take all necessary measures to increase the number of women in secondary and tertiary education in the country, including in technology- and science-related courses, in order to ensure that girls and women are accorded an equal opportunity to study, develop and benefit from science and technology. It also urges the State party to ensure that women have equal access with men to governmental loans and scholarships for pursuing higher education abroad.

...

117. Noting that the overwhelming majority of women live in rural areas, the Committee is concerned about their situation, in particular with regard to their access to education and vocational training. It is particularly concerned about the continuing high rates of illiteracy among rural women...

118. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that the rights, needs and concerns of rural women are given greater attention and visibility, and that rural women participate fully in the formulation and implementation of all sectoral policies and programmes. It also recommends that the State party ensure that rural women and girls have full access to education and vocational training in the areas where they live.

- Nepal, CEDAW, A/59/38 part I (2004) 34 at paras. 204 and 205.

204. While recognizing that education is a national priority of the State party and that substantial progress has been made, including a decline in the overall illiteracy rate, the Committee is concerned about the continuing significant gap between the literacy rates of women and men. It is concerned about the low female enrolment in primary and secondary schools, high dropout rates and the very limited access for women to tertiary education. The Committee is also concerned that educational opportunities are fewer for women in rural areas and for women of different castes and ethnic groups.

205. The Committee urges the State party to intensify its efforts to address the literacy gap between men and women so that the goals established in the National Plan on Education in regard to equality in education can be achieved, particularly in rural areas and among disadvantaged castes and ethnic groups. The Committee also recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to ensure equal access of girls and women to all levels of education and to take all appropriate measures to prevent girls from dropping out of school. The Committee calls on the State party to allocate more financial and human resources to

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

the education sector, to recruit more women teachers and to ensure that school textbooks do not carry stereotyped images of women.

- Ethiopia, CEDAW, A/59/38 part I (2004) 42 at para. 240.

240. The Committee commends the State party for the temporary special measures introduced in the civil service and in education, in particular the allocation of at least 30 per cent of the total number of university seats to female students. It also commends the State party for the introduction of the girl's scholarship programme, covering 28 schools in 7 regions, and the incorporation of gender mainstreaming in the school curriculum.

- Nigeria, CEDAW, A/59/38 part I (2004) 49 at paras. 303 and 304.

303. The Committee expresses concern at the low enrolment rates and educational achievement of girls and women, the continuing high rates of illiteracy of women and girls, in particular in rural areas, and the decline in the quality of education.

304. The Committee urges the State party to ensure full implementation of its Universal Basic Education Policy, launched in 1999, and the educational objectives contained in the National Policy on Women, including with the support of the international community. It calls on the State party to further prioritize action in the field of girls' and women's education and to raise awareness about the importance of education as a fundamental human right and the basis for the empowerment of women. It urges that targeted measures with a concrete time frame be taken, in accordance with general recommendation 25, to increase the literacy level of girls and women, in particular in rural areas, to ensure equal access of girls and young women to all levels of education, to prevent girls from dropping out of school, in particular because of early pregnancy, and to overcome traditional attitudes that constitute obstacles to girls' education. It also encourages the State party to ensure the accessibility of schools to all children, particularly girls, to create further incentives for parents to send girls to school and to step up the recruitment of qualified women teachers at all levels of education.

- Angola, CEDAW, A/59/38 part II (2004) 118 at paras. 158, 159, 164 and 165.

158. The Committee is concerned at the poor educational infrastructure, as reflected in the very low budgetary allocation; the lack of, or insufficient number of, schools and teachers; and the poor quality of education. The Committee is concerned that these shortcomings result in a high rate of illiteracy among girls and women, their low enrolment rates in primary, secondary, vocational and higher education, in both urban and rural areas, and in



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

their high drop out rates. The Committee notes that education is a key to the advancement of women and that the low level of education of women and girls remains one of the most serious impediments to their full enjoyment of human rights and the achievement of women's empowerment.

159. The Committee urges the State party to increase its investment in education as a fundamental human right and as a basis for the empowerment of women. It recommends that the State party continue and further prioritize efforts to: improve the literacy level of girls and women; ensure equal access of girls and women to all levels of education in both urban and rural areas; increase the enrolment rates for girls; and take measures to retain girls in school, including through temporary special measures in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and its general recommendation 25, so as to implement article 10 of the Convention.

...

164. Noting that the majority of women live in the rural areas, the Committee is concerned that many live in extreme poverty and lack access to education and vocational training, health care and income-generation opportunities. It is particularly concerned that the State party's rural development strategy does not seem to include attention to the situation of rural women.

165. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that the rights, needs and concerns of rural women are given greater attention and visibility in the country's rural rehabilitation and development strategy. It also calls on the State party to ensure that rural women can participate fully in decision-making in the formulation and implementation of policies and programmes in rural areas. It urges the State party to ensure that rural women and girls have full access to health-care services, education and vocational training, as well as to income-generation opportunities.

- Equatorial Guinea, CEDAW, A/59/38 part II (2004) 126 at paras. 189, 190, 193 and 194.

189. ...The Committee is especially concerned about the situation of rural women, particularly in view of their extreme poverty and lack of access to health care, education, credit facilities and community services.

190. The Committee...urges the State party to pay special attention to the needs of rural women, ensuring that they participate in decision-making processes and have full access to education, health services and credit facilities...

...

193. The Committee is concerned at the low rate of female literacy, the low rate of enrolment of girls in schools and the high dropout rate of girls due to pregnancy, early marriages and the low priority given to girls' education by families. The Committee notes

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

that education is a key to the advancement of women and that the low level of education of women and girls remains one of the most serious impediments to their full enjoyment of human rights.

194. The Committee urges the State party to raise awareness of the importance of education as a fundamental human right and as a basis for the empowerment of women and to take steps to overcome traditional attitudes that constitute obstacles to girls' education. It also recommends that the State party prioritize efforts to improve the literacy level of girls and women, ensure equal access of girls and young women to all levels of education, retain girls in school and strengthen the implementation of re-entry policies providing for girls to return to school after pregnancy. The Committee further urges the State party to take measures to increase the enrolment of girls at all levels and recommends the introduction of further special measures, including incentives for parents to send girls to schools.

- Bangladesh, CEDAW, A/59/38 part II (2004) 134 at para. 233.

233. The Committee commends the State party for the achievement of gender parity in school enrolment at the primary and secondary levels, and has succeeded in decreasing girls' dropout rates. The Committee also appreciates the successful efforts to increase girls' and women's literacy rates.

- Spain, CEDAW, A/59/38 part II (2004) 149 at paras. 346 and 347.

346. Despite the progress made by women in education in recent years, the Committee remains concerned about discrimination in this area, in particular about early drop out rates from school of Roma girls.

347. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to promote the access of Roma girls to education and their retention in the system. It recommends that the State party conduct research into the subject and, on the basis of its findings, provide incentives to Roma parents to encourage them to ensure that their daughters attend school.

- Argentina, CEDAW, A/59/38 part II (2004) 155 at paras. 367, 376 and 377.

367. The Committee congratulates the State party on the social policies and programmes put in place, particularly in the areas of poverty reduction, job creation and access to education, aimed at repairing the damage done to the social fabric by the serious economic, financial, political and social crisis experienced by the country since 2001.

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

376. The Committee is concerned about the situation of rural women, particularly in view of their extreme poverty and lack of access to health care, education, credit facilities and community services.

377. The Committee urges the State party to pay special attention to the needs of rural women, ensuring that they participate in decision-making processes and have full access to education, health services and credit facilities.

- Samoa, CEDAW, A/60/38 part I (2005) 9 at para. 43.

43. The Committee commends the State party on making primary education compulsory and on the progress made in implementing article 10 of the Convention in regard to the education of girls and women at all levels. The Committee also commends the State party for the very high rate of female literacy.

- Lao People's Democratic Republic, CEDAW, A/60/38 part I (2005) 16 at paras. 94 and 95.

94. Despite some progress, the Committee is alarmed at the still very high illiteracy rate of women, 40 per cent, and the large discrepancy between male and female literacy rates and between urban and rural women's education. The Committee is especially concerned at the extremely low literacy rate among ethnic minority women. The Committee is concerned that the initial plan to make primary education compulsory was postponed from 2000 to 2010.

95. The Committee urges that the State party immediately take all appropriate measures, including temporary special measures in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general recommendation 25 on temporary special measures, to reduce the illiteracy rate of women and to provide education, both formal and informal, to women, including ethnic minority women, especially in rural areas. The Committee also recommends that free and compulsory primary education at the national level be implemented as soon as possible. It further recommends that the State party consider seeking international assistance for these purposes.

- Gabon, CEDAW, A/60/38 part I (2005) 37 at paras. 241, 242, 247 and 248.

241. The Committee expresses concern that, although education is compulsory for all children aged 6 to 16 under Act No. 16/66 of 10 August 1966, the attendance rates for girls drop precipitously at higher levels of education, with 39.94 per cent in junior high school

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

and 7.20 per cent in upper high school. The Committee is also concerned that the attendance rates for girls drop to 2.63 per cent in higher education.

242. The Committee urges the State party to raise awareness of the importance of education as a fundamental human right and as a basis for the empowerment of women. It recommends that the State party prioritize efforts to ensure equal access of girls and young women to all levels of education and to increase their rates of enrolment and retention, including through the use of temporary special measures in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general recommendation 25 on temporary special measures, by giving incentives to parents and scholarships to girl students. The Committee encourages the State party to use its educational and training systems systematically for enhancing knowledge about the Convention and women's right to equality and non-discrimination.

247. The Committee is concerned about the situation of rural women, particularly in view of their geographic isolation and lack of access to adequate nutrition and sanitation, health care, education and income-generating opportunities. This situation leads to multiple forms of discrimination against rural women...

248. The Committee urges the State party to implement, on a priority basis, measures to ensure that rural women have full access to adequate nutrition and sanitation, health-care services, education and income-generating opportunities. The Committee invites the State party, as necessary, to seek assistance from relevant specialized agencies of the United Nations to improve the standard of living of rural women.

- Paraguay, CEDAW, A/60/38 part I (2005) 44 at paras. 291 and 292.

291. The Committee is concerned about the poor conditions of indigenous women, including monolingual Guaraní women, reflected in their high illiteracy rates, which surpass the national average, low school enrolment rates, poor access to health care and significant levels of poverty, which lead them to migrate to urban centres where they are even more vulnerable to multiple forms of discrimination.

292. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that all policies and programmes explicitly address the high illiteracy rates and the needs of indigenous women, including monolingual Guaraní women, and to actively seek their participation in the formulation and implementation of sectoral policies and programmes. It recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to implement bilingual educational programmes at all levels of education and to ensure indigenous women's access to education and health care. The Committee also encourages the State party to adopt temporary special measures in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

recommendation 25 on temporary special measures, to accelerate such access for indigenous women...

- Turkey, CEDAW, A/60/38 part I (2005) 58 at paras. 367, 368, 371 and 372.

367. The Committee is strongly concerned about the pervasiveness of patriarchal attitudes and deep-rooted traditional and cultural stereotypes regarding the roles and responsibilities of women and men in society, which continue to cast women in a position of inferiority. It expresses its concern that these attitudes contribute to the perpetuation of violence against women, including in the form of “honour killings”, and negatively affect women’s enjoyment of their rights in many areas; they also impede the full implementation of the Convention, including in regard to education, employment, health and participation in decision-making...

368. The Committee calls upon the State party to accelerate its efforts to eliminate stereotypical attitudes about the roles and responsibilities of women and men, in conformity with articles 2 (f) and 5 (a) of the Convention, including through awareness-raising and educational campaigns directed at both women and men, to foster a better understanding of and support for equality between women and men at all levels of society. The Committee calls on the State party to monitor carefully the impact of such measures. It recommends that the media be further encouraged to project a positive image of women and of the equal status and responsibilities of women and men in the private and public spheres. The Committee also calls upon the State party to introduce without delay additional measures, in collaboration with civil society organizations, women’s groups and community leaders, as well as teachers and the media, to eliminate traditional and cultural practices that discriminate against women in marriage and family relations, taking into account the Committee’s general recommendation 21, on equality in marriage and family relations.

...

371. The Committee is concerned at the high rate of female illiteracy and the lower enrolment and completion rates of girls and women at all levels of education, and that these discrepancies are further aggravated by urban-rural, regional and ethnic differences. The Committee is further concerned that girls and women continue to predominate in traditionally female areas of education and are particularly underrepresented in technical and vocational schools. The Committee is concerned about the disadvantages that result from these educational choices for women’s professional and employment opportunities. It is also concerned that women and girls whose mother tongue is not Turkish may face multiple forms of discrimination in access to and achievement in education. The Committee is also concerned about the impact on girls and women of the ban on wearing headscarves in schools and universities. The Committee is further concerned that stereotypical attitudes continue to create disadvantages for girls in education.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

372. The Committee recommends that the State party take proactive measures to decrease the high rate of female illiteracy and to strengthen girls' and women's access to all levels of education and teaching and to actively encourage diversification of educational and professional choices for women and men. The Committee recommends that such measures include the use of temporary special measures, in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general recommendation 25. The Committee calls on the State party to implement further targeted policies and programmes to overcome educational disadvantages faced by girls and women belonging to diverse ethnic groups and those whose mother tongue is not Turkish, particularly in rural areas, as well as to address regional disparities. The Committee requests the State party to monitor and assess the impact of the ban on wearing headscarves and to compile information on the number of women who have been excluded from schools and universities because of the ban. It also calls on the State party to undertake further awareness-raising on the importance of education for women's equality and economic opportunities, and to overcome stereotypical attitudes.

- Benin, CEDAW, A/60/38 part II (2005) 116 at paras. 155 and 156.

155. The Committee is concerned at the poor educational infrastructure and the insufficient number of schools and teachers, which constitute particular obstacles to the education of girls and young women. The Committee expresses its concern about the low rate of enrolment of girls in schools, preference for the education of boys and the high dropout rate of girls due to pregnancy and early and forced marriage. The Committee is especially concerned about the extremely high rate of illiteracy among women and girls, 81 per cent for women and girls between the ages of 15 and 49.

156. The Committee urges the State party to increase its investment in education, including through international donor assistance, and to raise awareness of the importance of education as a human right and as a basis for the empowerment of women. It also encourages the State party to take steps to overcome traditional attitudes that constitute obstacles to girls' education. It recommends that the State party take steps to ensure equal access of girls and young women to all levels of education, to retain girls in school and to strengthen the implementation of re-entry policies providing for girls to return to school after pregnancy. The Committee recommends that the State party make every effort to improve the literacy level of girls and women through the adoption of comprehensive programmes, in collaboration with civil society, at the formal and non-formal levels and through adult education and training. The Committee encourages the State party to take temporary special measures, in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general recommendation 25, to accelerate the improvement of women's and girls'

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

educational situation.

- Gambia, CEDAW, A/60/38 part II (2005) 122 at paras. 207, 208, 211 and 212.

207. While noting the efforts made by the State party to revise its policy on education in order to address the needs of the girl child, the Committee expresses its concern about the low enrolment of girls in school, especially at the secondary and higher levels, and their high dropout rates. The Committee is particularly concerned that, according to the 1993 census, only 27 per cent of women in the Gambia are literate and that in the rural areas the proportion is only 18.3 per cent.

208. The Committee urges the State party to take measures on the importance of realizing women's and girls' right to education as a fundamental human right, including for the empowerment of women. It also calls upon the State party to strengthen measures to create an environment that increases the enrolment and retention rates of girls in school at all levels, including through the development of gender-sensitive educational material. The Committee calls upon the State party to step up its efforts to eradicate female illiteracy, particularly in rural areas, including through comprehensive education programmes at the formal and non-formal levels, as well as programmes specifically targeting adult women. The Committee encourages the State party to use temporary special measures, in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general recommendation 25, in order to accelerate the improvement of women's and girls' education.

...

211. The Committee is concerned about the situation of rural women, many of whom live in extreme poverty and lack access to health care, education, vocational training, credit facilities and income-generation opportunities. It is particularly concerned that the State has not yet designed a gender-sensitive rural development strategy.

212. The Committee urges the State party to design and implement a gender-sensitive rural development strategy. It calls upon the State party to ensure that rural women can participate fully in the formulation and implementation of policies and programmes in rural areas. It urges the State party to ensure that rural women and girls have full access to health-care services, education and vocational training, as well as credit facilities and income-generating opportunities.

- Israel, CEDAW, A/60/38 part II (2005) 129 at paras. 255 and 256.

255. While appreciating the progress made in the fields of women's education and health, the Committee is concerned that Israeli Arab women remain in a vulnerable and marginalized situation, especially in regard to education and health...

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

256. The Committee recommends that the State party take urgent measures to reduce the drop-out rates of Israeli Arab girls and increase the number of Israeli Arab women at institutions of higher education, including temporary special measures in accordance with article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general recommendation 25...

- Burkina Faso, CEDAW, A/60/38 part II (2005) 144 at paras. 347 and 348.

347. The Committee is concerned about the situation of rural women, particularly in view of their extreme poverty and lack of access to adequate nutrition and sanitation, health care, education and income-generating opportunities. This situation leads to multiple forms of discrimination against rural women...

348. The Committee urges the State party to pay special attention to the situation of rural women so as to enhance compliance with article 14 of the Convention. In particular, the Committee calls upon the State party to ensure that rural women have full access to education, health services and credit facilities, and can fully participate in decision-making processes...

- Ireland, CEDAW, A/60/38 part II (2005) 151 at paras. 392 and 393.

392. While recognizing that the second National Action Plan against Poverty and Social Exclusion and the National Anti-Poverty Strategy provide for an integrated focus on addressing the needs of specific groups, including women, the Committee is concerned at the situation of vulnerable groups of women who are considered to be at high risk of consistent poverty and social exclusion, including rural women, older women, Traveller women, women who are single parents and women with disabilities. The Committee is particularly concerned at the barriers faced by those vulnerable groups in relation to access to education, employment, health care and other social services.

393. The Committee recommends that the State party closely monitor the situation of poverty and social exclusion of women in the most vulnerable groups and implement effective measures and training programmes that will allow them fully to enjoy the benefits of the State party's prosperity. The Committee also recommends that a gender impact analysis of all social and economic policies and anti-poverty measures be conducted regularly...

### **CAT**

- Republic of Moldova, CAT, A/58/44 (2003) 53 at paras. 138 and 139.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

138. The Committee expresses concern about:

...

(1) The poor material conditions prevailing in police detention facilities and prisons and the lack of independent inspections of such places. The Committee expresses particular concern at reports alleging that juveniles are in some cases held together with adults where they lack education and meaningful activities;

...

139. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(1) Improve the conditions of detention in police stations and prisons so as to bring them into conformity with article 16 of the Convention, and establish an independent and systematic system to monitor the treatment in practice of persons arrested, detained or imprisoned;

...

### CRC

- Mauritania, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 8 at paras. 72 and 73.

72. While noting the increase in the number of schools and classrooms, the Committee is nevertheless concerned that only approximately 60 per cent of children attend school and that there are great gender and regional disparities. It further notes with concern the high drop-out and repeating rates; the inadequacy of the school curriculum; the high teacher-pupil ratio, especially in the capital, Nouakchott; the low enrolment rate in secondary schools; the inadequate school infrastructure; and the low number of children receiving pre-school education. Furthermore, the Committee expresses its concern at the lack of play space and recreational facilities for children, especially in rural areas.

73. In light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Enforce the act that makes basic education compulsory for all children between the ages of 6 and 14;

(b) Undertake appropriate measures to ensure regular attendance at schools and the reduction of drop-out rates, in particular among girls;

(c) Continue its efforts to expand pre-school education;

(d) Take further steps to ensure the enrolment of children in secondary school;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(e) Improve the quality of education;

(f) Orient education towards the aims mentioned in article 29 (1) of the Convention and the Committee's general comment on the aims of education, in particular by introducing human rights, including children's rights, education in the curriculum at all levels of education, including teacher training; and

(g) In light of article 31 of the Convention, seek to ensure the right of the child to rest and leisure and to engage in play and recreational activities, *inter alia* by educating parents on the importance of these activities for the development of the child and by developing appropriate facilities, in particular in rural areas.

- Kenya, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 21 at paras. 130, 131, 134 and 135.

130. ...Concern is...expressed at the limited number of teachers trained to work with children with disabilities, as well as at the insufficient efforts made to facilitate the inclusion of such children in the educational system and generally in society. The Committee also notes with concern the inadequate resources allocated to special education programmes for children with disabilities.

131. In the light of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96) and the recommendations adopted by the Committee at its day of general discussion on the rights of children with disabilities (CRC/C/69, para. 338), it is recommended that the State party:

...

(d) Establish special education programmes for them and where feasible, include them in the regular school system;

...

(f) Increase the resources (financial and human) allocated to special education and enhance the support given to the families of children with disabilities;

(g) Seek technical cooperation for the training of professional staff, including teachers, working with and for children with disabilities, from, *inter alia*, WHO.

...

134. While the Committee notes that the Education Act is currently under review, it is concerned that the law does not fully guarantee the right to education. The Committee expresses concern about the non-increase (in percentage) of the budget for education and about the introduction of cost-sharing in education which further limits access to education, especially for girls, children from economically disadvantaged families and those living in

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

remote rural communities. Concern is also expressed regarding low enrolment and high drop-out and repetition rates; insufficient numbers of trained teachers; insufficient schools and classrooms; and the lack of relevant learning material. In the light of article 29.1 of the Convention, the Committee is also concerned about the quality of education in the State party. The Committee notes with regret the reported incidents of sexual abuse and exploitation of children in the school environment.

135. The Committee urges the State party to take legal and other measures to guarantee the right to education for all children in its territory, in particular free and compulsory primary education. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures, including the allocation and distribution of adequate financial, human and technical resources, to enhance the quality of education, to decrease the repetition and drop-out rates, and to ensure that all children enjoy the right to education. It is further recommended that the State party reinforce its efforts to increase access to education by, *inter alia*, abolishing cost-sharing in primary education and rationalizing it in secondary and tertiary education. The State party should pay particular attention to the quality of education, in the light of article 29.1 and the Committee's General Comment on the aims of education. The Committee strongly encourages the State party to take effective measures to protect children, especially girls, against sexual abuse and violence in the school environment and to facilitate care and the rehabilitation of child victims in this regard. It is recommended that the State party seek to strengthen its educational system through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Oman, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 36 at paras. 191 and 192.

191. Noting significant improvements in education indicators, the Committee is concerned: that primary education is not compulsory; at levels of drop-out and repetition at primary, preparatory and secondary education levels, especially among boys; and at the quality of teaching as a result of rapid Omanization in this sector.

192. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Ensure that primary education is made compulsory by law;
- (b) Make greater efforts to address drop-out and repetition rates; and
- (c) Allocate the required resources to address the quality of teacher training.

- Portugal, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 48 at paras. 246 and 247.

246. The Committee notes the significant progress made in increasing the number of

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

children completing secondary education and the implementation of the Programme of Extension and Development of Pre-Primary Education and the "social school action programme". The Committee remains concerned at:

- (a) The low levels of investment in education, including pre-school education;
- (b) The low enrolment in pre-school education.
- (c) The relatively high drop-out and repetition rates in primary and secondary schools, with only 32 per cent of children completing primary school without having repeated a class and a drop-out rate of 22.9 per cent at the ninth grade level;
- (d) The limited use of information technology in schools;
- (e) The relatively low numbers of children going on to tertiary education from secondary school, with a sharp disparity between males (42 per cent) and females (57 per cent).

247. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Increase its investment in education;
- (b) Study the causes of high drop-out and repetition rates;
- (c) Introduce policies to address the causes of low enrolment in pre-school education;
- (d) Continue its efforts to increase the number of children completing secondary education;
- (e) Take steps to reduce drop-out rates and to implement its planned reform of secondary education;
- (f) Increase the use of information technology in schools;
- (g) Take steps to raise the number of persons going on to higher education, giving due attention to reducing gender disparities;
- (h) Continue and strengthen efforts to ensure that all teachers benefit from professional training;
- (i) Provide particular support to low-income families with a view to increasing the enrolment levels of their children in educational facilities;
- (j) Strengthen efforts towards the implementation of the human rights plan of action,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

including children's right to education, in the light of the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education.

- Qatar, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 59 at paras. 295 and 296.

295. The Committee is concerned at the disparities in the enjoyment of economic and social rights, particularly the rights to health and education, experienced by children living in rural areas and non-national children.

296. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take all necessary measures to ensure that all children within its jurisdiction enjoy all the rights set out in the Convention without discrimination, in accordance with article 2;

(b) Continue to prioritize and target resources and social services for children belonging to the most vulnerable groups;...

...

- Cameroon, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 71 at paras. 348, 349, 379 and 380.

348. ...The Committee is...concerned that the minimum and upper age limits have not been set for compulsory education...

349. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Set a minimum and upper age limit for compulsory education;

...

379. While noting the adoption of the Act on Education Guidelines (Act No. 98/004) and the Finance Act 2000/08, the Committee remains deeply concerned that primary education is not yet entirely free to all in the State party. The Committee is also concerned at the low education levels among children in the State party, gender, rural/urban and regional disparities in school attendance, the limited access of children with disabilities to formal or vocational educational opportunities, the number of children who are several years behind in their primary education, the high drop-out rate from school, the large number of children per classroom and the decline in the number of primary-school teachers due to the freeze on their recruitment. The Committee is also concerned at the very high prevalence of violence against, and sexual abuse of children in schools.

380. The Committee recommends that the State party:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (a) Urgently implement the Finance Act 2000/08 to make primary education free to all and in addition provide financial assistance for the costs of transportation, when needed, uniforms and other school materials for poor families;
  - (b) Raise the level of educational achievement among children through, *inter alia*, effectively decreasing the drop-out rate, increasing the number of classrooms and teachers, providing initial and ongoing training of teachers and school inspectors, developing standard national textbooks and increasing the rates of enrolment;
  - (c) Ensure that children with disabilities have access to formal and vocational educational opportunities and that girls and boys, as well as children from urban, rural and least developed areas, and from marginalized groups of the population have equal access to educational opportunities;
  - (d) Pursue its efforts to include "education for peace and tolerance", children's rights and other human rights subjects in the curricula of primary and secondary schools;
  - (e) Address education to the aims mentioned in article 29.1 of the Convention and the Committee's General Comment on the aims of education;
  - (f) Monitor and enforce the ban of corporal punishment in schools and train teachers in regard to alternative measures of discipline;
  - (g) Take measures against teachers who are violent and abusive towards students;
  - (h) Establish child-sensitive structures for children to make complaints;
  - (i) Take measures to prevent bullying and sexual abuse of students by other students;
  - (j) Pursue efforts for special projects of education for children belonging to marginalized groups like the Pygmies;
  - (k) Encourage participation of children at all levels of school life;
  - (l) Seek assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO.
- Gambia, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 89 at paras. 428, 429, 452 and 453.

428. The Committee notes that the law provides for the registration of children at birth. However, it is concerned that many children, particularly those born at home and those living in rural communities, are not registered. The Committee is also concerned that

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

children do not easily obtain birth certificates, which are necessary for access to education.

429. In light of articles 7 and 8 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to raise awareness among government officers, midwives, community and religious leaders and parents themselves, in order to ensure that all children are registered at birth. The Committee also recommends facilitating the issuance of birth certificates, for example by combining birth registration with the automatic and issuance of a free birth certificate.

...

452. The Committee notes the efforts of the State party to improve the situation of education in the country, including the recent launching of the Third Education Sector Programme. Nevertheless, the Committee expresses concern that primary education is not free in practice, which further limits access to education, especially for girls, children from economically disadvantaged families and those living in remote rural communities. Concern is also expressed regarding low enrolment and high drop-out and repetition rates, insufficient numbers of trained teachers, an insufficient number of schools and classrooms, lack of relevant learning material, and geographical disparity in enrolment rates and access to education. The Committee is particularly concerned about the high rate of illiteracy within the State party, especially in relation to girls. In light of article 29 (1) of the Convention, the Committee is also concerned about the quality of education within the State party.

453. The Committee urges the State party to take legal and other measures to guarantee the right to education for all children within its territory. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures, including the allocation and distribution of adequate financial, human and technical resources, to make primary education free, train teachers, including female teachers effectively, enhance the quality of education and improve the literacy rate. It is further recommended that the State party reinforce its efforts to increase enrolment in schools by, *inter alia*, abolishing and/or rationalizing user fees at all levels of the educational system. The State party should pay particular attention to the quality of education, in light of article 29 (1) and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education. It is recommended that the State party seek to strengthen its educational system through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Paraguay, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 103 at paras. 512 and 513.

512. While noting with appreciation the National Education Law of 1998 and the high rate of primary school enrolment, which is more than 95 per cent, the Committee is nevertheless concerned about the continuing poor quality of education, the non-tuition costs of compulsory school, the high repetition and drop-out rates, and the poor condition of infrastructures. It further notes with concern that pregnant girls are not allowed to stay in school.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

513. In light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Undertake appropriate measures to increase budgetary allocations for education, in particular for the improvement of school infrastructure;
- (b) Ensure regular attendance at schools and the reduction of drop-out rates;
- (c) Take measures to prevent bullying and other forms of violence in schools;
- (d) Improve the quality of education in order to achieve the goals mentioned in article 29 (1), in line with the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education; and
- (e) Seek additional technical cooperation from, among others, UNESCO and UNICEF.

- Uzbekistan, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 117 at paras. 580 and 581.

580. The Committee is concerned at:

The low level of pre-school enrolment;

Declining enrolment and high drop-out, repetition and absenteeism rates in primary and secondary schools;

Disparities according to gender and region;

Deterioration in infrastructure;

Deterioration in the quality of education, especially of teaching and the curricula.

581. The Committee recommends that the State party, taking due account of the Committee's General Comment No. 1 on the aims of education:

- (a) Undertake greater efforts to allocate the required human and financial resources to, *inter alia*, improve infrastructure, expand the provision of learning materials and supplies and improve teachers' salaries;
- (b) Revise the school curricula to reflect a child-centred, active-learning approach;
- (c) Promote the importance of early childhood care and development programmes, especially



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

among low-income households, and stimulate informal community pre-school schemes in this regard;

(d) Promote the participation of parents and communities, especially ethnic minorities, in school governance, to improve enrolment rates and monitor the quality of education;

(e) Introduce human rights, including the Convention, into the school curricula, including at the primary school level;

(f) Seek assistance from, among others, UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Cape Verde, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 135 at paras. 619, 620, 648 and 649.

619. The Committee is concerned that the number of years of compulsory education under existing provisions is insufficient.

620. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Increase the number of years of compulsory education, including by extending the minimum age for leaving education;

(b) Take steps to close gaps between the minimum age for work and the end of compulsory education, so as to ensure that children do not end their education prematurely to begin work;

(c) Seek technical assistance from UNESCO and ILO, as appropriate, in this regard.

...

648. The Committee is concerned that the quality of education is low and, in particular, that there is a serious lack of resources and didactic material in schools, that the training of teachers remains insufficient and that the drop-out rate of children from secondary education is high. The Committee is concerned that access to pre-school education is very limited. While noting gender equality in admissions to primary education, the Committee is concerned that some adolescents are excluded from the system of compulsory education. The Committee is concerned, in addition, that not all children are fluent in both Creole and Portuguese and that these children risk being marginalized, given that school education is in Portuguese.

649. Noting efforts to increase enrolment levels, particularly to primary school, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Make urgent efforts to improve the quality of education throughout the education system,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

including through reference to the Committee's general comment No. 1 on article 29 of the Convention on the aims of education;

(b) Strengthen the training of teachers and the provision of resources, including didactic materials;

(c) Improve access to pre-school education for all children, giving particular attention to children from disadvantaged backgrounds;

(d) Make efforts to increase the number of children completing secondary education;

(e) Ensure full access for all children to compulsory education;

(f) Take steps to ensure that all children are fluent in Creole and Portuguese;

(g) Seek technical assistance from UNICEF in this regard.

- Lebanon, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 11 at paras. 50, 51, 77, 78, 83 and 84.

50. ...[W]hile noting the very positive steps taken to raise the minimum age for the completion of compulsory education (12 years) and the plans to raise the age further to 15 and to increase the minimum age of employment to the end of the thirteenth year, the Committee is concerned about the gap between the two ages.

51. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Pursue its plans to erase the gap between the school-leaving age and the minimum age for employment by increasing both to 15, in conformity with ILO Convention No. 138.

...

77. While noting with appreciation the number of initiatives undertaken, in particular the law making basic education free and compulsory until the age of 12 and the intention to raise it further to 15, the Committee is nevertheless concerned about the implementation of the law, including that public education is not entirely free. The Committee is furthermore concerned at the lack of public structures in early childhood education, regional disparities, the differences in cost and quality between State and private schools, which create inequality, the high drop-out rates after primary education, the low number of trained teachers, as well as reports of family preference for male over female children when fees are charged.

78. The Committee recommends that the State party:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(a) Take all appropriate measures, including the allocation of adequate financial, human and technical resources, to improve the situation and aims of education, taking into account general comment No. 1 on article 29 (1) of the Convention (aims of education), both with regard to quality as well as relevance, and to ensure that all children enjoy the right to education;

(b) Take the necessary steps to achieve its goal of making education free and compulsory until the age of 15;

(c) Seek to implement additional measures to promote early childhood education and encourage children to stay in school, and adopt effective measures to reduce illiteracy;

(d) Place stronger emphasis on public education, with a view to ensuring that all children subject to the jurisdiction of the State enjoy this fundamental right, and prevent any risk of discrimination, in accordance with the Committee's previous recommendation ([CRC/C/15/Add.54], para. 30) regarding the growing role of private educational institutions;

(e) Continue cooperation with UNESCO and UNICEF in improving and activating the education sector.

...

83. The Committee is concerned about the high rate of Palestinian children living below the poverty line, as well as the lack of adequate access by Palestinian children to many basic rights, including health, education and an adequate standard of living, and about the quality of services provided.

84. The Committee reiterates its recommendation ([CRC/C/15/Add.54], para. 40) that the State party, in cooperation with United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East, seek ways of addressing the socio-economic problems among Palestinian children that affect children negatively, including teaching about the Convention in the school and include children in development programmes.

- Greece, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 25 at paras. 150, 151, 158 and 159.

150. Taking into consideration the efforts that have been made in the past 10 years and the recent involvement of children with disabilities and their families in policy making, especially in relation to the Ministry of Education's special education department, and the progress made in modifying access to streets, buses, trains and some buildings for persons with disabilities, the Committee remains concerned that:

...

(c) There is a shortage of qualified personnel to provide health and educational support to

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

children with disabilities;

...

(f) Access facilities for persons, including children, with physical disabilities to public areas, buildings and transport remain poor and legislation in this regard is not sufficiently enforced.

151. Noting the State party's efforts in this regard, and in the light of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96) and the Committee's recommendations adopted at its day of general discussion on the rights of children with disabilities (CRC/C/69, para. 338), the Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(e) Recruit additional qualified personnel to provide, *inter alia*, health and educational support to children with disabilities;

...

(g) Continue efforts to establish adequate secondary schools for children with special needs, while also continuing to place emphasis on integrating children with disabilities into the ordinary education system where this would be in the best interests of the child, and ensure that all children with disabilities have access to secondary school education;

(h) Continue and strengthen efforts to ensure the easy access of children with disabilities to public areas, buildings and transport, including pavements, schools, hospitals, trains and buses;

(i) Strengthen the provision of training in daily living skills for children with cognitive disabilities.

158. Acknowledging the many activities of the State party towards improving access to education and the quality of education and introducing multicultural teaching, the Committee remains concerned about a variety of problems that still exist, such as:

(a) The closing of many rural schools, thereby limiting the access of children from rural communities to education;

(b) Reports of xenophobia among teachers and students;

(c) The high overall drop-out rate and the very high drop-out rates among rural and Roma children;

(d) Reports that compulsory education requirements are not systematically enforced;

(e) Difficulties in gaining access to education for some groups of children, including asylum-seeking and refugee children who experience difficulties in registering for school

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

and obtaining education certificates;

(f) The poor quality of education in many schools that teach in languages other than Greek, including the use of outdated textbooks and late term starting dates; the very high estimated illiteracy rates among Roma children; the low proportion of children from distinct ethnic, religious, linguistic or cultural groups who attend secondary school and that some children, particularly from these groups, are accepted in school only as auditors and not permitted to gain academic credit for their studies;

(g) The lack of sufficient space for schools, particularly in cities.

159. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Continue ongoing efforts to increase the proportion of the national budget spent on public education;

(b) Ensure the access to education for all children in the State party, including increasing the enrolment and reducing the drop-out rates, giving particular attention to children in rural communities, children from Roma and other distinct ethnic, religious, linguistic or cultural groups, and children from disadvantaged backgrounds, including through the use of information campaigns targeting parents and local authorities;

(c) Ensure that legislation with regard to compulsory education is enforced, including through provision of the appropriate resources for this purpose;

(d) Encourage and support increases in the numbers of children from distinct ethnic, religious, linguistic or cultural groups attending secondary school;

(e) Expand the practice of recruiting second teachers who speak languages other than Greek to cover all relevant schools and major languages;

(f) Ensure that schools have sufficient space to function effectively, including for gymnasium and sports facilities;

(g) Continue and strengthen existing programmes of training and information for all teachers on multicultural concerns, with a view to the effective integration into the State party's school system of children from all distinct ethnic, religious, linguistic or cultural groups and other backgrounds;

(h) Ensure that all children are able to gain full academic credit for their school attendance;

(i) Implement these recommendations in the light of the Committee's general comment No.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

1 on article 29 (1) of the Convention (aims of education).

- Gabon, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 47 at paras. 229, 230, 245 and 246.

229. While noting the adoption of the Act on the general organization of education (Act No. 16/96), the high enrolment rate in primary education, the priority given to education and the increasing of the budget allocated to education, the Committee remains deeply concerned at the remaining high illiteracy rate in the State party which affects more women than men, the low enrolment in early childhood education, the very high percentage of repeaters and drop-outs in primary education, the low quality of education, the high teacher-pupil ratio, the very low percentage of children that complete primary education and the important regional disparities.

230. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Take the necessary measures to identify the causes of the high rate of repetition and drop-out in primary schools and to provide remedies to this situation;
- (b) Establish bridges between formal and non-formal education;
- (c) Take necessary measures to remedy the low quality of education and the internal efficiency of the management of education;
- (d) Raise awareness about the importance of early childhood education and develop programmes to increase the enrolment at the pre-school level;
- (e) Extend resources to help children to go to secondary education;
- (f) Take measures to enable children with disabilities to have access to regular schools and to ensure that these children have access to formal and vocational educational opportunities;
- (g) Ensure that all girls and boys, wherever they live, including the least developed areas, have equal access to educational opportunities;
- (h) Orient education towards the aims mentioned in article 29 (1) of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education;
- (i) Implement the ban on corporal punishment in schools and train teachers in the use of alternative measures of discipline;
- (j) Encourage the participation of children at all levels of school life; and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(k) Seek assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO.

...

245. The Committee is deeply concerned about the poor situation of Pygmy children and their limited access to social services, including health care, immunization and education, and the violation of their rights to survival and development, to enjoy their own culture and to be protected from discrimination.

246. The Committee urges the State party to:

(a) Undertake a study to assess the situation and the needs of Pygmy children and to elaborate a plan of action involving leaders of the Pygmy community to protect the rights of those children and ensure their social services;

(b) Seek adequate means to ensure birth registration, health care, etc.

### *See also:*

- Burkina Faso, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 103 at paras. 477 and 478.
- Mozambique, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 65 at paras. 297, 298, 305, 306, 311 and 312.

297. While noting the State party's 1999 national policy on disabled persons, the Committee remains concerned that:

...

(c) Children with disabilities often have serious difficulty in obtaining transportation and in gaining access to public buildings, including to hospitals and schools;

(d) Children with disabilities have very limited access to formal education.

298. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Make every effort to assure the full integration of children with disabilities into everyday life as enjoyed by other children, including family life, education, leisure and professional training;

(c) Increase the numbers of schools and other institutions for children with disabilities who have special needs;

...

(e) Take steps to provide improved transportation facilities for persons with disabilities and in need of assistance, including through the provision of wheelchairs or other specialized equipment;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(f) Implement measures to improve the access of children with disabilities to public buildings, including through legislative and administrative measures;

(g) Ensure respect for the right of children with disabilities to receive a formal education;

...

305. While noting the State party's significant efforts in this domain, including the construction or renovation of many primary schools in the 1990s, the provision of free school materials to many children, increases in primary school enrolment rates, efforts to improve the access to education of girls and to train teachers, the fall in the repetition and drop-out rates, the Committee remains concerned that:

(a) The education system requires greater financial resources;

(b) Although gradually improving, basic literacy among children remains low;

(c) Insufficient efforts have been made to implement compulsory education requirements;

(d) Enrolment in formal education, at 81.3 per cent (as quoted by the State party for 1998 in its initial report), remains low and is particularly low in certain regions of the country, and that only a very small proportion of children enrol in, and complete, secondary education;

(e) Girls continue to have less access to education than boys above the primary school level; literacy levels among girls, particularly those over 15, are extremely low; less importance is placed by parents and communities on the education of girls than of boys; some practices, such as excessive domestic work required of girls, early marriage and early pregnancy, contribute to limiting girls' access to education; and only 20 per cent of students who enter higher (tertiary) education are girls;

(f) Education infrastructure and resources remain insufficient, including with regard to the limited quality, and insufficient number, of classrooms, overcrowding in schools, and the cost (for children and families) of books and other materials and school equipment;

(g) Many teachers have received no or insufficient formal training;

(h) The capacity of special education institutions is very limited;

(i) There is alleged corruption and sexual abuse and economic exploitation of pupils by professionals, including teachers, in the school system;

(j) There is very limited access to higher (tertiary) education.

306. Noting the State party's own recommendations in its initial report, the Committee



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

recommends that the State party:

- (a) Raise the education budget to the maximum of available resources, including through additional international cooperation;
- (b) Strengthen the institutional capacity and infrastructure of State education, including with regard to administration, management, educational planning, the training of teachers and other staff, the construction of additional schools in isolated regions, and the provision and quality of textbooks and other school materials and equipment;
- (c) Increase the rate of child enrolment in primary school and completion of compulsory education, *inter alia* by making every effort to ensure that compulsory education is free for all children, including with regard to textbooks, uniforms and transportation to school for disadvantaged children and families;
- (d) Take steps to increase significantly the numbers of children completing secondary education;
- (e) Make greater efforts to ensure that girls have the same opportunities as boys to attend formal education; take steps to ensure that the education of girls is seen, by parents, families and communities, as of equally important as that of boys and that education is seen as a right of all children; address traditional and other practices, such as excessive domestic work, which prevent girls from attending formal education; ensure that pregnancy does not lead to the banning of girls' attendance at school; consider recruiting and training more women teachers; make particular efforts to support girls seeking higher education; make every effort to implement its own policies; seek technical assistance from UNICEF in this regard;
- (f) Extend the pilot project to achieve implementation of human rights and democracy components within the school curriculum nationwide;
- (g) Increase the number, capacity and quality of special education institutions for children with special education needs;
- (h) Improve access to higher (tertiary) education, including vocational schools through, *inter alia*, the strengthening of secondary school education;
- (i) End practices of corruption and sexual abuse and economic exploitation of pupils in the education system;
- (j) Promote coordination between the public and private sectors to ensure a sustainable supply of textbooks, basic learning materials development and training activities;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(k) Continue to support the use of non-formal education structures, such as community schools, servicing children who are unable to return to their regular schools;

(l) Give particular attention to the Committee's general comment on article 29.1 of the Convention;

(m) Seek technical assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO in this regard.

...

311. The Committee joins the State party in expressing concern that:

...

(b) There are still a large number of adolescents and young people, in both urban and rural areas, affected by the conflict who lack appropriate education and/or employment opportunities.

312. Acknowledging the significant efforts made in this regard, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Continue to give attention to the needs of children affected by the war and end the reconscription of children;

(b) Give particular attention to providing education and/or employment opportunities for adolescents and young people, in both urban and rural areas.

- Chile, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 90 at paras. 369 and 370.

369. The Committee, while noting the increase in the school attendance rate, expresses its concern at the difficult access to education, high drop-out and repetition rates which affect in particular indigenous children, poor children and the ones living in rural areas; the low enrolment rate for pre-school education; the low rate of children reaching secondary education and the treatment of children with behavioural problems. It further notes with concern the important number of pregnant children who are excluded from school and that government measures to avoid this situation are not implemented, especially in private schools.

370. In light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Ensure regular attendance at school and the reduction of drop-out rates, especially with regard to indigenous children;

(b) Develop appropriate measures to deal with children with behavioural problems without

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

resorting to expulsion from school;

(c) Ensure that measures are effectively implemented in order for pregnant girls to continue attending school both during and after their pregnancy;

(d) Improve the quality of education in order to achieve the goals mentioned in article 29 (1), in line with the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education.

- Malawi, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 104 at paras. 434-437.

434. While noting that the Constitution provides for free primary education (sect. 13 (f)), that efforts have been made to increase the enrolment of girls in school (the GABLE project) and that the budget allocated to education has increased, the Committee remains concerned that primary education is free only for a few grades and that it is not compulsory. The Committee is also concerned at the gender and regional disparities in enrolment in schools, absenteeism, the high drop out and repeat rates, the low quality of education, the insufficient numbers of trained teachers, insufficient schools and classrooms, and the lack of relevant learning material. In light of article 29 (1) of the Convention, the Committee is also concerned about the quality of education within the State party. The Committee notes with concern the reported incidents of sexual abuse and exploitation of children within the school environment.

435. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Make primary education compulsory;

(b) Extend the period of free primary education;

(c) Progressively ensure that girls and boys, as well as children from urban, rural and least developed areas, have equal access to educational opportunities;

(d) Take the necessary measures to improve the quality of education and to improve internal efficiency in the management of education;

(e) Build better infrastructure for schools and provide appropriate training for teachers;

(f) Extend resources to help children to go to secondary education;

(g) Orient education towards the aims stated in article 29 (1) of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education and introduce human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(h) Raise awareness about the importance of early childhood education and introduce it into the general framework of education;

(i) Provide children with a safe school environment by, *inter alia*, taking all necessary steps to prevent abuse and exploitation of children by school personnel, taking effective disciplinary measures against school personnel who have committed those offences and reporting these incidences to the competent authorities, notably through child-sensitive structures for complaints;

(j) Encourage participation by children at all levels of school life; and

(k) Seek assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO.

436. ...The Committee...is concerned at the fact that access to education is not always guaranteed to refugee children.

437. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Guarantee access to education to child refugees;

...

- Bahrain, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 122 at paras. 491 and 492.

491. Noting the information provided that access to basic education is free and almost universal, the Committee is nevertheless concerned that education is still not compulsory, and pre-primary education is available only through private institutions.

492. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Expedite the promulgation of the draft law on free and compulsory education; and

(b) Take steps to provide free pre-primary education.

- Andorra, CRC, CRC/C/114 (2002) 134 at paras. 543 and 544.

543. Noting the attention given by the State party to children under 16 working in a family context, the Committee is concerned that such work may interfere with children's right to education.

544. The Committee recommends that the State party continue and strengthen its efforts to

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

ensure respect for the rights of children under 16 working in a family context, particularly the right to education.

- Guinea-Bissau, CRC, CRC/C/118 (2002) 12 at paras. 66, 67, 74 and 75.

66. While noting that a major effort has been made to address the situation of children with disabilities since 1986 (see report, para. 189), the Committee remains concerned that:

...

(c) There is a lack of health, educational or professional training facilities for children with disabilities (see report, para.147) and, in particular, children with disabilities have very limited access to formal education;

(d) Children with disabilities often have serious difficulty in gaining access to public buildings, including to hospitals and schools.

67. The Committee recommends that the State party, in the spirit of the United Nations Guidelines on Disabilities and the results of the Committee's day of general discussion on the rights of children with disabilities:

(a) Develop or amend legislation to ensure that discrimination on the grounds of disability is prohibited and that children with disabilities have access to public transportation and public buildings, including all schools and hospitals;

...

(c) Significantly strengthen its assistance to children with disabilities and ensure, *inter alia*, that they have access to health, educational and professional facilities;

...

74. Despite increases in school enrolment over the past decade, the Committee remains concerned that:

(a) Literacy rates and primary and secondary school enrolment rates among children are extremely low;

(b) There are major differences in the access of children to education across the country;

(c) Literacy and enrolment among girls are much lower than the already worrying rates for boys;

(d) Primary education, where available, is of a low quality and many schools offer only the 1st and 2nd grades and few offer more than 4 years of education;

(e) Schools lack adequate books and materials;

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

(f) Only 1 per cent of children have access to nurseries, kindergartens or similar institutions (see report, para. 217);

(g) Many teachers have not received any formal training;

(h) The number and quality of special education institutions are extremely limited;

(i) Ninety per cent of education costs are supported by external assistance (see report, para. 216).

75. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Raise the State party's contribution to the education budget to the maximum of available resources, while also continuing to seek support through international cooperation;

(b) Strengthen education infrastructure, including with regard to administration, management, educational planning, the quality of education in general, the training of teachers and other staff, the construction of additional schools and classrooms, and the provision and quality of textbooks and other school materials and equipment;

(c) Consider strengthening the quality of primary and secondary school curricula, taking into consideration the Committee's General Comment on article 29.1 of the Convention and the aims of education (CRC/GC/2001/1);

(d) Urgently take action to increase the proportion of children enrolling in primary school and completing compulsory education;

(e) Urgently give special attention to raising the proportion of girls completing their primary and secondary education, including through affirmative action and similar special measures, and by ensuring that girls have the same opportunities as boys to attend formal education, that the education of girls is seen by parents, families and communities, as being of equal importance to that of boys and that education is seen as the right of all children;

(f) Make every effort to ensure that compulsory education is free for all children, including with regard to textbooks and uniforms for disadvantaged children and families;

(g) Increase the number, capacity and quality of special education institutions;

(h) Seek technical assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO in this regard.

- Niger, CRC, CRC/C/118 (2002) 37 at paras. 189 and 190.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

189. The Committee is deeply concerned that child labour in the State party is widespread, particularly in the informal sector, and that children may be working long hours at young ages, which has a negative effect on their development and school attendance...

190. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(d) Seek innovative approaches, such as alternative education or non-formal education, to give educational opportunities to children who are older and have to work;

...

- Belarus, CRC, CRC/C/118 (2002) 54 at paras. 250 and 251.

250. The Committee, while acknowledging the State party's efforts to include human rights in school curricula, notes with concern that the availability of education in the Belarusian language is becoming increasingly limited, from early childhood to secondary education. Further, it notes that the number of children in secondary education is decreasing and that education standards, particularly in the secondary system, vary greatly to the disadvantage of lower-income neighbourhoods and rural areas.

251. In light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the State party should:

(a) Ensure the availability of education in the Belarusian language and the accessibility for Roma children and those belonging to other minorities to good quality education;

(b) Improve the quality of education in the whole country in order to achieve the goals mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1, in line with the Committee's general comment No.1 on the aims of education.

- Tunisia, CRC, CRC/C/118 (2002) 68 at paras. 295 and 296.

295. While welcoming the State party's commitment to making basic education a priority and achieving virtually universal access to education, the Committee remains concerned at the repetition and dropout rates, which, while decreasing, continue to pose a significant challenge to the educational system. The Committee is furthermore concerned at regional disparities in education as well as at the disparity in the illiteracy rate between urban and rural areas as well as gender disparities. The Committee is furthermore concerned at the low enrolment in early childhood education and the decrease of public early childhood education centers which may result in discrimination on the basis of income level.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

296. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take all appropriate measures, including the allocation of adequate financial, human and technical resources, to further improve education, as stipulated in articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, both with regard to quality as well as relevance, taking into account general comment No.1 on article 29, paragraph 1 (aims of education), and to ensure that all children enjoy the right to education;

(b) Seek to implement additional measures to promote early childhood education and to encourage children to stay in school, and adopt effective measures to reduce illiteracy rates;

(c) Continue cooperation with the UNESCO and UNICEF in improving the education sector.

- Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, CRC, CRC/C/118 (2002) 101 at paras. 447, 448 and 451-454 .

447. The Committee is concerned that:

...

(b) Children with disabilities, including learning disabilities, are not integrated, as a matter of policy, into regular schools and that an insufficient number of teachers have received specialized training in this regard; and

(c) Some children with disabilities are often obliged to remain at home and do not have access to many public buildings as a result of physical barriers such as stairs.

448. In the context of the Committee's comments [in paras. 430-436] of these concluding observations, and taking note of the United Nations Guidelines on Disabilities and the results of the Committee's day of general discussion on the rights of children with disabilities (6 October 1997), the Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Ensure the integration within the State party's child rights policy of the rights of children with disabilities with regard to, *inter alia*, non-discrimination, participation, survival and development, health, education (including vocational education for future employment) and integration into society;

(c) Ensure access for children with disabilities to public transportation and public buildings, including all schools and hospitals;

(d) Train additional teachers to teach and counsel children with disabilities;

(e) Strengthen the assistance, including financial assistance and counselling, provided to the



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

families of children with disabilities;

(f) Seek international cooperation from, *inter alia*, UNICEF, in this regard.

...

451. The Committee is concerned that:

(a) Adolescents face health risks, including from sexual exploitation, maltreatment, drug and alcohol abuse, and HIV/AIDS;

(b) The rate of teenage pregnancy is high.

452. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Increase its efforts to promote adolescent health, including mental health, policies, particularly with respect to reproductive health and substance abuse and health education in schools, ensuring the full participation of adolescents;

(b) Consider means of reducing teenage pregnancy, including strengthening reproductive health education for adolescents, and ensure the provision of full health and counselling support for pregnant girls and that these girls are able to continue their formal education.

453. While noting the significant increase in the numbers of pre-schools for children between the ages of 3 and 5 and efforts to set minimum standards for these schools, and noting also the increase in the proportion of trained teachers in primary and secondary schools (as indicated in the replies to the list of issues), the Committee remains concerned that:

(a) Pre-schools are not regulated by the Government, buildings are insufficiently equipped and personnel inadequately trained;

(b) The proportion of untrained teachers in primary schools remains high - approximately 25 per cent of the total;

(c) Despite passage of the 1992 Education Act, compulsory primary education is not yet enforced;

(d) The number of children passing the secondary school entrance examination is extremely low;

(e) Children have insufficient access to books and other reading materials.

454. The Committee recommends that the State party:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(a) Adopt legislation regulating pre-schools, including with regard to the standards of buildings and other facilities and the training of staff, and continue its current efforts in this regard;

(b) Continue the progress made so far in providing training for primary school teachers;

(c) Follow through with its commitment, as expressed by the delegation, to enforce compulsory education requirements from September 2002 and to consider raising the age of compulsory education from 14 to 16;

(d) Review the system of secondary school entrance examinations and take action to address problems identified, with a view, *inter alia*, to raising significantly the numbers of children graduating from primary to secondary school;

(e) In the light of the Committee's General Comment on article 29.1 of the Convention and the aims of education (CRC/GC/2001/1), take measures to strengthen the accessibility, quality and management of schools and take action to address problems identified;

(f) Continue its ongoing efforts to increase the computerization of schools, and ensure that all children have access to appropriate books and other reading materials;

(g) Seek technical assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO in this regard.

- Spain, CRC, CRC/C/118 (2002) 117 at paras. 509-513.

509. The Committee notes with concern:

(a) The high rate of truancy and school drop-out and the difficult school integration of Roma children, children belonging to migrant families or children living in socio-economically deprived areas;

(b) That some children belonging to migrant families, particularly girls, do not complete their compulsory education or have great difficulties in attending school;

(c) The rather widespread bullying in schools;

(d) The negative impact of terrorism on children's development.

510. The Committee further notes that a Quality Education Act is under development.

511. In light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

State party:

- (a) Ensure regular attendance at schools and the reduction of truancy and drop-out rates, especially with regard to Roma children and children belonging to migrant families;
- (b) Take measures to prevent bullying and other forms of violence in schools, in light of the Committee's recommendations adopted at its day of general discussion on "Violence against children within the family and in schools";
- (c) Ensure that the educational process will promote the culture of peace and tolerance, as well as address the negative impact of terrorism on the physical and psychological well-being of children;
- (d) Take into consideration the Committee's general comment No.1 on the aims of education in the development of the Quality Education Act.

512. The Committee is deeply alarmed about the conditions of unaccompanied foreign children, mostly Moroccans, especially in the autonomous cities of Ceuta and Melilla. In particular, it expresses its concern at reports of:

...

- (d) Denial of access to health care and education, although guaranteed by law;

...

513. The Committee recommends that the State party urgently take the necessary measures in order to:

- (a) Ensure the implementation of Organizational Act 4/2000 and other laws by providing to unaccompanied foreign children access to residential care, education, emergency services and other health care, and temporary residency documents;

...

- The Netherlands (Antilles), CRC, CRC/C/118 (2002) 129 at paras. 575 and 576.

575. The Committee welcomes and is encouraged by the introduction of the Foundation Based Education in August 2002, which includes in its curriculum subjects such as Human Rights, Healthy Lifestyles, Reproductive Health and Social Development, and which provides a more participatory approach for children within school life. The Committee remains concerned, however, at:

- (a) High drop-out rates in primary and secondary school, especially among boys;
- (b) Insufficient number of well-trained teaching staff;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (c) The disparity among the islands in enrolment rates and access to education;
- (d) High illiteracy rates for boys and girls;
- (e) Various forms of discrimination and exclusion which affect the right to education of certain groups of children, such as pregnant adolescents, undocumented children and children with disabilities, reflecting insufficient attention to articles 28 and 29 of the Convention.

576. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Seek to implement participatory measures to encourage children, especially boys, to stay in school during the period of compulsory education;
- (b) Take effective measures through, *inter alia*, non-formal measures to address the high illiteracy rates;
- (c) Extend resources to support children to go to secondary education;
- (d) Effectively implement the Foundation Based Education as of August 2002 and monitor its progress, ensuring that children are consulted in this process and that teachers are sufficiently trained in this new approach to education;
- (e) Ensure that pregnant girls of compulsory school age stay in school and are provided with adequate support mechanisms to continue their education after the child is born;
- (f) Increase the number, capacity and quality of special education institutions for children with special education needs;
- (g) Address education towards the aims mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general comment on the aims of education.

- Argentina, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 8 at paras. 54, 55, 81, 82, 87 and 88.

54. The Committee is concerned that the principle of non-discrimination is not fully implemented for children living in poverty, indigenous children, children of migrant workers, primarily those from neighbouring countries, street children, children with disabilities and marginalized adolescents who are neither studying nor working, especially

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

with regard to their access to adequate health care and educational facilities.

55. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Monitor the situation of children, in particular those belonging to the above-mentioned vulnerable groups, who are exposed to discrimination;

(b) Develop, on the basis of the results of this monitoring, comprehensive strategies containing specific and well-targeted actions aimed at eliminating all forms of discrimination.

...

81. The Committee, while noting the increase in school enrolment for both primary and secondary education, remains concerned at the limited access to education and at the high drop out and repetition rates, especially at secondary school level, which affect, in particular, children from marginalized urban and rural areas, indigenous children and children from migrant families, particularly illegal migrants. It further notes with concern the reduction in education spending which affects, in particular, poorer children.

82. In light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Increase the budget allocated to education;

(b) Enforce the Social Plan of Education in order to ensure regular attendance at school and the reduction of drop out rates, especially with regard to the most vulnerable children;

(c) Strengthen programmes of subsidies and scholarships for the children who are most affected by the economic crisis;

(d) Strengthen and expand education in human and children's rights;

(e) Improve the quality of education in order to achieve the goals mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1, in line with the Committee's General Comment No. 1 on the aims of education.

...

87. The Committee...notes with concern the poor conditions of children in detention, including the lack of adequate basic services such as education and health, the absence of adequately trained staff, and the use of corporal punishment and isolation.

88. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(g) Take the necessary measures to improve detention conditions;

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 23 at paras. 139-142, 152 and 154.

139. The Committee welcomes the increase in the education budget and the measures adopted by the State party to raise standards of literacy and numeracy through initiatives such as the Education Action Zones programme, as well as the development of broad citizenship programmes...The Committee is concerned at the still high rate of temporary and permanent exclusion from school affecting mainly children from specific groups (ethnic minorities, including black children, Irish and Roma travellers, children with disabilities, asylum-seekers, etc.), and the sharp differences in educational outcomes for children according to their socio-economic background and to other factors such as gender, disability, ethnic origin or care status. Moreover, the Committee is concerned at the widespread bullying in schools. The Committee is particularly concerned that children deprived of their liberty in prisons and juvenile detention centres do not have a statutory right to education, that their education is not the responsibility of the departments responsible for education, and that they do not have support for special education needs. The Committee is further concerned that the majority of children in the care system, as well as teenage mothers, do not attain basic qualifications...

140. In light of articles 2, 12, 28 and 29 of the Convention, and in line with its previous recommendations ([CRC/C/15/Add.34], para. 32), the Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Take appropriate measures to reduce temporary or permanent exclusion, ensure that children throughout the State party have the right to be heard before exclusion and to appeal against temporary and permanent exclusion, and ensure that children who are excluded do continue to have access to full-time education;

(c) Take all necessary measures to eliminate the inequalities in educational achievement and in exclusion rates between children from different groups and to guarantee all children an appropriate quality education;

(d) Ensure that children in detention have an equal statutory right to education and improve education for children in care;

...

(h) Develop educational programmes for teenage mothers to facilitate and encourage their further education;

(i) Evaluate the impact of privatization of schools on the right of children to education.

141. ...The Committee is...concerned...that placement in temporary accommodation of

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

children seeking asylum may infringe their basic rights such as access to health or education...

142. In accordance with the principles and provisions of the Convention, especially articles 2, 3, 22 and 37, and with respect to children, whether seeking asylum or not, the Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Ensure that refugee and asylum-seeking children have access to basic services such as education and health, and that there is no discrimination in benefit entitlements for asylum-seeking families that could affect children;

...

152. ...[T]he Committee notes with concern that:

(a) The Crime and Disorder Act 1998 has introduced in England and Wales measures that may violate the principles and provisions of the Convention;

...

(c) Children in custody do not always have access to independent advocacy services and to basic services such as education, adequate health care, etc.;

...

154. ...[T]he Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(g) Take all necessary measures, as a matter of urgency, to review the conditions of detention and ensure that all children deprived of their liberty have statutory rights to education, health and child protection equal to those of other children;

...

- Seychelles, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 41 at paras. 180, 181, 203, 204, 207, 208, 213 and 215.

180. The Committee is concerned that:

...

(b) The age of compulsory education is not clear, giving rise to uneven enforcement.

181. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Establish a clear age for compulsory schooling and ensure that it is enforced.

...

203. The Committee is encouraged by the State party's efforts, together with the National Council for the Disabled, to combat discrimination against children and adults with disabilities. Nevertheless, the Committee is concerned that children with disabilities have limited access to public facilities and services because the physical environment is not appropriately designed or because staff and programmes have not been designed to ensure

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

integration of children with disabilities.

204. Taking note of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96, annex) and the results of the Committee's day of general discussion on the rights of children with disabilities, held on 6 October 1997 (see CRC/C/69, paras. 310-339), the Committee recommends that the State party continue its cooperation with the National Council for the Disabled and other relevant civil society organizations, in particular in:

(a) Developing and implementing a policy aimed at the full integration of children with disabilities into the mainstream school system;

(b) Assessing the extent to which current services and public facilities are accessible and appropriate for the needs of children with disabilities with a view to improving the physical environment, the coordination of service delivery and the capacity of all staff and professionals working for and with children to include children with disabilities in their programmes, thereby facilitating their active participation in society at large.

...

207. The Committee is encouraged by the existence of free compulsory education and early childhood education programmes with virtually universal enrolment. Nevertheless, the Committee is concerned about the high drop out rates and absenteeism.

208. In light of the Committee's General Comment No. 1 on article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention (aims of education), the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Consider creating study groups in schools involving students at higher and lower levels in order to contribute to the improvement of the achievements of students with learning difficulties;

(b) Undertake a study of the reasons why students drop out of school in order to develop solutions that ensure their continuing educational or vocational training, and further opportunities for employment and integration into society;

...

(d) Ratify the Convention against Discrimination in Education, of 1960 of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.

...

213. ...[T]he Committee is concerned that conditions at the Youth Residential Treatment Centre are very poor, that it has few programmes for rehabilitation or education and that its location limits contact between children and their families...

...

215. The Committee...recommends that the State party:

...



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(c) Improve the conditions at the Youth Rehabilitation and Treatment Centre and ensure that rehabilitation and education programmes are provided while continuing consideration of the possibilities of relocating the Centre to the main island in order to facilitate contact between children and their families.

- Sudan, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 53 at paras. 272-275, 282 and 283.

272. The Committee takes note of the adoption of the General Education Act 2002 and the establishment of a girls' basic education service and of an education service for nomadic children, but remains concerned:

(a) At the very low level of public spending on education;

(b) At the very low level of enrolment in pre-school, primary and secondary schools owing, among other things, to the fact that education is not compulsory and that a birth certificate is required for enrolment;

(c) That the drop out rate is very high and that many children do not complete their primary education.

273. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Significantly increase public spending on education;

(b) Ensure that primary education is free and compulsory for all children;

(c) Continue and strengthen efforts to increase enrolment in pre-school, primary and secondary education through, *inter alia*, increasing the number of schools, classrooms and teachers and establishing flexible forms of school registration which do not require the presentation of a birth registration certificate;

(d) Reduce the number of children dropping out of education by, *inter alia*, enforcing compulsory education requirements, providing additional financial support to cover the costs of education, and through the use of public information campaigns on the value of education;

(e) Give particular attention to ensuring the enrolment in school of girls, children with disabilities, refugee children and children from nomadic groups, and continue and strengthen efforts to provide special education and mobile education facilities for children with disabilities and nomadic children, respectively, who are in need of them;

(f) Strengthen education infrastructure and resources, including the provision of sufficient

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

resources to local authorities, the construction of classrooms and schools, the provision of materials and school equipment, the revision and updating of school curricula and the improvement of teacher training;

- (g) Make particular efforts to improve access to education in southern Sudan;
- (h) Improve the opportunities for children to have access to tertiary education;
- (i) Implement the recommendations and aims contained in paragraphs 235 and 292 of the State party's report;
- (j) In light of the Committee's General Comment No. 1 on article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention (The aims of education), take measures to strengthen the accessibility, quality and management of schools and take action to address the problems identified.

274. The Committee is deeply concerned at the fact that the availability, accessibility and quality of education in the southern part of the country is much worse than in the rest of the country (e.g. only 16-18 per cent of children have access to education and not more than 20 per cent of those are girls; the drop out rate is still high; teachers are not paid salaries and most of them are not qualified; schools are often too far away and education is regularly disrupted by the armed conflict; and availability of educational material is very limited). These and other concerns lead to the following recommendations, particularly for the southern part of the country.

275. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Urgently implement measures to raise the number of children enrolling in education and, as far as possible, support children so that they enrol at the correct age;
- ...
- (c) Implement measures to improve children's access to schools through, *inter alia*, the provision of transport to schools over a certain distance away or the establishment of additional schools closer to children;
- (d) Give particular attention to increasing the number of girls enrolling in and completing education;
- ...

282. The Committee is concerned that:

- (b) The large scale and intensity of work demands placed upon children prevents many of them from attending school;
- ...

283. The Committee recommends that the State party:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

...

(c) Make every effort to ensure that those children who do work continue to have access to formal education.

- Ukraine, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 70 at paras. 353-356 and 358.

353. The Committee welcomes the efforts undertaken by the State party to improve the education system with the introduction of the Act “On education”, which includes such aims as ensuring the delivery of compulsory secondary education to all children of school age. The Committee also welcomes the adoption of State standards for higher education. The Committee remains concerned, however, that:

...

(b) The increase in the cost of education has limited access by children from economically disadvantaged households;

(c) The decrease in the number of pre-school establishments limits children’s access to pre-schooling;

(d) Drop out rates in secondary and vocational education are increasing;

(e) There are important regional disparities in the number of education establishments and in the quality of education available, with rural areas being at a particular disadvantage, and that children of small national minorities such as Roma do not get quality education, including in their own language;

...

354. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Ensure the availability of free primary education and accessibility for all children in the State party, giving particular attention to children in rural communities, Roma children, Crimean Tartar children and children of other minorities, as well as children from disadvantaged backgrounds, to good quality education, including in their own language;

(b) Take the necessary steps to increase the number of pre-school establishments;

(c) Ensure that legislation with regard to compulsory education is enforced, including through the provision of the appropriate resources for this purpose;

...

355. The Committee welcomes the enactment of the Refugee Law 2001, but remains concerned that:

(a) As noted in the State party’s report, some refugee children, especially older ones, do not

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

attend school which prevents them from obtaining an education and leads to their isolation in Ukrainian society;

...

356. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Ensure that asylum-seeking, refugee and illegal immigrant children have access to education and health services;

...

358. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Continue efforts to protect all children from economic exploitation and from performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child's education, or to be harmful to the child's health or physical, mental or social development.

- Republic of Moldova, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 89 at paras. 412, 413, 420, 421 and 423.

412. The Committee notes with concern the declining expenditure on education, which affects in particular pre-school education, especially in rural areas. It further expresses concern for the drop in the quality and accessibility of education with a consequent decrease in enrolment across all levels of compulsory education and increase in of drop out rates.

413. In light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Develop a national strategy on education for all, and a clear plan of action, taking into account the Dakar Framework for Action;

(b) Ensure regular attendance at schools and the reduction of drop out rates;

...

420. The Committee is concerned that, despite pilot programmes aimed at improving the situation of the Roma in certain provinces, they still suffer from widespread discrimination which has in some instances curtailed Romani children's right to education, health and social welfare.

421. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Initiate campaigns at all levels and in all provinces aimed at addressing the negative attitudes towards the Roma in society at large and in particular amongst authorities and professionals providing health, education and other social services;

(b) Develop and implement a plan aimed at integrating all Roma children into mainstream

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

education and prohibiting their segregation in special classes, and which would include pre-school programmes for Romani children to learn the primary language of schooling in their community;

(c) Develop curriculum resources for all schools which include Romani history and culture in order to promote understanding, tolerance and respect of the Roma community in Moldovan society.

...

423. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(h) Ensure access to education for girls and boys in detention;

...

### *See also:*

- Poland, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 120 at paras. 545 and 546.
- Burkina Faso, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 103 at paras. 448, 449, 473 and 474.

448. ...[T]he Committee is concerned at the difference between the minimum age of employment (14 years) and the age for the end of compulsory education (16 years).

449. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Take all necessary measures to ensure that employment of children does not interfere with their right to education.

...

473. While noting the plans for a national rehabilitation policy and a national plan of action, the Committee is concerned at the lack of statistical data on children with disabilities in the State party, at the situation of children with physical and mental disabilities and, in particular, at the limited specialized health care, education and employment possibilities available to them...

474. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Review the situation of these children in terms of their access to suitable health care, education services and employment opportunities;

...

(e) Strengthen policies and programmes of inclusion in regular education, train teachers and make schools accessible;

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Poland, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 120 at paras. 533, 534 and 537-540.

533. The Committee is concerned that children with disabilities do not all have the opportunity to attend integrated schools and education programmes, and that in some cases children with disabilities are institutionalized or do not attend school regularly owing to a lack of appropriate programmes close to their homes.

534. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Develop a time-bound plan for reducing the number of children with disabilities living in institutions and integrating them into mainstream education and vocational training programmes, as well as social, cultural and leisure activities;

(b) Provide sufficient financial, human and organizational resources to *powiats* to ensure that they all offer integrated educational facilities that are accessible and appropriate to children with disabilities that will ensure their full participation in society.

...

537. The Committee notes the new initiatives to provide textbooks to children from poor families and provide all schools with computers, yet it remains concerned at the increasing disparities in access to education, the material condition of schools and the quality of education between rural and urban areas, particularly with regard to kindergartens and extracurricular programmes and activities.

538. The Committee recommends that the State party ensure that children in rural areas have equal opportunities for a quality education which provides them with the skills to enter the labour market or university-level education based on their merit, by:

(a) Seeking innovative means for promoting the cognitive, social and emotional development of children, through, *inter alia*, programmes that foster interaction between children and their peers and parental education programmes on the benefits of early childhood education, ensuring that there are sufficient and appropriate kindergarten facilities for all children in rural areas; orienting the education system towards achieving the aims mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and in the Committee's General Comment No. 1 on the aims of education; and introducing human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;

(b) Ensuring that rural areas and poorer communities are provided with additional funds to allow them to provide the same quality of education and level of extracurricular programmes as urban schools;

(c) Ensuring that students from poor families or those in rural areas have access to scholarships or other forms of financial support that allow them to attend general secondary

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

schools in preparation for university.

539. ...[T]he Committee is concerned that children waiting for their refugee claims to be processed do not have opportunities for education if they are housed in emergency blocks...

540. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Ensure that all children awaiting processing of their refugee claims in emergency blocks, the refugee reception centre or other forms of care have full access to education.

...

- Israel, CRC, CRC/C/121 (2002) 131 at paras. 576, 577 and 602-605.

576. The Committee is concerned that discrimination, contrary to article 2 of the Convention, persists in the State party, and that non-discrimination is not expressly guaranteed under the Constitution. In particular, the Committee is concerned about discrimination against girls and women, especially in the context of religious laws, discrimination on religious grounds, inequalities in the enjoyment of the economic, social and cultural rights (i.e. access to education, health care and social services) of Israeli Arabs, Bedouins, Ethiopians and other minorities, children with disabilities and children of foreign workers, and of the rights and freedoms of Palestinian children in the occupied territories.

577. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take effective measures, including enacting or rescinding legislation where necessary, to ensure that all children enjoy all the rights set out in the Convention without discrimination, in accordance with article 2;

...

602. The Committee is concerned about the serious deterioration of access to education of children in the occupied Palestinian territories as a result of the measures imposed by the Israeli Defence Forces, including road closures, curfews and mobility restrictions, and the destruction of school infrastructure.

603. The Committee recommends that the State party guarantee that every Palestinian child has access to education, in accordance with the Convention. As a first step, the State party should ensure that restrictions on mobility are lifted throughout the occupied Palestinian territories during school hours.

604. The Committee welcomes the information that the budget for education has been protected from recent cuts in spending, but is concerned that investment in and the quality of education in the Israeli Arab sector is significantly lower than in the Jewish sector.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

605. The Committee recommends that the State party continue and strengthen its affirmative-action programmes and further increase the budget allocated for education in the Arab sector.

- Estonia, CRC, CRC/C/124 (2003) 9 at paras. 60, 61, 64, 65, 72 and 73.

60. The Committee...notes with concern that the implementation of the Education Act does not sufficiently envisage the inclusion of disabled children...

61. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Provide early childhood care and special education for children with disabilities;

...

(d) Undertake awareness-raising campaigns which focus on prevention, inclusive education, family care and the promotion of the rights of children with disabilities;

...

(f) Provide adequate support, supervision and training to persons working with these children, including the teaching staff in mainstream schools;

(g) Take measures to remove physical barriers to enable effective access of children with disabilities to schools and other institutions and services in a manner conducive to the child's achieving the fullest possible social integration and individual development.

...

64. The Committee welcomes the inclusion of the Convention in the school curriculum and appreciates the acknowledgment by the State party that there are challenges facing the right to education. In this regard, it shares the concern that more than 5,000 children do not attend school, and that repetition and drop-out rates are high. Possible reasons for dropping out include: lack of protection from bullying, overcrowded classrooms, a poor school environment as a result of diminished extracurricular activities, overburdened teachers and closure of schools in rural areas for economic reasons.

65. The Committee encourages the State party:

(a) To undertake a study of the causes of the high repetition, drop-out and non-attendance rates and undertake effective actions to address these problems on the basis of the findings of the study;

(b) To consider adapting the school curricula to the varied needs of children and promote activities that may attract children to schools, thereby reducing the number of dropouts;

(c) To evaluate the effectiveness of those activities and devise strategies accordingly;



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (d) To further enhance the system of education for national minorities;
- (e) To take adequate measures to promote a non-violent environment in schools;
- (f) To take all the appropriate measures to implement regulation No. 209 for mother-tongue instruction for students whose mother tongue is not Estonian, providing also for the teaching of their culture and history;
- (g) To consider implementing the recommendations made by the Legal Chancellor with regard to schools in rural areas;
- (h) To improve the quality of education in the whole country in order to achieve the goals set out in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and in the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education, and to ensure that human rights education, including children's rights, are included in the school curricula.

...

72. The Committee notes the existence of the Crime Prevention Council and a new training council to train judges and prosecutors, and appreciates that the minimum age of criminal responsibility has recently been raised to 14 years. However, the Committee is concerned:

...

(f) That the situation at Maardu Prison is difficult and there is not sufficient opportunity for learning or working or participating in social, educational or arts courses. In addition, there are no programmes to protect the youngest and weakest prison inmates from violent behaviour.

73. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(e) Continue and strengthen efforts to improve conditions at Maardu Prison.

- Republic of Korea, CRC, CRC/124 (2003) 24 at paras. 128-131.

128. The Committee...is concerned at reports that a significant number of children with disabilities are abandoned each year, that many cannot attend school and when they do attend school they are segregated from other students.

129. The Committee recommends that the State party, in accordance with the recommendations arising from the Committee's day of general discussion, held in 1997, on children with disabilities, and the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96, annex):

...

(b) Undertake a comprehensive survey of the number of children with disabilities, including

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

those currently not attending school, which assesses their educational needs and access to education and other social services;

(c) Expand existing programmes aimed at improving the physical access of children with disabilities to public buildings and areas, including schools and recreational facilities, and increase the number of integrated education programmes at pre-primary, primary, secondary and tertiary levels.

130. The Committee is concerned that, despite the State party's relatively high level of economic development, only primary education is free, while welcoming the information that the State party is in the process of making middle school education free. Similarly, while there is no disparity in enrolment rates of girls and boys in primary education, significantly fewer girls than boys are enrolled in higher education. Finally, the Committee reiterates its concern that the highly competitive nature of the education system risks hampering the development of the child to his or her fullest potential.

131. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Raise the quality of public schools, which is low compared to that of private schools, by increasing material resources provided to schools and improving the quality of teaching;

(b) Develop a time-bound strategy for reducing and eliminating the cost of pre-school and secondary education;

(c) Take effective measures to ensure that higher education is accessible to all on the basis of capacity, by promoting the enrolment of girls and addressing persistent gender stereotypes;

(d) Review its education policy with a view to reducing competitiveness and reflecting the aims of education set out in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and in the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education.

- Italy, CRC, CRC/124 (2003) 36 at paras.184-187, 195 and 196.

184. The Committee welcomes the adoption of Act 9/99, which extends the duration of compulsory education from 8 to 10 years, and the various programmes to improve teacher training, but remains concerned at the high rate of drop-out in upper secondary education, the variations in educational outcomes for children according to their cultural and socio-economic background and to other factors such as gender (more girls than boys obtain a secondary education diploma), disability and ethnic origin. In addition, the Committee is concerned at the prevalence of bullying in schools and at the lack of consideration of the

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

views of children within education.

185. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Strengthen its efforts to curb the drop-out rate in upper secondary education;
- (b) Take all necessary measures to eliminate the inequalities in educational achievement between girls and boys and among children from different social, economic or cultural groups and to guarantee quality education to all children;
- (c) Take measures to set up adequate mechanisms and structures with the participation of children to prevent bullying and other forms of violence in schools and include children in the development and implementation of these strategies;
- (d) Ensure that legislation throughout the State party reflects article 12 of the Convention and respects children's rights to express their views and have them given due weight in all matters concerning their education, including school discipline.

186. ...[T]he Committee remains concerned at the lack of adequate structures to receive unaccompanied minors...

187. In accordance with the principles and provisions of the Convention, especially articles 2, 3, 22 and 37, and with respect to children, whether seeking asylum or not, the Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Strengthen efforts to establish enough special reception centres for unaccompanied minors, with special attention to those who have been victims of trafficking and/or sexual exploitation;
- (b) Ensure that the stay in these centres is for the shortest time possible and that access to education and health is guaranteed during and after the stay in a reception centre;

...

195. While noting the efforts undertaken by the State party to improve the situation of Roma children, the Committee remains concerned at their difficult social situation and their insufficient access to education and health services. In addition, the Committee is deeply concerned at instances of discrimination against this group of children, sometimes from the personnel of the State party themselves.

196. The Committee recommends that the State party develop, in cooperation with Roma NGOs, comprehensive proactive policies and programmes to prevent social exclusion and discrimination and to allow Roma children to enjoy fully their rights, including access to education and health care.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Romania, CRC, CRC/124 (2003) 49 at paras. 246, 247 and 250-253.

246. The Committee is concerned that disabled children in Romania remain disadvantaged in the enjoyment of their rights guaranteed by the Convention. The Committee is concerned, among other things, that:

(a) Children with disabilities often have serious difficulty in obtaining transportation and in gaining access to public buildings, including hospitals and schools;

(b) Despite the efforts of the State party to promote inclusion, disabled children in practice have limited access to formal education;

...

247. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Undertake greater efforts for inclusive education of children with all forms of disability and seek greater involvement of local communities in the process;

(d) Improve the physical accessibility of schools and other public buildings;

...

250. The Committee notes the initiatives to launch special programmes and provide free textbooks and school materials, as well as meals, to encourage school enrolment and attendance. However, the Committee is concerned that:

(a) The number of children from rural areas and the percentage of girls dropping out of school are disproportionately high;

(b) The curricula and teaching methodology, including in pre-school education, do not sufficiently reflect the aims of education contained in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention;

(c) School bullying and violence against and by children persist;

(d) Children belonging to certain categories do not benefit from equal opportunities as concerns education (e.g. children from disadvantaged families, children with disabilities, children affected by HIV/AIDS, children living in the streets, and Roma and refugee children).

251. The Committee recommends that the State party, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education:

(a) Make every effort to increase the length of compulsory education;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (b) Make every effort to ensure that compulsory education, and possibly secondary education, is free for all children;
- (c) Increase the education budget to the maximum extent of its available resources, including through additional international cooperation;
- (d) Strengthen the institutional capacity of State education, including with regard to administration, management, educational planning and the training of teachers and other staff;
- (e) Take steps to strengthen education infrastructure and resources, including with a view to reducing disparities between urban and rural areas;
- (f) Promote violence-free schools;
- (g) Ensure that education, including early childhood education, is directed towards the development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential;
- (h) Ensure that the school curricula and teaching methodology are child-centred and that they stress the importance of critical thinking and problem-solving skills development;
- (i) Take steps to significantly increase the number of children completing secondary education.

252. The Committee notes:

- (a) That the legislation (Law 48/2002) provides special protection for vulnerable persons, but remains concerned that *de facto* discrimination persists regarding access to education, health care and social benefits;

...

253. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Ensure the availability of Romanian language courses, as stipulated by law, to facilitate the integration of asylum-seeker and refugee children in the education system;
- (b) Consider preferential treatment for refugees, including exemptions from or reductions in tuition fees for upper secondary and university education;

...

- Viet Nam, CRC, CRC/C/124 (2003) 67 at paras. 308, 309, 312 and 313.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

308. The Committee is very concerned at the high proportion of children with disabilities who do not attend school, do not have access to vocational training or preparation for employment and have limited access to rehabilitation services, particularly in rural areas.

309. The Committee recommends that the State party, in accordance with the recommendations arising from the Committee's 1997 day of general discussion on children with disabilities (CRC/C/69, para. 338) and the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96, annex):

(a) Undertake a comprehensive survey of the number of children with disabilities, including those currently not attending school, in order to assess their educational and vocational training needs, and their access to rehabilitation and other social services;

...

(c) Expand existing programmes aimed at improving the physical access of children with disabilities to public buildings and areas, including schools and recreational facilities, and increase the number of integrated education programmes at pre-primary, primary, secondary and tertiary levels.

...

312. While noting the State party's efforts to achieve universal enrolment at primary school level, the Committee is concerned that there are significant gaps in access to and quality of education between urban and rural or mountainous regions, and that the school system still suffers from a shortage of well-trained teachers and educational materials. In addition, the Committee is concerned at the low enrolment rates in pre-primary education, the high number of repeaters of the first grade and the significant disparity in enrolment in nursery schools between boys and girls.

313. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take all appropriate measures to increase enrolment in pre-primary education, in particular for girls and in rural areas, and ensure the right to quality, free primary education for all children;

(b) Increase the financial assistance provided to students from economically disadvantaged families at all levels, including pre-primary, particularly in rural areas;

(c) Recruit and train a greater number of teachers from all ethnic minority groups and continue to provide incentives to teachers working in remote and mountainous regions;

(d) Prioritize rural areas and remote and mountainous regions in existing programmes to improve the quality of teaching and the curriculum, and in the construction and development of school infrastructure.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Czech Republic, CRC, CRC/C/124 (2003) 78 at paras. 369, 370, 375, 376 and 380.

369. The Committee welcomes information on the national plan to equalize opportunities for citizens with medical disabilities and is encouraged by the growing number of children with disabilities who are integrated into mainstream education...

...

370. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) In the light of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96, annex) and the Committee's recommendations adopted at its day of general discussion on "The rights of children with disabilities" (CRC/C/69, paras. 310-339), further encourage their integration into the regular educational system and inclusion into society, including by providing special training to teachers and by making schools more accessible.

...

375. The Committee welcomes the efforts of the Government aimed at developing post-secondary education, making it more accessible, ensuring education for minority groups and integrating children with disabilities into mainstream education. The Committee welcomes the secondary school for Roma children established on the initiative of the Roma people themselves. However, the Committee is concerned that the implementation of the reform of the education system remains insufficient and that in-service teacher training in this respect is lacking. The Committee is further concerned that Roma children continue to be over-represented in so-called "special schools" and at the discrimination in access to education of illegal migrants and refugees who are denied asylum.

376. Noting the State party's efforts in this domain, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Ensure the availability and accessibility of free primary education for all children in the State party, giving particular attention to providing children in rural communities, children from Roma and other minorities, as well as children from disadvantaged backgrounds such as refugees and illegal migrants, particularly unaccompanied minors, good quality education, including in their own language;

(b) Continue to strengthen its efforts to professionalize the pre-school assessment of children and avoid, as much as possible, assigning children of Roma origin or other children belonging to disadvantaged groups to special schools;

(c) Implement educational reforms with sufficient preparation and support schools in this regard with extra funding and teacher training, and establish a process for quality evaluation of the new programmes;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(d) Promote quality education in the whole country in order to achieve the goals mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education, and ensure that human rights education, including in children's rights, are included in the school curricula.

...

380. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Protect all children above 15 years from performing any work that is likely to be hazardous, to interfere with the child's education, or to be harmful to the child's health or physical, mental or social development;

(d) Make every effort to ensure that those children above 15 who do work legally continue to have access to education;

...

- Haiti, CRC, CRC/124 (2003) 95 at paras. 444 and 445.

444. The Committee notes the adoption of the National Education and Training Plan and the establishment of a pilot committee for its implementation. The Committee further welcomes the increasing budget allocated to education, as well as the establishment of the National Committee for the Education of Girls. However, the Committee is concerned at the still low enrolment ratios, and the disparities in enrolment between girls and boys and between rural and urban areas. The Committee is further concerned at the very limited number of public schools and at the low quality of education reflected in the high repetition and drop-out rates, which are attributable mainly to the lack of appropriate training for teachers (paragraph 192 of the State party's report). The Committee is also concerned that pregnant girls are excluded from schools. Finally, the Committee is concerned that education is principally run by the private sector (*ibid.* para. 184), while supervision by the State through the National Partnership Commission is very limited.

445. In the light of articles 28 and 29 and other relevant provisions of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Expedite effective implementation of the National Education and Training Plan;

(b) Continue its efforts to ensure that all children, especially girls, have equal access to educational opportunities, paying special attention to those living in rural and remote areas;

(c) Take the necessary measures to guarantee access to adapted and adequate curricula designed for vulnerable children like street children, *restaveks* and over-age children or adolescents;



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (d) Take the necessary measures to identify the causes of the high repetition and drop-out rates in primary schools and take steps to redress the situation;
  - (e) Better monitor the school curricula and the quality of education in private schools;
  - (f) Introduce, strengthen and systematize human rights education, including the rights of the child, into school curricula, beginning in primary school;
  - (g) Provide teachers with adequate training;
  - (h) Review its policy to ensure leadership in the governance of the education sector, notably by widening the powers of the National Partnership Commission;
  - (i) Seek technical assistance from, among others, UNESCO and UNICEF.
- Iceland, CRC, CRC/124 (2003) 109 at paras. 496 and 497.

496. The Committee notes with appreciation the adoption of anti-bullying campaigns in many schools, as well as the inclusion of courses in life skills. However, it is concerned:

  - (a) That the aims of education outlined in article 29 of the Convention (i.e. development and respect for human rights, tolerance and equality of the sexes and religious and ethnic minorities) are not explicitly part of the curricula throughout the State party;
  - (b) About the high drop-out rates of immigrant children, particularly at the secondary level.

497. The Committee recommends that the State party, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education:

  - (a) Explicitly include human rights education, including children's rights, in the curricula of all primary and secondary schools, particularly with regard to development and respect for human rights, tolerance and equality of the sexes and religious and ethnic minorities;
  - (b) Strengthen measures to address the problem of immigrant child dropouts.
- Eritrea, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 8 at paras. 75 and 76.

75. The Committee is encouraged by the State party's efforts to increase enrolment rates in basic education, reduce illiteracy, promote cultural and recreational activities and provide education in the native language of all nine ethnic groups. However, it is concerned that

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

enrolment and literacy levels are still low, particularly in secondary and pre-primary education, and that there is a significant disparity between the number of boys and girls in school. It also notes with concern that there are few trained teachers and limited opportunities for teachers to upgrade their skills.

76. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Continue to strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment rates in primary and basic education, in particular for girls;
- (b) Undertake additional efforts to increase the budget for education;
- (c) Continue its activities in the area of cultural and recreational activities;
- (d) Expand public provision of early childhood education, in particular in rural areas, and increase the number of trained pre-school teachers, and raise awareness amongst parents of the value of early childhood education;
- (e) Prioritize and continue to strengthen and expand efforts at teacher training and expand recruitment of qualified teachers, in particular women and persons from all ethnic groups for education in mother-tongue programmes;
- (f) Include human rights education as part of the curriculum.

- Cyprus, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 21 at paras. 127, 128 and 139-142.

127. The Committee is concerned that, given the situation on the island following the events of 1974, certain categories of children wishing to attend secondary school must be separated from their parents, and may not be allowed to visit their parents regularly or return upon completion of their education. Furthermore, the Committee notes that boarding schools for these children are available only for boys, and that there is one boarding home for girls.

128. The Committee urges the State party to create equal opportunities for all children wishing to pursue education beyond primary school, including by making boarding schools available to both boys and girls and pursuing efforts to reduce periods of separation from parents.

...

139. The Committee notes that the State party accords the utmost importance to education and is encouraged by the high enrolment rate, the increase in pre-primary education as well as international cooperation in this area. However, the Committee is concerned about the broad scope of special schools for children with physical, mental or emotional needs, which,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

*inter alia*, is not conducive to the integration of those children into mainstream schools.

140. The Committee encourages the State party to strengthen its efforts to include children with special needs, wherever possible, in mainstream schools, in accordance with article 23 (3) of the Convention. In this respect, the Committee draws the attention of the State party to the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities.

141. ...[T]he Committee remains concerned about difficulties that some children who have been given temporary protection may be experiencing in access to public education...

142. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Introduce further amendments to the Refugee Law in order to ensure access to public educational facilities to persons afforded temporary protection;

...

- Zambia, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 32 at paras. 207 and 208.

207. The Committee notes the adoption of the National Policy on Education (1996), the Basic Education Subsector of the Education Programme, the Zambian Education Capacity-Building Programme, and the Programme for the Advancement of Girl Child Education. However, the Committee remains concerned that primary education is not free and compulsory and that the illiteracy rate is high within the State party. The Committee is also concerned at the decreasing budget allocation to education, gender and regional disparities in enrolment in schools, absenteeism, the high dropout (especially among girls) and repeat rates, the poor quality of education, the insufficient number of trained teachers, insufficient schools and classrooms, the lack of relevant learning material and the limited access to pre-school education, notably in rural areas. In light of article 29 (1) of the Convention, the Committee is also concerned about the quality of education within the State party. The Committee notes with concern the reported incidents of physical and sexual abuse of children within the school environment.

208. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Ensure free and compulsory primary education;

(b) Progressively ensure that girls and boys, as well as children from urban, rural and least developed areas, have equal access to educational opportunities;

(c) Take the necessary measures to improve the quality of education and to improve internal efficiency in the management of education, notably by decreasing the dropout rate, especially for girls;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (d) Build better infrastructure for schools and provide appropriate training for teachers;
  - (e) Increase resources for education to help children to go to school, including secondary school;
  - (f) Orient education towards the aims stated in article 29 (1) of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education and introduce human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;
  - (g) Raise awareness about the importance of early childhood education and introduce it into the general framework of education;
  - (h) Provide children with a safe school environment by, *inter alia*, taking all necessary steps to prevent abuse and exploitation of children by school personnel, taking effective disciplinary measures against school personnel who have committed those offences and encouraging the reporting of these incidences to the competent authorities, notably through child-sensitive structures for complaints;
  - (i) Encourage participation by children at all levels of school life;
  - (j) Seek assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO.
- Sri Lanka, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 48 at paras. 263, 264, 269-272 and 277.

263. The Committee is concerned that a significant number of children with disabilities, in particular girls, are not able to attend school and that not all special schools managed by NGOs [non-governmental organizations] are registered by the Ministry of Education, and they are concentrated in the more developed and urbanized Western Province.

264. In light of the recommendations of the Committee's day of general discussion on the private sector as service provider and its role in implementing child rights in 2002 (see CRC/C/121), the Committee recommends that the State party:

    - (a) Ensure that all children with disabilities, particularly girls, have access to education by increasing spending and expanding special education programmes, including non-formal special education in rural areas, and by training teachers in mainstream education about special needs;
    - (b) Register and monitor all special schools run by non-State actors;

...

269. The Committee is encouraged by the education reforms initiated by the State party in

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

1999, which focus on improving the quality of education and also emphasize early childhood development. At the same time, the Committee is concerned that all principals, teachers and parents, particularly in rural areas, are not fully aware of the objective of these reforms, that their implementation is not uniform across all regions and that there is no mechanism for monitoring and evaluating their implementation.

270. In light of articles 28, 29 and 31 of the Convention, as well as general comment No. 1 on the aims of education, the Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Ensure that primary education is in fact free and compulsory for all children;
- (b) Provide additional information on the reforms and adequate material resources for their implementation to principals, teachers and parents in rural and conflict-affected areas;
- (c) Establish a participatory mechanism for monitoring and evaluating the implementation of the education reforms which involves principals, teachers, parents and students;
- (d) Ensure that there is a sufficient number of trained teachers in rural and conflict-affected areas;
- (e) Include human rights education as part of the curriculum.

271. Almost 20 years of civil conflict has had an extremely negative impact on the implementation of the Convention in the State party. While recognizing that children will greatly benefit from the peace process, the Committee is concerned that during the transition to peace and the reconstruction process, children who have been affected by the conflict remain a particularly vulnerable group.

272. The Committee recommends that the State party implement the plan of action for the respect of the rights of children during the reconstruction process (2003). In particular, the Committee recommends that the State party:

...

- (c) Take effective measures to ensure that children affected by conflict can be reintegrated into the education system, including through the provision of non-formal education programmes and by prioritizing the rehabilitation of school buildings and facilities and the provision of water, sanitation and electricity in conflict-affected areas;

...

277. The Committee recommends that the State party continue its efforts to eliminate child labour, in particular by addressing the root causes of child economic exploitation through poverty eradication and access to education, as well as by developing a comprehensive child labour monitoring system in collaboration with NGOs [non-governmental organizations], community-based organizations, law enforcement personnel, labour inspectors and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

ILO/IPEC.

- Solomon Islands, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 58 at paras. 302-305, 321, 322, 329-332, 335 and 336.

302. The Committee is concerned at the many inconsistencies in the minimum ages used in various areas of the law, and notes in particular that:

...

(d) As education is not compulsory, ages for admission to and completion of primary education have not been set.

303. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(d) Set ages for admission to and completion of compulsory primary education.

304. The Committee is concerned that:

(a) There continues to be widespread discrimination against women and girls and that girls are underrepresented in schools;

(b) The principle of non-discrimination is not adequately implemented for children of some ethnic minorities and of economically disadvantaged households, children living in remote islands, children born out of wedlock and children with disabilities, especially with regard to their access to adequate health care and educational facilities.

305. The Committee recommends that the State party monitor the situation of children, in particular those belonging to the above-mentioned vulnerable groups, who are exposed to discrimination and develop, on the basis of the results of this monitoring, comprehensive strategies containing specific and well-targeted actions aimed at eliminating all forms of discrimination.

...

321. The Committee is encouraged by the introduction of the Community-based Rehabilitation Programme. However, it is concerned that:

...

(b) Children with disabilities have no access to education;

...

322. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(b) In light of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96) and the Committee's recommendations adopted at its day of general discussion on the issue of "The rights of children with disabilities" (CRC/C/69, paras. 310-339), further encourage their integration into the regular educational system and inclusion into society, including by providing special training to teachers and by making schools more accessible;

...

329. The Committee is concerned that:

(a) Some schools have remained closed for several weeks in the recent past due to non-payment of teachers' salaries;

(b) Primary education is neither free nor compulsory;

(c) At least 20-25 per cent of school-age children are not in primary school and an estimated 30 per cent drop out before completing primary school;

(d) There are wide disparities among the islands in terms of the quality of education and its coverage;

(e) Enrolment of girls remains very low.

330. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Allocate the necessary funds to schools in order to avoid disruption of schooling;

(b) Ensure, as a priority, that primary education is made compulsory and free to all;

(c) Undertake a study on school dropout and find appropriate measures to address this problem;

(d) Develop strategies to make education accessible to girls and to address their low enrolment rates;

(e) Ensure that education is oriented towards the aims mentioned in article 29(1) of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education and that human rights education, including children's rights, is included in the school curricula, with technical assistance from international organizations, notably UNESCO;

(f) Implement its intention to establish vocational schools and develop more programmes to facilitate the transition to the labour market, in accordance with international standards.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

331. The Committee is concerned that a large number of children have been displaced during the recent armed conflict.

332. The Committee urges the State party to make every effort to protect the civilian population from displacement, giving particular attention to the situation of unaccompanied children and the need for effective family tracing and reunification. The Committee also urges the State party to ensure that all displaced children and their families have access to essential health and education services and to consider the need for continued access to such services during the often slow process of return to communities of origin...

...

335. The Committee is concerned that:

...

(c) The prevalence of child labour prevents many children from attending school.

336. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Make every effort, including taking preventive measures, to ensure that those children who do work do so in accordance with international standards, do not work under conditions which are harmful to them, receive appropriate wages and other work-related benefits and continue to have access to formal education;

...

- Jamaica, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 86 at paras. 442 and 443.

442. The Committee welcomes the State party's progress in the field of education, but remains concerned about:

(a) The effectiveness of measures taken to implement the child's right to education and leisure activities in accordance with article 28, 29 and 31 of the Convention, particularly in view of the inadequacy of budget allocations;

(b) The inadequate supervision of the quality of pre-schools and primary schools and the lack of appropriate material and qualified teachers;

(c) The equality of access to education, in particular concerning boys and children from poor families;

(d) The high illiteracy rates and the poor results in regional examinations, as well as low attendance, high dropout and high repetition rates;

(e) The use of corporal punishment in schools.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

443. The Committee recommends that the State party, in the light of the Committee's general comment No. 1 on article 29 (1) of the Convention (aims of education):

(a) Carefully examine the budget allocations and measures taken within the field, with regard to their impact on the progressive implementation of the child's right to education and leisure activities;

(b) Intensify its efforts to improve the quality of education and management of schools and continue its current efforts to address problems with regard to the standards of teaching materials and training of staff;

(c) Seek to further implement participatory measures to encourage children, especially boys, to stay in school during the period of compulsory education; take further measures to facilitate the accessibility to education of children from all groups in society, particularly children from poor backgrounds, including reviewing the system of school fees; and make every effort to raise awareness in society of the importance of education for all children;

(d) Take additional steps, including non-formal measures, to address the high illiteracy rates and the poor results in national examinations; take measures to increase school attendance and reduce the high dropout and repetition rates; and give appropriate assistance to adolescents who are in the process of transition from school to work;

(e) Adopt appropriate legislative measures to combat the use of corporal punishment in the schools;

(f) Seek further technical assistance from, among others, UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Morocco, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 100 at paras. 508 and 509.

508. The Committee...welcomes the efforts undertaken by the State party...through the Five-Year Development Plan, as well as through the National Programme for Education and Human Rights launched in 1994, and the programme of cooperation with UNICEF to increase the school enrolment of girls (1997-2001), but remains concerned at the high illiteracy rate, notably among women. In addition, the Committee is concerned at the high dropout and repetition rates, gender and regional disparities in the education system, the cost of primary education (supplies, textbooks, etc.) and the decreasing enrolment in early childhood education. The Committee is further concerned at the decrease in the portion of the national budget allocated to education; at the living conditions of teachers, which affect the quality of education; and at the difficulties faced by the vocational training system (report, para. 518).

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

509. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Progressively ensure that girls and boys, from urban, rural and least developed areas, all have equal access to educational opportunities, without any financial obstacles;
- (b) Take the necessary measures, including the allocation of adequate financial, human and technical resources, to ensure better internal efficiency in the management of education, taking into account general comment No. 1 on article 29 (1) (aims of education);
- (c) Pursue its efforts to introduce human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula, as foreseen in the National Programme for Education and Human Rights;
- (d) Seek to implement additional measures to promote early childhood education and to encourage children to stay in school, and adopt effective measures to reduce illiteracy rates;
- (e) Continue cooperation with UNESCO and UNICEF in improving the education sector.

- Syrian Arab Republic, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 116 at paras. 570-573.

570. The Committee is concerned that:

- (a) A high percentage of pupils drop out of primary and secondary school, especially children in rural areas and girls;
- (b) Many schools lack textbooks and teaching materials.

571. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Strengthen initiatives to stem the problem of school dropout at primary and secondary levels, especially in rural areas and by girls, by addressing issues such as inadequate sanitation in school buildings, early marriages, in direct costs of attending school and the lack of school transportation;
- (b) Undertake greater efforts to allocate the required resources to ensure the provision of learning materials and supplies.

572. The Committee notes the adoption of the Global Education Initiative to improve the quality of basic education and that some efforts have been undertaken towards curriculum reform. Nevertheless, it remains concerned that the aims of education presented in the report do not adequately reflect the aims outlined in article 29 of the Convention and, in particular, that:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(a) The system of public education continues to emphasize rote learning rather than analytical skills development, and is not child-centred;

(b) The development and respect for human rights, tolerance and equality of the sexes and religious and ethnic minorities are not explicitly part of the curriculum.

573. The Committee recommends that the State party, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education:

(a) Undertake a process of curriculum and teaching methodology reform - with the full participation of children - which stresses the importance of critical thinking and problem-solving skills development;

(b) Direct education towards the development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential;

(c) Include human rights education, including children's rights, in school curricula, particularly with respect to the development of and respect for human rights, tolerance and equality of the sexes and of religious and ethnic minorities. Religious leaders must be mobilized in this regard;

(d) Seek assistance from, among others, UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Kazakhstan, CRC, CRC/C/132 (2003) 129 at paras. 642 and 643.

642. The Committee welcomes the efforts taken by the State party to improve the education system with the introduction of the Education Act 1999 which includes such aims as ensuring compulsory secondary education for all children of school age, providing free textbooks to vulnerable children and compulsory pre-school attendance. The Committee remains concerned at the many difficulties education is facing, *inter alia*:

(a) The increase in the cost of education which limits access by children from economically disadvantaged households and rural areas;

(b) The decrease in the number of pre-schools;

(c) The increasing dropout rates in secondary and vocational education;

(d) Important regional disparities in the number of educational establishments and in the quality of education, with rural areas being at particular disadvantage;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(e) The implementation of education reforms without the necessary preliminary preparation and training of teachers.

643. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Ensure the availability of free primary education and accessibility for all children in the State party, giving particular attention to children in rural communities, children from minorities, including repatriates and refugees or asylum-seekers, children from disadvantaged groups and those who need special attention, and high-quality education, including in children's own languages;

(b) Further pursue efforts to increase the number of pre-school establishments and encourage pre-school attendance, including by providing appropriate financial resources;

(c) Ensure that legislation with regard to compulsory education is enforced, including through the provision of appropriate resources for that purpose;

(d) Ensure that educational reforms are implemented with sufficient preparation and support to schools, including appropriate funding and teacher training, and establish a process for quality evaluation of the new programmes;

...

- Canada, CRC, CRC/C/133 (2003) 14 at paras. 94 and 95.

94. The Committee values the exemplary literacy rates and high level of basic education in the State party and welcomes the numerous initiatives to promote quality education, both in Canada and at the international level. The Committee is in particular encouraged by initiatives to raise the standard of education of Aboriginals living on reserves. It further notes the steps taken to address the concern of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (E/C.12/1/Add.31, para. 49) relating to addressing financial obstacles to post-secondary education for low-income students. The Committee nevertheless reiterates the concern of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (A/57/18, para. 337) about allegations that children of migrants with no status are being excluded from school in some provinces. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned about the reduction in education spending, increasing student-teacher ratios, the reduction of the number of school boards, the high dropout rate of Aboriginal children and the availability of instruction in both official languages only "where numbers warrant".

95. The Committee recommends that the State party further improve the quality of education throughout the State party in order to achieve the goals of article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education by,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

*inter alia:*

- (a) Ensuring that free quality primary education that is sensitive to the cultural identity of every child is available and accessible to all children, with particular attention to children in rural communities, Aboriginal children and refugees or asylum-seekers, as well as children from other disadvantaged groups and those who need special attention, including in their own language;
  - (b) Ensuring that human rights education, including in children's rights, is incorporated into the school curricula in the different languages of instruction, where applicable, and that teachers have the necessary training;
  - (c) Ratifying the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization Convention against Discrimination in Education of 1960;
  - (d) Adopting appropriate legislative measures to forbid the use of any form of corporal punishment in schools and encouraging child participation in discussions about disciplinary measures.
- New Zealand, CRC, CRC/C/133 (2003) 34 at paras. 155 and 156.

155. The Committee welcomes the development of bilingual education for Maori; however, it notes with concern the persistent disparities in enrolment and dropout rates among children of different ethnic groups. The Committee is also concerned that the policy on exclusions, as well as increasing hidden costs of education are limiting access to education, particularly for Maori children, pregnant girls, children with special educational needs, lower-income families, non-citizens and new immigrants.

156. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Ensure that all children in the State party have access to free primary education;
- (b) Enforce legislation on compulsory education and prohibit exclusions on arbitrary grounds such as pregnancy, and ensure that students of the age of compulsory education who have legitimately been excluded from a school are enrolled elsewhere;
- (c) Take effective measures to address disparities in enrolment and dropout rates between ethnic groups, including by strengthening programmes for bilingual education;
- (d) Take all necessary measures, including the provision of quality counselling programmes in schools, to address behavioural problems of students while respecting their right to

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

privacy.

- Pakistan, CRC, CRC/C/133 (2003) 37 at paras. 226, 227, 229 and 230.

226. The Committee welcomes the measures taken to increase the attendance of girls at schools and the information that a national “Compulsory Primary Education Ordinance” has been promulgated (March 2002), and also notes the modest improvement in the gross primary enrolment rate. However, the Committee remains deeply concerned that:

- (a) The public expenditure on education (as a percentage of the gross domestic product) in the State party is extremely low and has been sinking in recent years;
- (b) The considerable amounts of international aid invested in the State party for the purpose of promoting education have not been used in an efficient or adequate way;
- (c) School enrolment and literacy rates are very low;
- (d) Dropout rates are very high and secondary education enrolment rates have decreased;
- (e) Gender and geographical disparities remain very high;
- (f) The quality of education is poor;
- (g) The code of conduct for teachers does not prohibit corporal punishment, nor does it deal with the problem of violence against children in school.

227. The Committee is very concerned about reports of violence and sexual abuse within madrasas, as well as the narrow content of the education provided within these schools. In this regard, the Committee notes with appreciation the initiatives by the State party to streamline the education given in madrasas so that it is more compatible with regular public education, and to eradicate violence against children.

...

229. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Ensure that primary education is free and compulsory for all children;
- (b) Abolish the age limit that prohibits access to primary education after age 12;
- (c) Ensure, as a matter of urgency, that adequate resources are allocated for education, in particular for improving the quality of and access to education;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (d) Continue and strengthen its efforts to ensure that all children have equal access to educational opportunities, with a view to eliminating the prevailing disparities between girls and boys as well as between urban and rural areas;
- (e) Identify the causes of the high school dropout rate and strengthen the measures taken to address this problem;
- (f) Take measures to improve the quality of education, including non-formal education, *inter alia* by strengthening the current training of teachers, by ensuring that schools are adequately equipped and by introducing a monitoring system for the attainment of the education targets;
- (g) Allocate resources to hire new teachers in order to improve the teacher/student ratio, especially in primary schools;
- (h) Introduce, strengthen and systemize human rights education, including on the rights of the child, in school curricula, beginning in primary school;
- (i) Take proactive measures to eliminate violence against children in schools, notably by including in the code of conduct for teachers the prohibition of corporal punishment and by limiting the role of school counsellors to those functions that help the pupil and revoking their disciplinary functions.

230. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Ensure the protection of children from maltreatment within madrasas through the establishment of an adequate monitoring mechanism;
- (b) Continue and strengthen its planned reform of madrasas, with a view to broadening the scope of the education given in madrasas;
- (c) Take effective measures to ensure that children below the age of 18 years are not involved in hostilities and to protect children from forced recruitment.

- Brunei Darussalam, CRC, CRC/C/133 (2003) 73 at paras. 373 and 374.

373. The Committee notes the very good education indicators, the broad scope of education in schools, encompassing a development-oriented co-curriculum besides the academic curriculum, and the intention to incorporate the Convention into school curricula, but remains concerned that:

- (a) Education is not compulsory;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(b) Insufficient services are provided for children with learning difficulties.

374. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Ensure that primary education is made compulsory by law;

(b) Taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education, include human rights education, including about children's rights, in the curricula, particularly with respect to the development of and respect for human rights, tolerance and equality of the sexes and religious and ethnic minorities;

(c) Further develop services for children with learning difficulties;

(d) Seek assistance from UNESCO.

- Singapore, CRC, CRC/C/133 (2003) 84 at paras. 423-426.

423. While noting that special education services are widely available in the State party, the Committee is concerned that children with disabilities are not fully integrated into the education system...

424. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Extend the Compulsory Education Act (2003) to include special schools and all children with disabilities;

(b) Facilitate greater integration and participation of children with disabilities into mainstream education and society at large, *inter alia* through an improvement in curricula and pedagogical services;

...

425. ...[T]he Committee welcomes the adoption of the Compulsory Education Act in 2003 and the wide availability of high-quality education services in the State party. However, the Committee is concerned that not all children within the State party's jurisdiction are covered by the Compulsory Education Act or have access to free primary school. The Committee is also concerned that the highly competitive nature of the education system risks hampering the development of the child to his or her fullest potential. Finally, the Committee is concerned about the monitoring of the quality of services provided by student care centres.

426. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Extend the Compulsory Education Act to include all children within the State party,



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

including non-citizens, and monitor the implementation of the Act to ensure that all children attend school;

(b) Ensure that all children in the State party have access to free primary education, and ensure that low-income families have access to pre-primary education;

(c) Undertake effective measures to reduce school-related stress and the competitiveness of the school system and strengthen efforts to promote the development of children's personality, talents and abilities to their fullest potential, including through the promotion of cultural life and the arts and play and recreational activities in schools;

(d) Undertake measures to ensure comprehensive monitoring of the quality of student care centres and any other organizations providing care before and after school;

(e) Include human rights education as part of the curriculum.

- Bangladesh, CRC, CRC/C/133 (2003) 93 at paras. 495-500.

495. The Committee welcomes the progress made by the State party in the field of education, notably with regard to increases in primary and secondary enrolments, the reduction in gender disparities in enrolment and improvement in the literacy rates. The Committee also notes with great appreciation the abolition of tuition fees for primary schools and the establishment of a Tk 500 million stipend programme, of the "food for education" programme, and the pilot project on early childhood education. However, the Committee is concerned that challenges remain in the above-mentioned areas, that free compulsory education ends after grade 5, that the school dropout rate is high and that gender-based discrimination persists within schools. Other concerns include reports of abuse and sexual molestation, especially of girls, inaccessibility to schools, inadequate sanitation and the misuse of allocated resources.

496. The Committee notes with appreciation the efforts made by the State party to monitor the quality of education in the madrasas. However, it is concerned about the narrow content of the education provided within these schools.

497. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take effective measures to raise the maximum age of compulsory education, and to increase enrolment rates through, *inter alia*, raising awareness of the importance of education and taking measures to improve the provision and quality of education;

(b) Continue to address gender-based discrimination and other difficulties encountered by

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

girls within the educational system and school environment;

(c) Monitor and evaluate existing programmes on early childhood education and development, and extend services, especially parenting education and education for caregivers to all regions;

(d) Provide appropriate sanitation facilities, especially for females, in all schools;

(e) Provide appropriate training for teachers in order to create a more child-friendly school environment;

(f) Encourage the participation of children at all levels of school life;

(g) Seek assistance from UNICEF, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization and relevant NGOs.

498. The Committee also recommends that the State party continue and strengthen its efforts to streamline the education given in the madrasas to ensure more compatibility with formal public education.

499. The Committee is very concerned about the difficult conditions under which some refugee children, especially children belonging to the Rohingya population from Myanmar, are living, and that many of these children and their families do not have access to legal procedures that could grant them legal status...

500. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) In collaboration with and with support from international agencies, undertake effective measures to improve the living conditions of refugee families and children, particularly with regard to educational and health-care services;

(d) Provide unaccompanied refugee children with adequate care, education and protection;

...

- Georgia, CRC, CRC/C/133 (2003) 111 at paras. 527, 528, 570 and 571.

527. The Committee is deeply concerned at the very low budget allocation for the implementation of the Convention, noting particularly the constant decrease in public expenditure on health and education which is now at a very low level despite the reasonably high level of economic growth (5.2 per cent in 2002). The Committee reiterates in this regard its concern at the very poor system of tax collection and, although acknowledging the

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

efforts of the State party to address corruption, at the still widespread corruption.

528. The Committee reiterates its previous recommendation to the State party to significantly improve the effectiveness of its tax collection system and urges the State party to substantially increase the budget allocation and ensure transparency of the use of funds for the implementation of the Convention, in particular in the areas of health and education, and strengthen its efforts to eliminate corruption.

...

570. The Committee welcomes the cooperation of the Ministry of Education with international organizations and NGOs and is encouraged by the educational reform being implemented and the significant support received, allowing secondary education to be provided free of charge. The Committee is, however, concerned at the decline in public expenditure on education and the existence of a system of informal payments whereby much of the budget of educational institutions is funded by households. It is also concerned at the lack of data on repetitions, expulsions and dropout rates. Furthermore, it is concerned that education is provided to mentally and physically disabled persons only in residential institutions, and that their number has significantly increased from 1997 to 2000, despite the general decline in the population.

571. The Committee urges the State party, taking into account its general comment No. 1 on the aims of education, pursue its efforts to ensure that all children enjoy the right to education consistent with articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, and that children with disabilities are integrated into the mainstream education in keeping with article 3 of the Convention. It encourages the State party to increase the level of public expenditure on compulsory education and to take measures to put an end to the participation of households in the so-called "school funds", which may limit the attendance at schools of the most vulnerable children...

- Indonesia, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 8 at paras. 80-84, 86 and 92.

80. The Committee welcomes the inclusion in the Constitution of the right to education as well as a minimum budget allocation for education. It is further encouraged by education reforms initiated by the State party in 1994, which raised the number of years of elementary education from six to nine and which tries to raise teaching standards. The Committee further welcomes the awarding of scholarships to children from poor families.

81. However, the Committee is very concerned:

- (a) That education is not free, even at primary level, and that higher education is not affordable for many families;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (b) At the high dropout and repeat rates;
- (c) That married children and pregnant teenagers do not generally continue their education;
- (d) At the high teacher-pupil ratio and the low level of ability of teachers;
- (e) At the high incidence of violence against children in the schools, including bullying and fighting among students, and that no specific law exists to regulate school discipline and protect children against violence and abuse in the school.

82. The Committee notes with appreciation the efforts by the State party to monitor the quality of education in *madrasas* and boarding schools. However, it is concerned about the narrow education provided in these schools and about the lack of supervision of their curricula.

83. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Strengthen measures to achieve universal and free primary education;
- (b) Progressively ensure that girls and boys, from urban, rural and least developed areas, have equal access to educational opportunities, without any financial obstacles;
- (c) Implement additional measures to provide access to early childhood education for every child;
- (d) Adopt effective measures to decrease the dropout, repeat and illiteracy rates;
- (e) Provide education opportunities for married children and pregnant teenagers;
- (f) Pursue its efforts to ensure that teachers are adequately trained;
- (g) Take appropriate measures to introduce human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;
- (h) Take measures to reduce violence in the schools;
- (i) Continue its cooperation with UNESCO, UNICEF, the Asian Development Bank and the civil society to improve the education sector.

84. The Committee recommends that the State party continue and strengthen its efforts to streamline the education given in *madrasas* and boarding schools in order to ensure that they are more compatible with regular public education and establish a stronger monitoring

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

system for ensuring quality education.

...

86. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take immediate steps to ensure that all displaced and refugee children and their families have access to basic health and education services, and that all their rights contained in the Convention are protected, including the right to be registered at birth;

...

92. The Committee recommends that the State party develop a comprehensive policy and programme for implementing the rights of children who have been affected by conflict. In particular, the Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Take effective measures to ensure that children affected by conflict can be reintegrated into the education system, including through the provision of non-formal education programmes and by prioritizing the rehabilitation of school buildings and facilities and the provision of water, sanitation and electricity in conflict-affected areas;

...

(d) Provide alternatives to military recruitment, including by increasing employment and education opportunities, particularly for vulnerable children in refugee diaspora and tribal areas.

- Guyana, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 26 at paras. 121, 162 and 163.

121. The Committee welcomes the increase of enrolment in early childhood and primary education. The Committee also appreciates the high quality of the Escuela Nueva model.

...

162. The Committee notes the State party's efforts to increase enrolment rates at both primary and secondary schools and the programme established to bring dropout children back into educational settings. However, the Committee remains concerned at the high dropout rates, especially among boys, which are influenced by the economic situation of the families. The Committee is also concerned at the decrease in the quality of education, teacher availability and training and at the widening of educational disparities in the hinterland regions.

163. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Continue to strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment rates in primary and secondary education and to further increase attempts to bring dropouts back to school and other training programmes;

(b) Ensure that pregnant teenagers are given an opportunity to complete their education;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (c) Develop and use indicators for quality education, especially in the hinterland regions;
- (d) Include human rights education as part of the curriculum.

- Armenia, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 36 at paras. 231 and 232.

231. The Committee notes with satisfaction the adoption of a State programme for the development of education over the period 2001-2005, centred on raising the level of education and broadening the involvement of children in the system. The Committee also welcomes the announced increase in funds allocated to education in the budget for 2004-2006 and the provision of school supplies to poor children under the programme “When September Comes”. However, it is concerned that budget allocations to the education sector remain low and that public underfinancing has led to an increase in user payment, despite the fact that citizens are guaranteed free primary and secondary education under Armenian law. The Committee reiterates in this regard its concern that low wages have forced teachers to offer private tuition, creating a two-tier system of education. The Committee is also concerned about the low rate of early childhood education and the high rates of non-attendance, absenteeism and dropout in primary and secondary education. Moreover, in line with the concluding observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD/C/61/CO/1), the Committee expresses its concern about the inadequate access by minority children to education in their mother tongue.

232. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Allocate the required resources (human, technical and financial) to ensure access to quality education for all children, including the most vulnerable groups;
- (b) Develop indicators for quality education and ensure that the quality of education is monitored and guaranteed;
- (c) Continue efforts to remove obstacles to school attendance at all levels in order to keep all children in school and provide programmes that bring dropout students back in school or offer them other appropriate educational/vocational programmes;
- (d) Direct greater efforts to improving the quality of teacher training programmes, and improving the school environment;
- (e) Ensure, whenever possible, that children belonging to minority groups have access to education in their mother tongue;
- (f) Seek assistance from, among others, UNICEF, the United Nations Educational, Scientific

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

and Cultural Organization and relevant international NGOs.

- Germany, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 51 at paras. 303 and 304.

303. The Committee notes that decentralized education may lead to some disparities in the implementation of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention. In addition, the Committee is concerned at the lack of adequate services for the education of children with learning difficulties.

304. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take all necessary measures, especially through the Federal Government-Länder Commission for Educational Planning and the Promotion of Research (BLK) and with the participation of civil society, to ensure that articles 28 and 29 of the Convention are fully implemented throughout the Länder;

...

(c) Further develop services for children with learning difficulties;

(d) Introduce in all schools programmes for civic education.

- The Netherlands (Netherlands and Aruba), CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 63 at paras. 327, 328, 345, 346, 360, 361 and 364-369.

327. ...[T]he Committee is concerned that some domestic legislation in the Netherlands and in Aruba does not yet fully conform with the principles and provisions of the Convention, *inter alia*, with regard to education in minority languages and juvenile justice as well as compulsory education in Aruba.

328. The Committee recommends that the State party take all necessary measures to ensure that its domestic legislation in the Netherlands and in Aruba conforms fully with the principles and provisions of the Convention, in particular with regard to education in minority languages, juvenile justice as well as compulsory education in Aruba.

...

345. The Committee notes the significant efforts made by the State party to address racial discrimination, which have also been recognized in detail by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination in its concluding observations (CERD/C/304/Add.104) on the thirteenth and fourteenth periodic reports of the Netherlands. However, the Committee is concerned that societal prejudices and discrimination persist in society, in particular, against children of ethnic minorities and refugee and asylum-seeking children, and that in some localities and schools in the Netherlands there is *de facto* segregation

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

between ethnically Dutch families and families of foreign origin...

346. The Committee recommends that the State party increase its efforts to ensure the implementation of existing laws guaranteeing the principle of non-discrimination and full compliance with article 2 of the Convention, and to adopt a proactive and comprehensive strategy to eliminate discrimination on any grounds and against all vulnerable groups. The Committee requests the State party to pay particular attention to eliminating negative stereotype of refugee and asylum-seeking children in the Netherlands and to address the root causes of *de facto* segregation in schools and localities. It further recommends that the State party ensure that children of migrant families in Aruba have equal access to education, health and other services and that there is legislation to protect children with disabilities against discrimination.

...

360. The Committee welcomes the continuing efforts to integrate children with disabilities into the mainstream education system, in particular in the Netherlands. However, it is concerned that children with disabilities in the Netherlands spend a significant amount of time waiting to access services and programmes...

361. In keeping with the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96 of 20 December 1993), the Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to integrate children with disabilities into mainstream education and everyday life by:

...

(b) Expanding education possibilities for children with disabilities in Aruba, including those with learning disabilities, at the secondary school level;

(c) Improving the physical accessibility of mainstream schools, leisure and recreational facilities, and other public buildings and spaces in Aruba;

...

364. The Committee is concerned...that in Aruba there are limited services for teenage mothers, who are sometimes excluded from schools.

365. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(d) Provide teenage mothers in Aruba with the appropriate assistance and ensure that they can finish their education.

366. The Committee notes the information provided by the delegation that efforts will be strengthened in the Netherlands and Aruba to prevent and assist school dropouts and the intention to expand bilingual education (Papiemento and Dutch) to secondary schools in Aruba. However, the Committee is concerned that primary education is not compulsory in Aruba and that early childhood education is not universally available throughout the State



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

party.

367. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Expedite efforts to address non-attendance and the dropping out of school;
- (b) Ensure that affordable and quality early childhood education is available for all children;
- (c) In Aruba, expedite the adoption of the National Ordinance on Compulsory Education and ensure that it is enforced, including for children of undocumented migrants;
- (d) In Aruba, ensure that sufficient teaching materials are available in Papiementu for primary and secondary students;
- (e) Include human rights education in the curriculum in both the Netherlands and Aruba.

368. The Committee is concerned that in the Netherlands the definition of an unaccompanied minor seeking asylum does not conform to international standards and may make access to basic services more difficult for the child while in the country... Finally, the Committee is concerned that children whose applications for refugee status have been rejected are detained in closed camps with limited possibilities for education and leisure activities...

369. The Committee recommends that the State party in the Netherlands:

...

(d) Ensure that the detention of children whose applications for refugee status have been rejected is used only as a measure of last resort, and that all children awaiting expulsion receive adequate education and housing.

- India, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 75 at paras. 381, 407, 408, 442 and 443.

381. The Committee welcomes the many activities undertaken at the federal and State level for the implementation of the Convention, *inter alia*:

(a) The adoption of the Constitution (86th Amendment) Act, 2002 providing for free and compulsory education to all children 6-14 years old;

...

407. The Committee welcomes the National Plan of Action for the Girl Child and the Platform for Action, but is deeply concerned at the persistence of discriminatory social attitudes and harmful traditional practices towards girls, including low school enrolment and high dropout rates, early and forced marriages, and religion-based personal status laws that

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

perpetuate gender inequality in areas such as marriage, divorce, custody and guardianship of infants, and inheritance.

408. The Committee urges the State party to take all necessary measures for the implementation of the National Plan of Action for the Girl Child and encourages the enforcement of protective laws. The Committee also encourages the State party to continue its efforts to carry out comprehensive public education campaigns to prevent and combat gender discrimination, particularly within the family. Political, religious and community leaders should be mobilized to support efforts to eradicate harmful traditional practices and attitudes which still discriminate against girls.

...

442. The Committee welcomes the adoption of the Constitution (86th Amendment) Act, 2002 providing for free and compulsory education for all children aged 6-14, the continued efforts of the State party to increase girls' enrolment in school and the Midday Meal Scheme. While noting an increased enrolment rate, the Committee is seriously concerned that 60 million children do not attend primary school. The Committee is further concerned at the high, although decreasing, level of illiteracy and the striking disparities in terms of access to education, attendance at primary and secondary school and dropout rates between boys and girls. The Committee is also concerned that striking disparities regarding these rates also exist between different states, between rural and urban areas, and between the affluent and the poor and disadvantaged groups. The Committee is further concerned at the insufficient number of trained teachers, schools and classrooms, and the lack of relevant learning material, which affect the quality of education.

443. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Improve the education system with a view to achieving the aims mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1 of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education, and introduce human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;

(b) Strengthen its efforts to progressively ensure that that all girls and boys, in urban, rural and least developed areas and children belonging to Scheduled Castes and Tribes, have equal access to educational opportunities;

(c) Raise awareness of the importance of early childhood education and introduce it into the general framework of education;

(d) Encourage the participation of children at all levels of school life;

(e) Take the necessary measures to improve the quality of education and to ensure better efficiency in the management of education, including by decreasing the dropout rate;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (f) Hire more qualified teachers and provide them with more opportunities for training;
- (g) Take all necessary measures to curb teachers' absenteeism;
- (h) Build better infrastructure for schools; and
- (i) Seek assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Papua New Guinea, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 94 at paras. 516 and 517.

516. The Committee is encouraged by the State party's efforts to reform its national education system and to address the key issues of participation and quality of education. It notes that a community-based education would attract children from school-distant groups into educational institution settings. However, it is concerned that enrolment, literacy and retention rates are still low, particularly in primary education, and that there is a significant disparity between the number of boys and girls in school. The Committee is also concerned that, as education is not compulsory nor free, ages for admission to and completion of primary education have not been set.

517. The Committee recommends that the State party continue to strengthen its efforts to complete the reform of its national education system and in particular to strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment and retention rates in primary and basic education, in particular for girls. The Committee also recommends that the State party set ages for admission to and completion of compulsory and free primary education and include human rights education as part of the curriculum.

- Slovenia, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 104 at paras. 553, 554, 573 and 574.

553. While taking note of the various programmes aiming at improving the position of the Roma, the Committee is concerned that prejudices and discrimination against the Roma and other minorities in the State party, including Serbs, Bosniacs, Albanians and Croats, remain widespread... Furthermore, while welcoming measures taken to facilitate the integration of Roma children into regular primary schools, the Committee is concerned at the high number of Roma children attending classes for children with special needs.

554. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to combat negative stereotypes of and discrimination against Roma children and children belonging to other minorities in the State party. Furthermore, the Committee recommends that the State party take further measures to improve the standard of living of Roma children and ensure that all these children are integrated into mainstream education, so that special assistance and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

support for Roma children can be provided at regular classes...

...

573. The Committee notes with concern that implementing measures based on the Law on Guiding Children with Special Needs, adopted in 2000, have still not been adopted and that, as a consequence, children with disabilities who are not enrolled in special institutions cannot take advantage of programmes provided for in the law. It is also concerned about the low enrolment of female children with disabilities in school.

574. In light of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96) and the Committee's recommendations adopted at its day of general discussion on "The rights of children with disabilities" (CRC/C/69, paras. 310-339), the Committee encourages the State party to ensure the expeditious adoption of implementing measures concerning the Law on Guiding Children with Special Needs, and to address the low enrolment of female children with disabilities in school.

- Japan, CRC, CRC/C/137 (2004) 116 at paras. 651 and 652.

651. The Committee notes the State party's efforts to reform the education system and bring it into greater conformity with the Convention; however, it is concerned that:

(a) The excessively competitive nature of the education system has a negative effect on the children's physical and mental health and hampers the development of the child to his or her fullest potential;

(b) Excessive competition for entry into higher education means that public school education must be supplemented by private tutoring, which is not affordable for children from poorer families;

(c) Communication and cooperation between parents and teachers with regard to children's problems and conflicts at schools is very limited;

(d) Although eligibility criteria have been broadened for graduates from foreign schools in Japan applying to university, some continue to be denied access to higher education;

(e) Night schools in the Tokyo metropolitan area, which offer flexible education opportunities, in particular for dropouts, are being closed down;

(f) Children of minorities have very limited opportunities for education in their own language;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(g) Despite review procedures, some history textbooks are incomplete or one-sided.

652. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Taking into account the views of students, parents and relevant non-governmental organizations, review the curriculum with a view to reducing the competitiveness of the school system while maintaining a high level of quality of education so as to ensure that all students graduating from high school have equal access to higher education;

(b) Develop measures, in collaboration with students and parents, to effectively address problems and conflicts in schools, in particular violence, including bullying;

(c) Encourage the Tokyo authorities to reconsider the closing down of night schools, and to expand alternative forms of education;

(d) Expand opportunities for children from minority groups to enjoy their own culture, profess or practise their own religion and use their own language;

(e) Strengthen review procedures for textbooks to ensure that they present a balanced view.

- El Salvador, CRC, CRC/C/140(2004)8 at paras. 79 and 80.

79. The Committee welcomes the progressive increase in elementary education coverage in recent years and the elimination by law, in October 2003, of the so-called voluntary fees, which used to be levied in elementary education. However, it is concerned at persisting gaps between urban and rural areas in coverage and quality of education; high drop-out rates, particularly among rural children; persistent high illiteracy rates among children in rural areas, particularly among girls; and the lack of additional funds allocated for education to address the needs that were previously met by voluntary fees. The Committee is also concerned that pregnant adolescents face discrimination in access to education, that only 40 per cent of students proceed to high school after elementary education and that, despite a gradual increase over the last years, the percentage of children between 4 and 6 attending pre-school education remains low. The lack of access to educational and vocational programmes of juvenile offenders is also a cause for concern.

80. The Committee encourages the State party:

(a) To ensure sufficient funding to ensure free primary education of good quality;

(b) To strengthen efforts to bridge the gaps in coverage and quality of education, including vocational training, throughout the country, giving special attention to promoting education

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

of rural girls;

- (c) To take measures to identify the causes of the high drop-out rate in primary schools, particularly in rural areas, and take steps to address the situation;
- (d) To strengthen non-formal educational and vocational programmes for children who do not attend or complete regular school education;
- (e) To ensure that pregnant adolescents are not prevented from continuing their schooling;
- (f) To ensure that juvenile offenders have access to adequate educational and vocational programmes in detention centres and that teachers who educate juvenile offenders receive adequate specialized training;
- (g) To expand pre-school services with the assistance of communities at the local levels;
- (h) To take steps to increase the quality of teaching methods and provide adequate training to teachers, including on how to handle “learning difficulties” of children;
- (i) To ratify the 1960 UNESCO Convention Against Discrimination in Education.

- Panama, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004) 23 at paras. 144, 145, 156 and 157.

144. While noting the State party’s efforts to improve the educational system and noting with satisfaction the improvements mirrored in education indicators, the Committee remains concerned at the persisting disparities in access to education of vulnerable children, *inter alia*, children living in rural areas, indigenous children and refugee children, who do not have access to adequate education in terms of their cultural values and identity. The Committee is also concerned at the low level of retention and completion, especially among youth in secondary education. The Committee is concerned as well at the low quality of the infrastructure of the educational process.

145. The Committee recommends that the State party allocate financial and human resources in order:

- (a) To put special emphasis on the elimination of illiteracy;
- (b) To promote pre-school, primary and secondary education with a view to universal coverage;
- (c) To pay special attention to the needs of vulnerable children, e.g. girls, indigenous and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

refugee children, working and street children, in order to fulfil their basic right to education;

(d) To upgrade the infrastructure of the educational system (building more schools, improving existing schools, upgrading training, paying teachers an adequate wage, adopting interactive learning methods to fight school dropout and repetition); and

(e) To offer more facilities for non-formal learning and vocational training, including for children who have not completed primary and secondary education.

...

156. The Committee, acknowledging the adoption of the new legislation creating three indigenous *comarcas*, remains concerned that lack of economic resources is an obstacle to developing specific programmes on education, health and social services for indigenous children. The Committee is also concerned about the preservation of the identity of indigenous children since bilingual education remains a challenge in indigenous areas and education lacks resources of all kinds.

157. The Committee recommends that the State party take all necessary measures to ensure that indigenous children enjoy all their rights without discrimination, including equal access to culturally appropriate services including health, education, social services, housing, potable water and sanitation... The Committee also recommends that the State party pay particular attention to guarantee the preservation of the identity of indigenous and Afro-Panamanian children, e.g. by the implementation of the national plan to develop bilingual intercultural education.

- Rwanda, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004) 36 at paras. 219, 220, 234 and 235.

219. The Committee notes the recent agreements signed between the State party and UNHCR for the return of refugees, many of them children, and welcomes the large number of children who have been reunited with their families over the past years. The Committee remains concerned at the poor situation of children and their families who have returned to the State party, notably with regard to access to health services and education...

220. In the light of articles 22 and 39 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party ensure that refugee children who returned to the State party are provided with proper documentation, facilitate family reunification and ensure the right to health and education for all these children...

...

234. The Committee is concerned at the situation of children belonging to minorities, including Batwa children, in particular their limited access to basic social services, including health care, immunization and education, and the violation of their rights to survival and development, to enjoy their own culture and to be protected from discrimination.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

235. In line with its recommendations adopted at its day of general discussion on the rights of indigenous children (CRC/C/133, para. 624), the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Undertake a study to assess the situation and the needs of Batwa children and to elaborate a plan of action involving leaders of the Batwa community to protect the rights of those children and ensure their social services; and

(b) Seek adequate means and measures to ensure birth registration, health care, etc.

- Sao Tome and Principe, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004) 54 at paras. 290 and 291.

290. ...[T]he Committee is very concerned that:

(a) Primary education is not free;

(b) The illiteracy, drop-out and repeaters rates, particularly of girls, are high;

(c) The quality of education is low;

(d) Children in remote areas do not have access to schools;

(e) Due to the system of shifts, the time spent in school per day by children is not long enough.

291. In the light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Undertake further consolidated reforms of the school curricula in order to ensure that they are in conformity with the aims set out in article 29 of the Convention and take into account General Comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education;

(b) Urgently take all necessary measures to achieve universal and free primary education;

(c) Progressively ensure that girls and boys, from urban, rural and least developed areas have equal access to educational opportunities, without any financial obstacles;

(d) Implement additional measures to provide access to early childhood education for every child;

(e) Adopt effective measures to urgently decrease the drop-out rate and to reduce repeaters



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

and illiteracy rates;

(f) Build urgently new schools and classrooms so as to ensure the availability of sufficient schools and classrooms to make the system of shifts unnecessary and to allow children to spend sufficient time in school daily;

(g) Take appropriate measures to introduce human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;

(h) Ensure access to leisure facilities and recreational activities;

(i) Cooperate with, *inter alia*, UNESCO, UNICEF and the civil society to improve the education sector.

- Liberia, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004) 67 at paras. 307, 308, 358 and 359.

307. The armed conflict in the State party caused, *inter alia*, very severe and large-scale violations of the human rights of the children. The State party faces almost overwhelming challenges to rebuild the infrastructures and basic social services necessary for the implementation of the rights of the child... The war led to the destruction of almost all of the schools in the country. In 2004, less than 50 per cent of children were enrolled in primary education... These and other severe challenges for the child's right to life, survival and development should be addressed and require major efforts from the State party for which international assistance is of crucial importance.

308. The Accra Peace Agreement (August 2003), the Disarmament, Demobilization, Rehabilitation and Reintegration programme (DDRR) and the Result-focused Transition Framework (RFTF), elaborated under the auspices of the United Nations and other international organizations, form a good basis and instrument for addressing at least the most urgent matters.

...

358. The Committee welcomes the State party's efforts to rehabilitate the educational system that was massively destroyed by the civil war. It further takes note of the "Back to School" programme that has already brought many children back to school. However, the Committee is concerned about the continuing low rates of enrolment, the significant disparities of enrolment and literacy rates between boys and girls and the overall low quality and hidden costs of education.

359. The Committee recommends the State party:

(a) Prioritize the construction and reconstruction of schools throughout the country and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

improve accessibility for all children, taking into account the needs of children with disabilities;

(b) Progressively ensure that girls and boys from urban and rural areas have equal access to educational opportunities and receive free education without any hidden costs;

(c) Design accelerated learning and vocational training programmes for young people and children who have missed out in educational opportunities;

- Myanmar, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004) 81 at paras. 436, 437 and 439.

436. The Committee welcomes the launching in 2000 of the Special Four-Year Plan for Education (2000/01-2003/04) aimed at promoting the basic education sector, and of the “Education for All” National Action Plan introduced in 2003 which is aimed specifically at the “access, quality and relevance” of education, but is seriously concerned at the following problematic aspects of the existing education system:

(a) The low quality of education reflected in the high repetition and dropout rates, which affect more girls than boys;

(b) The significant variation in school enrolment between urban and rural areas, and the particularly low level of enrolment of children belonging to minority groups;

(c) The limited length of compulsory education, which ends at the fourth grade;

(d) Free primary education is not guaranteed in practice, as parents are required to cover the costs of uniforms, textbooks, stationery and other supplies; and

(e) The majority of schools in Myanmar do not provide a conducive learning environment for children owing to, *inter alia*, the poor conditions of buildings, the poor quality of teaching/learning methodologies and the shortage of qualified teachers.

437. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Improve the quality of the education system with a view to achieving the aims mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and the Committee’s General Comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education;

(b) Introduce human rights, including children’s rights, into the school curricula, starting at the primary level;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(c) Ensure that primary education is free in practice by minimizing all costs borne by parents;

(d) Extend compulsory education to at least the sixth grade;

(e) Strengthen its efforts to progressively ensure that girls as well as boys, from urban, rural and remote areas, and children belonging to minority groups all have equal access to educational opportunities;

(f) Adapt school curriculum to suit the particularities of the local communities, in particular for ethnic minority groups, and make use of local teachers to help children who are experiencing language difficulties;

(g) Take the necessary measures to improve the poor quality of education and to ensure efficiency in the management of education, in particular by significantly increasing the resources allocated to education, hiring more qualified teachers and providing them with more opportunities for training;

(h) Raise awareness of the importance of early childhood education and introduce it into the general framework of education;

(i) In light of article 12, encourage participation by children at all levels of school life;

(j) Build better infrastructure for schools; and

(k) Seek assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO in the implementation of the above.

...

439. In light of articles 7, 22 and other relevant provisions of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Strengthen its efforts to provide adequate assistance to internally displaced children, including their access to food, education and health, and to support the return home of internally displaced populations and their reintegration into their communities;

...

- Dominica, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004)101 at paras. 499, 500, 506 and 507.

499. The Committee takes note of the efforts undertaken by the State party to establish programmes such as the Education Trust Fund and Free Textbooks in order to assist children living in poverty. However, the Committee is concerned at the sustainability of such programmes. Furthermore, the Committee is deeply concerned about the quality of

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

education, access to education by pregnant girls and teenage mothers and the high drop-out rate, in particular among boys.

500. The Committee recommends that the State party, in the light of the Committee's General Comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education:

(a) Carefully examine the budget allocations and measures taken within this field with regard to their impact on the progressive implementation of the child's right to education and leisure activities;

(b) Seek to implement further participatory measures to encourage children, especially boys, to stay in school during the period of compulsory education; take further measures to facilitate the access to education of children from all groups in society, particularly children living in poverty;

(c) Ensure that school attendance officers use child-sensitive means to bring more children to school and take other measures to give children incentives to stay in the educational system;

(d) Provide education opportunities for pregnant girls and teenager mothers so that they can complete their education;

(e) Continue and strengthen the training of young teachers in particular and retain teachers in primary and secondary education;

...

506. The Committee acknowledges the various measures undertaken with regard to the Carib Indian children. However, the Committee is concerned about the limited enjoyment of their rights; particularly with regard to their access to education and health owing to widespread poverty.

507. The Committee recommends that the State party continue and strengthen its efforts to improve the enjoyment of the rights of Carib Indian children, in particular by effective measures to reduce poverty in the Carib Indian Territory.

- Democratic People's Republic of Korea, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004) 111 at paras. 565 and 566.

565. The Committee notes the State party's commitment to free universal education, particularly in the light of its current economic difficulties, and welcomes the information that compulsory education up to the age of 17 is free. However, the Committee remains concerned at the following problematic aspects with regard to education:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (a) Increasing absenteeism and seasonally low attendance rates of 60-80 per cent as a result of the prolonged economic hardship;
- (b) Hidden costs for parents, which constitute a serious burden in sending children to schools;
- (c) The quality of education, which requires further improvement;
- (d) That political background, opinions and activities can have an influence on admission to higher education;
- (e) That aims of education as stipulated in article 29 of the Convention are not at the centre of the learning process;
- (f) Human rights, including child rights, are not fully integrated into the school curricula, but only constitutes a part of “Virtue and Law” courses.

566. The Committee welcomes the recent efforts of the State party to increase the quality of its education system and encourages that these efforts be pursued. It also recommends that the State party:

- (a) Take measures to prevent and reduce absenteeism, including by providing adequate heating of school buildings in wintertime;
- (b) Ensure that female pupils have the same opportunities as male pupils to access higher education;
- (c) Sensitize the general public and children in particular to ensure that traditional gender stereotypes do not dictate the subjects studied by male and female pupils;
- (d) Facilitate children’s access to information, including strengthening of efforts to increase access of the population to materials from other countries, and strengthen student exchange programmes;
- (e) Ensure full implementation of the aims of education, taking into account article 29 of the Convention and the Committee’s General Comment No. 2;
- (f) Integrate human rights and, in particular, child rights, in the school curricula as a subject on its own; and
- (g) Seek technical assistance from, *inter alia*, UNESCO and UNICEF.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- France, CRC, CRC/C/140 (2004) 124 at paras. 604, 605, 627 and 628.

604. The Committee notes that the Constitution provides for freedom of religion and that the law of 1905 on the separation of church and State prohibits discrimination on the basis of faith. The Committee equally recognizes the importance the State party accords to secular public schools. However, in the light of articles 14 and 29 of the Convention, the Committee is concerned by the alleged rise in discrimination, including that based on religion. The Committee is also concerned that the new legislation (Law No. 2004-228 of 15 March 2004) on wearing religious symbols and clothing in public schools may be counterproductive, by neglecting the principle of the best interests of the child and the right of the child to access to education, and not achieve the expected results. The Committee welcomes that the provisions of the legislation will be subject to an evaluation one year after its entry into force.

605. The Committee recommends that the State party, when evaluating the effects of the legislation, use the enjoyment of children's rights, as enshrined in the Convention, as a crucial criteria in the evaluation process and also consider alternative means, including mediation, of ensuring secular character of public schools, while guaranteeing that individual rights are not infringed upon and that children are not excluded or marginalized from the school system and other settings as a result of such legislation. The dress code of schools may be better addressed within the public schools themselves, encouraging participation of children. The Committee further recommends that the State party continue to closely monitor the situation of girls being expelled from schools as a result of the new legislation and ensure they enjoy the right of access to education.

...

627. The Committee welcomes the efforts of the State party to provide free compulsory schooling through the age of 16 years and at the fact that the school is considered a place of integration and equality. It is nevertheless concerned at the labelling of some schools as "sensitive" and at the lack of meaningful child participation in decision-making processes within schools. Furthermore, it is concerned that thousands of children with disabilities are deprived of their right to education.

628. The Committee urges the State party, taking into account its General Comment No. 1 on the aims of education, to pursue its efforts to ensure that all children enjoy the right to education consistent with articles 28 and 29 of the Convention, and that children with disabilities are integrated into mainstream education as far as possible, in keeping with article 3 of the Convention. It encourages the State party to increase the level of public expenditures for compulsory education. Furthermore, the State party is encouraged to contribute and support the participation of children in decision-making processes concerning school life.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Brazil, CRC, CRC/C/143 (2004) 10 at paras. 83 and 84.

83. The Committee welcomes the efforts undertaken by the State party to improve school attendance and the positive results regarding the access of girls to school. The Committee also takes note of the steps made to include issues related to personality development, human rights and citizenship into school curricula. However, it remains concerned about the remarkable disparities of access, regular attendance, dropouts and retention of children in schools across the country affecting particularly the poor, the *mestizo* children, those of African descent and children living in remote areas. The Committee is further concerned about the low quality of education in many schools to the extent that there are many children who, despite several years of school attendance, cannot read and write or do basic calculations.

84. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Increase its expenditure on education and ensure the allocation of budgets at all levels, while devising policies that take into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education;

(b) Strengthen its efforts to improve the quality of education, *inter alia*, by revising school curricula, introducing child-centred and active teaching and learning methods and integrating human rights education;

(c) Increase the completion rate of primary education and ensure that primary education always be free of charge;

(d) Seek technical cooperation from, *inter alia*, UNESCO and UNICEF.

- Botswana, CRC, CRC/C/143 (2004) 25 at paras. 155 and 156.

155. The Committee is concerned at the information that primary education is not free for non-nationals and that the State party is considering introducing fees for parents who can afford it. The Committee is also concerned that primary education is not compulsory and at the high dropout rates in particular of girls in secondary schools, partly due to pregnancies.

156. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Take all necessary measures, legislative and administrative, to ensure that primary education is free and compulsory as required in article 28 of the Convention;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (b) Continue to strengthen the activities providing pregnant girls with ongoing access to education (before and after giving birth);
  - (c) Take measures to reduce school repetition and dropout rates;
  - (d) Strengthen its efforts to improve the quality of education by revising curricula, introducing child-centred and active teaching and learning methods;
  - (e) Expand the system of vocational training and improve its quality;
  - (f) Seek international technical assistance from, *inter alia*, UNICEF and UNESCO.
- Croatia, CRC, CRC/C/143 (2004) 36 at paras. 224, 225, 227 and 229.

224. While noting the efforts made by the State party with regard to education, e.g. the 2001 Law on the Changes and Amendments of the Primary Education Law, it remains concerned about the different access to education of children belonging to minority and the most vulnerable groups, including Roma children, children living in poverty, children with disabilities and foreign children, which hampers their full enjoyment of a system of education adequate to their values and identity. The Committee is also concerned that the education system and its organization remain very centralized and that human rights education is not included in the curricula. Finally, the Committee is concerned about the shift system of instruction and the poor equipment and school facilities in many parts of the country.

225. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Take all necessary measures to ensure that articles 28 and 29 of the Convention are fully implemented, in particular with regard to children belonging to the most vulnerable groups (i.e. minority groups, children living in poverty, etc.);
- (b) Ensure the implementation of the National Programme for Roma, providing it with adequate human and financial resources and with periodic evaluation of its progress;
- (c) Allocate more funds to reduce the number of shifts in schools and to improve the quality of education in the whole country in order to achieve the goals set out in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention and in the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2003) on the aims of education;
- (d) Ensure that human rights education, including children's rights, is included in the school curricula and that materials are available in the different languages used in schools, and that



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

teachers have the necessary training;

(e) Take measures to move towards decentralization;

(f) Adopt teaching methods that encourage child-centred learning and more active participation by children;

(g) Take the necessary measures to integrate children with disabilities in the mainstream education system, including vocational education, and in society;

(h) In the light of article 29 on the aims of education, establish adequate programmes and activities with a view to creating an environment of tolerance, peace and understanding of cultural diversity in order to prevent intolerance, bullying and discrimination in schools and in society at large.

...

227. ...The Committee expresses its concern about the difficult access to education and health care for refugee and internally displaced children.

...

229. The Committee...recommends that effective measures be undertaken to ensure that displaced children have equal access to education and health care.

- Kyrgyzstan, CRC, CRC/C/143 (2004) 50 at paras. 294 and 295.

294. The Committee notes the State party's efforts to increase enrolment rates, both in primary and secondary education, through the national programmes spelled out in the Education Act. It is, however, concerned at the high dropout rates, especially among girls, due to forced marriages. The increasing practice of requesting parents to pay unofficial monthly and/or one-time enrolment fees, as well as for textbooks and school repairs, constitutes an obstacle for children's access to education. The Committee is also concerned that enrolment in early childhood education has decreased in the past several years and that access to education is made difficult for children who are migrants with no formal residence permits, working children and/or street children.

295. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Continue to strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment rates in primary and secondary education, in particular with regard to early childhood education;

(b) Ensure that the practice of requesting that parents pay "voluntary fees" and other non-official contributions for the education of children is discontinued;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(c) Take measures to create more favourable conditions at schools (e.g. improvement of heating and electricity facilities as well as more friendly and less abusive environments) in order to tackle the high dropout rates;

(d) Establish special educational programmes in order to accommodate the needs of working children, street children, migrants with no formal residence permits and children deprived of their liberty;

(e) Improve the educational system with a view to achieving the aims mentioned in article 29, paragraph 1, of the Convention, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education, and introduce human rights, including children's rights, into school curricula;

(f) Seek assistance from, *inter alia*, UNESCO, OHCHR and other competent bodies in this regard.

- Equatorial Guinea, CRC, CRC/C/143 (2004) 64 at paras. 365 and 366.

365. The Committee notes the adoption of the Education Law (1995) and welcomes the establishment of the National University of Equatorial Guinea (1995) and the State party's efforts to increase enrolment rates in primary education, e.g. through the National Plan on Education for All. However, it is concerned that enrolment and literacy levels are still low, particularly in secondary and pre-primary education, and that there is a significant disparity between the number of boys and girls attending school. It also notes with concern the persistence of cultural and traditional perceptions of girls that limit their access to education. The Committee is also concerned about the lack of financial and material resources for the implementation of the educational programmes and about the lack of trained teachers.

366. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Continue its efforts to reform the educational system, e.g. by adopting the Law on the Educational Reform (*Ley Reglamentaria de la Reforma Educativa*);

(b) Continue to strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment rates in primary and basic education, in particular for girls;

(c) Expand public provision of early childhood education and increase the number of trained pre-school teachers, and raise awareness amongst parents about the value of early childhood education;

(d) Strengthen and expand efforts at teacher training and expand recruitment of qualified

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

teachers, in particular women and persons from all ethnic groups for education in mother tongue programmes;

(e) Include human rights education as part of the curriculum;

(f) Undertake an analytical study of children who drop out of school and those who are repeaters, with a view to formulating appropriate strategies to remedy these problems;

(g) Ensure the provision of adequate financial and human resources for the effective implementation of the educational programmes, in particular the National Plan on Education for All;

(h) Seek technical assistance from UNESCO and UNICEF.

- Angola, CRC, CRC/C/143 (2004) 78 at paras. 403, 404, 429 and 430.

403. While welcoming the efforts undertaken by the State party in cooperation with civil society groups to ensure that children are registered and provided with birth certificates, including the National Campaign for Free Registration of Children, the Committee remains concerned about the unacceptably high number of unregistered children in the State party and the consequences of non-registration on children's access to education and other services.

404. In light of article 7 of the Convention, the Committee strongly recommends that the State party undertake all necessary measures (e.g. by using mobile birth registration units) to ensure that all children are registered at birth, including by providing such registration free of charge, in line with the commitments made by the Government at the National Forum on Early Childhood Care and Development in June 2004. Meanwhile, children whose births have not been registered should be allowed to access basic services, such as health and education, while waiting to be properly registered.

...

429. The Committee notes with appreciation a number of initiatives, including the National Plan on Education for All, to rebuild the educational infrastructure and expand the educational system so as to enrol more children and improve pre-school education. The Committee notes with concern, however, the very low enrolment of children in pre-school and primary school and the even lower enrolment in secondary school, in particular of girls. It is also concerned about the marked disparities in enrolment between rural and urban areas, the high rates of non-attendance and repetition, overcrowded classrooms and teaching in two or three shifts, fees and extra payments charged in many schools, the low quality of

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

education, the large number of untrained teachers, the insufficient in-service training and low salaries of teachers. The Committee is also concerned about the lack of facilities for vocational training, leaving many adolescents without preparation for skilled labour. Furthermore, the Committee notes that the entire educational system is extremely underfinanced, which endangers the implementation of the above-mentioned plans to rehabilitate and expand the educational system.

430. The Committee urges the State party to take all necessary measures:

- (a) To increase budgetary allocations to education;
- (b) To rehabilitate the infrastructure of the educational system in the entire country;
- (c) To reduce shifts of classes;
- (d) To meet the target set at the 2004 National Forum on Early Childhood Care and Development to guarantee at least 30 per cent of children access to pre-school education by 2008;
- (e) To increase enrolment rates and reduce repetition and dropout rates and ensure that all children have effective access to primary education free of charge;
- (f) To prevent and eliminate gender and urban-rural disparities in school attendance and completion rates;
- (g) To undertake campaigns to instil awareness among parents of the importance of sending their children, particularly girls, to school;
- (h) To adequately equip existing and new classrooms and schools with books and sufficient and appropriate teaching and learning materials;
- (i) To improve teaching and learning methods focusing on a child-centred curriculum and instruction;
- (j) To expand the facilities of vocational training at the secondary school level and for adolescents who have never attended school or dropped out before completing school;
- (k) To ensure that recruited teachers are qualified and expand and improve both pre-service and in-service teacher training, and provide adequate salaries for teachers;
- (l) To improve efficiency in the management of education programmes.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Antigua and Barbuda, CRC, CRC/C/143 (2004) 93 at paras. 509-513.

509. The Committee welcomes the decision by the Board of Education to award scholarships and bursaries to children and the Board's Textbook Assistance Scheme, which provides children, free of cost, with all the textbooks used in school at the primary and secondary levels. It welcomes the provision of free uniforms as of September 2004 in both primary and secondary schools, and the plan to introduce free meals in primary schools. It also notes with appreciation that education is free at all levels of the public school system until the age of 16. However, it remains concerned about a variety of problems, including: shortage of schools and overcrowding; material shortages in schools; equality of access to education; drop-out of boys. The Committee is also concerned that, owing to the entrance examination system, not all students are guaranteed entry into the free public secondary schools.

510. The Committee is also concerned that a significant number of pregnant teenagers do not generally continue their education, and that the Golden Opportunity Programme initiated by the Ministry of Education seems to have had little success. The Committee is also concerned that girls and young women are often forced to leave school because of pregnancy.

511. The Committee recommends that the State party carefully examine the budgetary allocations for and measures taken within the field with regard to their impact on the progressive implementation of the child's right to education and leisure activities. In particular, the Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Take further measures to facilitate access to education by children from all groups in society by, *inter alia*, building more schools, improving the provision of school materials, and abolishing the entrance examination system so as to guarantee all students access to public secondary schools;
- (b) Take appropriate measures, with the participation of children, to increase school attendance and reduce the high drop-out and repetition rates;
- (c) Provide education opportunities for pregnant teenagers;
- (d) In the light of the Committee's general comment No. 1 on the aims of education, include human rights education, including the rights of children, in the school curriculum at all levels of education; and
- (e) Seek further technical assistance from, *inter alia*, UNICEF and UNESCO.

512. The Committee notes with appreciation the State party's ratification in September 2002

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). The Committee expresses concern, however, about the atmosphere of complacency, which may reduce efforts to prevent and eliminate child labour.

513. The Committee recommends that the State party make every effort, including taking preventive measures, to ensure that those children who engage in lawful domestic work do not work under conditions that are harmful to them and continue to have access to education, and that unlawful work is prevented and eliminated...

- Sweden, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 8 at paras. 61 and 62.

61. The Committee welcomes the efforts of the State party to provide free compulsory schooling through the age of 16 years, including universal free pre-schools for children aged 4-5. It is, nevertheless, concerned that:

(a) Children without resident permit, in particular children “in hiding”, do not have access to education;

(b) There are considerable variations in results among the various regions.

62. The Committee recommends that the State party pursue its efforts to ensure that:

(a) All children enjoy the right to education, including children without resident permit, and “children in hiding”;

(b) Variations in results and differences between schools and regions are eradicated;

(c) Vocational training is made available and that transition from school to work is supported.

- Albania, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 19 at paras. 109, 110, 127, 128, 135 and 136.

109. The Committee notes the significant efforts made by the State party to ensure that every child is registered within 30 days after birth. Nevertheless, it appears that those failing to meet the deadline encounter additional difficulties.

110. The Committee recommends that the State party take appropriate measures to promote the registration of all children, including through facilitating late registration when necessary and paying particular attention to the most vulnerable and marginalized groups... Meanwhile, immediate access to basic services, such as health and education, should be

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

ensured to children who were not registered at birth, while their registration is being properly prepared.

...

127. The Committee welcomes the establishment of an inter-ministerial group to develop a National Strategy for Persons with Disabilities, but remains concerned at the large number of children with disabilities who are institutionalized, are not included in the mainstream education system, or are without education at all, and at the general lack of resources and specialized staff for these children...

128. The Committee encourages the State party to actively pursue its current efforts and continue:

...

(b) To pursue efforts to ensure that children with disabilities may exercise their right to education to the maximum extent possible and facilitate their inclusion in the mainstream education system;

...

135. The Committee is concerned at the decline of public expenditures on education and notes that data about school attendance, transition rates and dropout rates from different sources are contradictory and make it difficult to assess the effectiveness of the school system. The Committee welcomes the initiatives, introduced in 2000, aimed at enhancing the quality of education and the efforts to reduce dropout rates. However, the Committee notes that parents are liable to punishment by fine for non-attendance of children, which may be counterproductive. The Committee welcomes the addition of a ninth compulsory school year to the second cycle of primary school and regrets that at least one year of pre-school education was not made compulsory. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned at the reported deterioration of physical conditions in schools, the lack of qualified teaching staff and teaching materials, including the discrepancy between rural and urban areas in this respect, and that many parents hire teachers to provide extra courses in order to compensate for the poor quality of the educational system.

136. The Committee urges the State party:

(a) To strengthen its ongoing efforts to address the problems relating to the training of teachers and to increasing budget allocations with a view to improving the quality of education and physical conditions in schools;

(b) To devise more child-sensitive methods to combat repetition and reduce dropout rates and to address the causes thereof, with a view to preventing such occurrences and achieving universal attendance; particular attention in this respect should also be given to the situation of girls;

(c) To develop a strategy to improve the quality and relevance of educational opportunities,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

including vocational training;

(d) To consider introducing a compulsory year of pre-school education;

(e) To consider seeking technical assistance from UNICEF in this respect.

- Luxembourg, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 36 at paras. 204-207.

204. The Committee is concerned about the fact that many children attend schools in neighbouring countries, apparently due to shortcomings in the school system of the State party. The Committee is also concerned about the information that educational facilities for children with behavioural problems and/or learning disabilities are limited in Luxembourg and that, in some cases, these children have been excluded from regular schools and located in facilities for mentally and physically disabled children.

205. The Committee encourages the State party to improve and/or expand the facilities and opportunities for education in the country. It further recommends that the State party take all necessary steps to put an end to the practice of placing children with learning disabilities and/or behavioural problems in facilities for mentally and physically disabled children.

206. The Committee notes with satisfaction that refugee and asylum-seeking children have free access to the school system in Luxembourg and that the Ministry of Education has appointed intercultural mediators in order to facilitate the integration of foreigners in the educational system. However, the Committee is still concerned that a large number of foreign children (more than 40 per cent of the school population) are often disadvantaged by the educational programme and teaching methods in Luxembourg, including language problems.

207. The Committee recommends that the State party consider all possible measures through which foreign children and children of asylum-seekers can be granted equal access to the same standard of services in the field of education. The Committee also encourages the State party to ensure that language does not become an obstacle in education and recommends any initiative, including support classes, to help children to learn the needed languages.

- Belize, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 59 at paras. 324, 325, 342, 343 and 352-354.

324. While noting the provisions of the Registration of Births and Deaths Act (chapter 157 of the Laws of Belize), which requires registering the birth of children, the Committee remains concerned about the shortcomings in the implementation of this Act and the



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

concrete shortcomings in the birth registration system... The Committee is also concerned about the unregistered children in the State party and the consequences of non-registration on access by children to education, health and other services.

325. The Committee recommends that the State party implement an efficient and at all stages free-of-charge birth registration system, which covers its territory fully, including through introducing mobile birth registration units and awareness-raising campaigns to reach the most remote areas of its territory... Meanwhile, children whose births have not been registered and who are without official documentation should be allowed to access basic services, such as health and education, while waiting to be properly registered.

...

342. The Committee expresses grave concern about the situation of children with disabilities and regrets that *de facto* discrimination against them still exists. The Committee notes with concern the lack of specific legislation which would ensure full and equal participation in social life, including access to social and health services, education, training, information and communication, rehabilitation, recreation and care, for children with disabilities...

343. The Committee urges the State party, taking into account the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96 of 20 December 1993, annex) and the recommendations adopted by the Committee at its day of general discussion on "The rights of children with disabilities" (see CRC/C/69, paras. 310-339):

(a) To enact special legislation dealing exclusively with disability issues, including access to social and health services, rehabilitation, support services, physical environment, information and communication, education, recreation and sports, in order to achieve the objectives of full participation and equality for children with disabilities;

...

(d) To integrate education for children with disabilities into national educational planning and curriculum and to include children with disabilities in the mainstream school system to the extent possible, including by providing the necessary financial and human resources for the training of teachers;

...

352. The Committee expresses its concern at the high rate of illiteracy and regional disparities in this respect. While the Committee takes note of a 10-year Education Sector Strategy with an overall objective of achieving universal educational access for children between the ages of 3 and 16 years, it remains concerned about the fact that parents are sometimes charged additional fees, thereby creating financial obstacles to many children and denying them access to education in primary and particularly in secondary schools. The Committee notes the State party's efforts to reduce the high rate of school dropouts, but regrets the deficiencies in the implementation of these initiatives.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

353. The Committee is concerned at the discrepancies in the implementation of national policies and principles on education in public and private schools, including the church-based schools. With respect to the treatment of pregnant students and teenage mothers in schools, the Committee expresses its grave concern that the State party does not have a policy to prevent and combat the school-based practices of educational exclusion of these students. The Committee is also concerned about the quality of education and the insufficient teacher training, particularly in the most remote areas of the country.

354. The Committee recommends that the State party allocate adequate financial, technical and human resources in order:

- (a) Urgently to take all necessary measures to further reduce the illiteracy rates in the country;
- (b) To progressively ensure that all children, without any distinction as to gender or ethnic origin, from all areas of the country, have equal access to compulsory and free quality primary education, without any financial obstacles;
- (c) To conduct a study to assess the causes, nature and extent of school dropouts and to strengthen its efforts to adopt and implement effective measures to prevent and reduce school dropout rates;
- (d) To pay special attention to the needs of children belonging to vulnerable groups, including girls, migrant children, working children, children living in poverty, children deprived of their liberty, children belonging to minorities and indigenous children, in order to safeguard their right to education at all levels;
- (e) To address the educational needs of pregnant students and teenage mothers in schools and to introduce a national policy on equal treatment of all students in respect of their right to education at all levels;
- (f) To provide schoolchildren with adequate psychological counselling services;
- (g) To improve the quality of education throughout the country in order to ensure that it is in conformity with the aims set out in article 29 of the Convention, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education;
- (h) To provide appropriate training to teachers at all levels of education;
- (i) To seek assistance from UNESCO, UNICEF and other relevant agencies engaged in the field of education.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Islamic Republic of Iran, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 88 at paras. 472, 473 and 494-496.

472. The Committee is concerned about information that a large number of Iranian children, particularly those living in rural areas, are still not registered at birth and that birth registration is required for school enrolment. It is also concerned about reports that a large number of children born of non-Iranian parents, and in particular Afghan parents who have not registered in Iran, will similarly remain unregistered, thereby excluding them from obtaining a refugee registration card.

473. In the light of article 7 of the Convention, the Committee encourages the State party to adopt all appropriate measures to ensure the registration of all children at birth, including all refugee children born in rural areas. Such measures should include the establishment of mobile registration offices and, for children not yet registered, registration units in schools. In this context, the State party should ensure that the provisions of article 7 are fully enforced in conformity with the principles of non-discrimination (art. 2) and of the best interests of the child (art. 3), including the right of the child to know, as far as possible, his or her parents. Meanwhile, immediate access by children not registered at birth to basic services, such as health and education, should be ensured, while the registration of these children is properly prepared.

...

494. Although the Committee notes the high level of literacy in Iran and the measures taken by the State party to increase school enrolment and lower dropout rates, it remains concerned that not all children are enrolled in or graduate from primary school. Working children, children living on the streets and children without complete personal documents, particularly refugee children with binational parents, have reduced access to schools. It is also concerned that refugee children are currently only being enrolled in schools if their parents have registered with the authorities, and that the enrolment of refugee children is not currently being offered free of charge. It is further concerned about well-documented information that a large number of Baha'i students were not admitted to university on the grounds of their religious affiliation.

495. The Committee is also concerned about the disparity that continues to exist between boys and girls; the high dropout rates of girls in rural schools upon reaching puberty; the lack of female teachers in rural areas; long distances between homes and schools, which keep girls at home, particularly after primary school; and the lack of mobile schools for nomadic children, as well as the remarkable differences in the personal and material equipment between schools in urban and rural areas and between the most and least developed provinces, resulting in unequal educational opportunities. In addition, it regrets that the decision to expand compulsory education beyond the five years of primary school has been delayed for many years.

496. While welcoming the State party's initiatives with respect to youth, the Committee

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

encourages the State party to continue its efforts to reach its goal of universal basic education and recommends that the State party:

(a) Expand compulsory and free education beyond the fifth year of primary school and develop and implement such a plan without further delay;

(b) Ensure that all children, including refugee children, have equal educational opportunities on all levels of the educational system without discrimination based on gender, religion, ethnic origin, nationality or statelessness;

(c) Eliminate all disparities in resources provided to schools in urban and rural areas in order to guarantee equal educational opportunities throughout the country;

(d) Better equip schools with textbooks, and other materials, and well-trained teachers, particularly female teachers, and introduce active, creative, and cooperative learning methods in schools to promote children's capacities in a knowledge-based economy and society;

(e) Continue and reinforce its collaboration with the OHCHR to incorporate Human Rights human rights education, including the Convention on the Rights of the Child, into the school curriculum.

- Togo, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 104 at paras. 538, 539, 561, 562, 571, 572 and 574.

538. While noting the efforts made by the State party to address the issue, the Committee notes with concern that societal discrimination persists against vulnerable groups of children, in particular girls and children with disabilities. In particular, the Committee reiterates the concern of the Human Rights Committee (CCPR/CO/75/TGO of 28 November 2002) and of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (E/C.12/1/Add.61 of 21 May 2001) about "continuing discrimination against...girls with respect to access to education, employment and inheritance".

539. With reference to the recommendations made in this regard by the Human Rights Committee and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Committee urges the State party to undertake an in-depth review of all its legislation, including the Individuals and Family Code and the Nationality Code of 1998, in order to fully guarantee the application of the principle of non-discrimination in domestic laws and compliance with article 2 of the Convention, and to adopt a proactive and comprehensive strategy to eliminate discrimination on any grounds and against all vulnerable groups, especially girls and children with disabilities, and children living in remote areas.

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

561. While noting the installation of access ramps in hospitals for disabled and the promulgation on 23 April 2004 of the Act 2004/005 on the social protection of persons with disabilities, the Committee is concerned that children do not have access to health-care services in the first place. In addition, the Committee is concerned that:

- (a) Only very few children with disabilities have access to education and employment services;
- (b) Education programmes do not prioritize services for disabled children;
- (c) There is no policy for the integration of children with disabilities.

562. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Review the situation of these children in terms of their access to suitable health care, education services and employment opportunities;

(d) Adopt an integration policy, allocate adequate resources to strengthen services for children with disabilities, support their families and train professionals in the field;

...

571. The Committee is concerned that public spending on education is low, that primary education is not free and that the enrolment rate, especially of girls, is low. The Committee is also concerned that, despite the waiving or reducing of fees for girls and economically disadvantaged children, education is not free, that secondary education is not affordable to many children, and consequently that universal compulsory free education has not been achieved.

572. The Committee is further concerned about:

- (a) The high repetition and dropout rates;
- (b) The high illiteracy rate;
- (c) The low level of qualification of teachers;
- (d) The very high number of pupils per teacher;
- (e) The lack of pre-school and day-care centres;
- (f) Reports of sexual harassment by teachers of their pupils.

...

574. The Committee recommends that the State party:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (a) Ensure, as a matter of priority, that at least primary education is compulsory and free;
  - (b) Ensure that girls and boys, from urban and rural areas, all have equal access to educational opportunities, without any financial obstacles;
  - (c) Ensure that teachers are adequately trained and paid;
  - (d) Take the necessary measures to prevent and punish the abuse of school pupils by teachers, including sexual harassment and economic exploitation, *inter alia*, by promoting the hiring of female teachers;
  - (e) Improve teaching and learning methods to lower repetition and dropout rates and encourage children to continue education through secondary school;
  - (f) Take appropriate measures to introduce human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;
  - (g) Implement additional and effective measures to promote early childhood education and continue its efforts to reduce illiteracy rates;
  - (h) Continue and strengthen cooperation with UNESCO, UNICEF and other partners in improving the education sector.
- Bolivia, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 121 at paras. 638, 639, 646 and 647.

638. The Committee regrets the lack of official data on the number of children with disabilities in the State party and that children with disabilities continue to face various forms of discrimination. The Committee also notes with concern the lack of public assistance and special education for children with disabilities; the large number of children with disabilities who do not attend any form of school education, especially in rural areas; and the lack of an integration policy in general for these children.

639. The Committee recommends that the State party take all necessary measures:

...

(d) To provide equal educational opportunities for children with disabilities, including by providing the necessary support and ensuring that teachers are trained to educate children with disabilities within regular schools.

...

646. While welcoming the recent reform of the education system and the increase in coverage of both primary and secondary education achieved in the last years, the Committee is concerned at continuing low enrolment rates, especially among girls and indigenous

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

children; the considerable disparities in the coverage and quality of education between urban and rural areas; and high dropout rates and persistently high illiteracy rates, particularly among rural and indigenous children and girls. The Committee is also concerned at the low percentage of children enrolled in pre-primary education. The lack of access to educational programmes for juvenile offenders is also a cause of concern.

647. The Committee encourages the State party:

(a) To provide sufficient funding to ensure free education at all levels of primary and secondary education;

(b) To strengthen efforts to bridge the gaps in the coverage and quality of education throughout the country;

(c) To strengthen efforts to bridge the gender disparity in education, giving special attention to promoting the education of rural girls;

(d) To take measures to identify the causes of the high dropout rate in schools, particularly in rural areas, and to take steps to address the situation;

(e) To strengthen educational and vocational programmes for children who do not attend regular school education;

(f) To ensure that all juvenile offenders have access to adequate educational and vocational programmes in detention centres;

(g) To ensure the accessibility of pre-school programmes with the assistance of communities at the local level;

(h) To take steps to provide adequate training to teachers and improve the quality of teaching and learning methods;

(i) To ratify the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education of 1960.

- Nigeria, CRC, CRC/C/146 (2005) 135 at paras. 700, 701, 725 and 726.

700. While acknowledging the work of the National Population Commission and the African Refugee Commission whose mandate includes birth registration, the Committee is concerned that the alarmingly low rate of birth registration, in particular in rural areas, is a reflection of the generally low awareness among parents of the importance of birth registration and its consequences on the full enjoyment of fundamental rights and freedoms

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

by children, in particular, access to education and health, the right to know and be cared for by parents...

701. In the light of article 7 of the Convention, the Committee urges the State party to adopt a short-term as well as a long-term approach in its strengthened efforts to ensure the registration of all children at birth, including through the development of mobile registration units and increased outreach activities and awareness-raising campaigns for families, birth attendants and traditional leaders... Meanwhile, children who have no birth registration should be allowed to access basic services, such as health and education, while preparing to be registered properly.

...

725. The Committee welcomes that education was given the highest priority in the State party's annual budget. It also notes with appreciation the initiatives of some State Governments to facilitate children's access to education and to increase school enrolment, including the "school meal plus programme" and the development of the Strategy for Acceleration of Girls' Education in Nigeria (SAGEN). The Committee also welcomes efforts made by the State party, in cooperation with the civil society, to implement early childhood education programmes. However, in the light of the Committee's general comment No. 1 on article 29 (1) of the Convention (aims of education), the Committee remains concerned about the various number of problems in the State party's education system, including:

- (a) Unavailability in many parts of Nigeria of free, compulsory and universal primary education, despite the constitutional guarantee;
- (b) High illiteracy, particularly among girls and women;
- (c) Generally low level of, and regional disparities in, the quality of education in the State party, especially with regard to resources, facilities and the level of teaching;
- (d) Gender and regional disparities in school enrolment;
- (e) High levels of absenteeism and school dropout rates, in part due to school fees which constitute a burden to parents in sending children to schools;
- (f) Mandatory requirement by law in some states of segregation of boys and girls in schools; and
- (g) Segregation of refugees and displaced children in separate schools from other children.

726. The Committee recommends that the State party:



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (a) Take appropriate measures, in order to ensure that at the least, primary education is compulsory, free and universal for all children;
  - (b) Prioritize equal accessibility to educational opportunities for girls and boys from urban and rural areas;
  - (c) Take necessary measures to remedy the low quality of education and to ensure better internal efficiency in the management of education;
  - (d) Build better infrastructure for schools and provide quality training for teachers;
  - (e) Seek to further implement participatory measures to encourage children to stay in school during the period of compulsory education;
  - (f) Take additional steps, including non-formal education programmes, to address the high illiteracy rates;
  - (g) Ensure that children who drop out of school and pregnant teenagers are provided with the opportunity to resume their studies;
  - (h) Ensure that education opportunities are provided for children suffering from HIV/AIDS;
  - (i) Ensure that refugee and asylum-seeking children are placed in schools in the local community, to facilitate their integration;
  - (j) Increase availability of vocational training programmes for young people, in particular, for girls, with the view to facilitate their access to the labour market, and in this connection, ratify the 1989 UNESCO Convention on Technical and Vocational Education; and
  - (k) Seek further technical assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO, among others.
- Saint Lucia, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 10 at paras. 79 and 86-88.

79. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Encourage the integration of children with disabilities into the regular educational system and their inclusion into society, *inter alia*, by giving more attention to special training for teachers and making the physical environment, including schools, sports and leisure facilities and all other public areas, accessible for children with disabilities;

...

86. While the Committee is encouraged that the State party has developed “Education

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Sector Development Plan 2000 to 2005 and Beyond” and that there has been an increase in secondary school enrolment, it remains concerned that the State party does not provide universal access for children in particular to secondary school. It is further concerned at the lack of continued education of school-aged teen mothers, and the growing number of children who drop out of school, particularly among boys.

87. The Committee expresses its concern at the fact that less than 20 per cent of the eligible age cohort has access to day-care services and that State provision for preschool is limited.

88. In the light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention and its general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education, the Committee recommends that the State party allocate adequate human and financial resources in order to:

(a) Adopt effective measures to include all children in primary education and urgently decrease the dropout rates for children, particularly boys;

(b) Continue its efforts to increase the number of children entering secondary schools through provisions of more classrooms;

(c) Offer more facilities for vocational training, including for children who do not complete secondary education;

(d) Ensure that teenage mothers continue their education.

- Philippines, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 24 at paras. 139, 140, 158, 159, 171-173, 186 and 187.

139. With reference to the high number of overseas Philippine workers, the Committee is concerned about children born abroad to Philippine migrant workers. Due to the non-registration of these children, they are deprived of their right to name, nationality and identity as well as basic services.

140. The Committee recommends to the State party that it encourage and facilitate parents, irrespective of their residence status, to register their children born abroad. The Committee also recommends that the State party ensure that unregistered children without official documentation are allowed access to basic services, such as health and education, while waiting to be properly registered...

...

158. Welcoming the State party’s efforts to eliminate discrimination against children with disabilities and to promote their integration into society with equal opportunities, *inter alia*, by implementing the Programme on Community-based Rehabilitation, the Committee is concerned about the *de facto* discrimination faced by children with disabilities and their

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

invisible role in society... The Committee is concerned that many children with disabilities live in poverty and their access to social and health services and education is limited...

159. In the light of the United Nations Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96) and the recommendations adopted by the Committee on its day of general discussion on the rights of children with disabilities (see CRC/C/69), the Committee recommends that the State party take all necessary measures to:

...

(c) Ensure that public education policy and school curricula reflect in all their aspects the principle of full participation and equality and include children with disabilities in the mainstream school system to the extent possible and, where necessary, establish special education programmes tailored to their special needs;

...

(f) Ensure that professionals working with and for children with disabilities, such as medical, paramedical and related personnel, teachers and social workers are adequately trained;

...

171. The Committee takes note of the State party's efforts to improve the standard and aims of education, including by implementing the new school curricula for elementary and secondary schools, and the curriculum for early childhood, the Education for All Programme of Action and the Child-friendly School System, in collaboration with UNICEF. Notwithstanding these positive steps taken, the Committee remains gravely concerned that there still remain *barangays* which are not able to provide children with elementary education and there are several vulnerable groups of children, such as children living in poverty, children with disabilities, child labourers, children in armed conflict, indigenous children, children infected with, or affected by, HIV/AIDS and street children, without equal access to elementary education. The Committee is concerned that the costs of schooling, such as meals, transportation, school uniforms and supplies, cause financial obstacles to many children from poor families and deny their equal access to education. The high rate of children not completing primary education gives cause for serious concern as well as the high drop-out rates in secondary education. The Committee also notes a low number of children enjoying early learning in preschools.

172. The Committee is encouraged by the State party's efforts to promote indigenous, minority and local languages in education including, *inter alia*, through the Lingua Franca Project. The Committee is concerned about poor schooling facilities, particularly in the remote *barangays*, including the insufficient number of classroom seats, textbooks and other schooling supplies. It reiterates its concern about the low rate of enrolment in secondary education and that children living in the remote *barangays* have very limited access to secondary education. The Committee notes with appreciation that the State party has made intense efforts to improve the quality of education by increasing the time spent on task and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

teaching methods that encourage children's participation. It also welcomes the expansion and improvement of pre-service and in-service teacher training. The Committee also recognizes the attempts to regularly monitor and evaluate the quality of education.

173. In the light of articles 28 and 29 of the Convention and the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education, the Committee recommends that the State party allocate adequate financial, human and technical resources in order to:

- (a) Increase budgetary allocations, governmental subsidies and assistance programmes for children from low-income families in order to secure their equal access to education of all levels;
- (b) Urgently take all necessary measures to ensure universal and free primary education for all and pay particular attention to the schooling opportunities in the most remote *barangays* and to the educational needs of children belonging to vulnerable groups, such as children living in poverty, children with disabilities, indigenous children, child labourers, children in armed conflict, children infected with or affected by HIV/AIDS and street children, in order to fulfil their right to education;
- (c) Adopt effective measures to rapidly decrease the drop-out rate in primary and secondary school;
- (d) Provide access to early childhood education for every child making it affordable for poor families and raise awareness of the benefits of preschools and early-learning opportunities among parents;
- (e) Develop and upgrade the infrastructure of the educational system by building new schools and classrooms, developing textbooks and other school supplies, enhancing teacher training and adopting innovative and interactive learning methods tailored for children with different learning prerequisites;
- (f) Provide indigenous children and children belonging to minority groups with equal access to quality education which respects their distinct cultural patterns and uses local indigenous and minority languages in education through, *inter alia*, the Lingua Franca Project;
- (g) Continue its efforts to offer more facilities for informal learning and vocational training, including for children who have not completed primary and secondary education;
- (h) Continue its efforts to reduce the number of dropouts and increase the number of children completing secondary education;
- (i) Establish vocational schools that systematically prepare children in school for the

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

requirements of the labour market and civic responsibilities;

(j) Mainstream human rights, including children's rights, into the school curricula;

(k) Cooperate with, among others, UNESCO, UNICEF and non-governmental organizations to improve the education sector;

(l) Continue to expand pre-service and in-service teacher training.

...

186. The Committee reiterates its grave concern at the high number of children living in the streets and their special vulnerability to various forms of violence and abuse, including sexual abuse and exploitation, economic exploitation and substance abuse... Notwithstanding the efforts taken by the State party and, in particular, many non-governmental organizations working with and for street children, for example ChildHope Asia Philippines, the Committee is concerned about street children's limited access to adequate nutrition, clothing, housing, social and health services and education...

...

187. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(c) Ensure that street children are reached through trained street educators and counsellors and provided with adequate nutrition, clothing and shelter as well as with social and health services and educational opportunities, including vocational and life skills training, in order to support their full development and provide them with adequate protection and assistance;

...

- Bosnia and Herzegovina, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 49 at paras. 246-248 and 258-261.

246. While the Committee welcomes the various legislative measures taken for the protection of children with disabilities, it notes with concern that discriminatory practices and prejudices still exist towards disabled persons, including children and that they lack sufficient medical care and educational opportunities.

247. While the Committee welcomes the new framework law on primary and secondary education (2003), which requires inclusive learning and integration of children with special needs into mainstream education, it regrets that, so far, the implementation of the law has been inconsistent.

248. The Committee encourages the State party to actively pursue its current efforts and to continue to:

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(b) Make efforts to detect disabilities within the educational system and ensure better evaluation of the overall needs of students with disabilities;

(c) Take concrete and specific measures to ensure that children with disabilities may exercise their right to education to the maximum extent possible and facilitate inclusion in the mainstream education system, including vocational education;

...

258. Despite some recent encouraging developments, especially through the adoption of legislative and other measures in the field of education - i.e. the Framework Law on primary and secondary education, the establishment of a nine-year cycle of compulsory education and the Action Plan for meeting educational needs of Roma and other national minorities - the Committee remains concerned at:

(a) The high number of children who are not enrolled or who drop out of school;

(b) The still inadequate number of professional teaching staff in the country;

(c) The lack of adequate space and facilities for recreational and cultural activities;

(d) The fact that, particularly in rural areas, children do not have access to preschool education.

259. The Committee is concerned that there exists extensive discrimination regarding access to education by ethnic and/or national minorities, especially Roma (only 33 per cent of whom attend primary school). Furthermore, the Committee is concerned that other marginalized groups of children, including refugees and returnees and children with disabilities face difficulties of access to schooling.

260. The Committee is also concerned about:

(a) The still existing phenomenon of the “two-schools-under-one-roof” system, whereby - in some Cantons - common premises are either divided or being used at different times by children of different ethnicity, who are taught a different curriculum depending on their national origin;

(b) Reports suggesting that violence in school is widespread, in particular among students.

261. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Strengthen its efforts to harmonize legislation on education and ensure its effective and uniform implementation throughout the country;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (b) Take all necessary measures to ensure that articles 28 and 29 of the Convention are fully implemented, in particular with regard to children belonging to the most vulnerable groups (i.e. minority groups, those living in poverty, refugee and returnee children, Roma children, children with disabilities, etc.);
  - (c) Improve the efficiency of the educational system, paying particular attention to the high drop-out rates;
  - (d) Provide access to preschool education throughout the country, including to children living in rural areas;
  - (e) Increase the availability of vocational training programmes for young people, with the view of facilitating their access to the labour market;
  - (f) In the light of article 29 on the aims of education, harmonize the educational system throughout the country, eliminate the so-called system of “two-schools-under-one-roof” and establish adequate programmes and activities with a view to create an environment of tolerance, peace and understanding of cultural diversity shared by all children to prevent intolerance, bullying and discrimination in schools and society at large;
  - (g) Ensure that adequate space and facilities are provided to children for their rest and leisure, as well as for recreational and cultural activities;
  - (h) Seek technical assistance from UNESCO and UNICEF.
- Nepal, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 66 at paras. 291, 293, 346, 347, 356-359, 361, 373 and 374.

291. The Committee notes the extremely negative impact of the armed conflict between the State party and the Communist Party of Nepal (the Maoists) on children in Nepal, and that it has created conditions in which even minimal implementation of the Convention is difficult... The Committee is extremely concerned at the large-scale bombing, destruction and closing of schools by Maoist insurgents, which are violations of the fundamental rights to education of children...

...

293. While noting the *de facto* control by non-State actors of areas of the State party’s territory, the Committee emphasizes the full responsibility of the State party, and urges the Communist Party of Nepal (the Maoists) to respect child rights within the areas in which they operate. The Committee reminds the State party of its obligation to respect the Convention at all times and not to derogate from any of its provisions, even in exceptional circumstances, including the state of emergency...

...

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

346. While acknowledging that the minimum age of marriage for girls is 18 years, the Committee shares the concern of the State party that the custom of early marriage is widespread in practice, in particular within certain ethnic and religious communities, and that girls, once married, are not afforded the protection for the enjoyment of their rights as children as enshrined in the Convention, including the right to education.

347. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its enforcement of the existing legislation to prevent early marriage and that the State party develop sensitization programmes, involving community and religious leaders and society at large, including children themselves, to curb the practice of early marriage. It also recommends to the State party that it take measures to ensure that when underage girls are married, they continue to fully enjoy their rights as set out in the Convention, including the right to education.

...

356. While welcoming the development of the National Plan of Action on Education for All, and the Basic and Primary Education Master Plan (1997-2002) and the Basic and Primary Education Master Plan II (1999-2004), the Committee is seriously concerned that primary education has not been made compulsory and that the target set by the State party to achieve universal primary education by 2000 was never met and has been extended to 2015. The Committee also remains concerned about the low public expenditure in education and structural lack of resources, largely responsible for the shortage of qualified teachers, poor physical infrastructure, overcrowding in schools and material shortages in school. The Committee is also concerned about the high dropout rate, and that significant inequality exists in access to education, in part due to the hidden costs associated with schooling, and that a large proportion of girls and children from disadvantaged backgrounds such as *Dalit* children and children with disabilities remain deprived of educational opportunities.

357. The Committee recommends that the State party carefully examine the budget allocations and measures taken within the field, with regard to their impact on the progressive implementation of the child's right to education and leisure activities. In particular, the Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Make primary education compulsory and free for all children and for more years than just the five years of primary school;
- (b) Continue to strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment rates and school attendance, as well as reducing the high dropout rate in primary and secondary education and ensure that children receive the full schooling to which they are entitled;
- (c) Undertake additional efforts to increase the budget allocated to education;
- (d) Take further measures to improve the accessibility, in particular for girls, to education of all children, with a view to eliminating the prevailing disparities between girls and boys,



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

as well as between urban and rural areas;

- (e) Take measures to improve the quality of education, *inter alia*, by building more schools, improving physical infrastructures and ensuring schools are adequately equipped;
- (f) Prioritize efforts at teacher training and expand recruitment of qualified teachers, in particular women and persons from all ethnic groups;
- (g) Introduce and fully implement targeted programmes for children from poor families and children from marginalized groups;
- (h) Continue to strengthen public provision of early childhood education, in particular in rural areas, and increase the number of trained preschool teachers, and raise awareness amongst parents about the value of early childhood education;
- (i) Adopt appropriate legislative measures to combat the use of corporal punishment in schools;
- (j) In the light of the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education, include human rights education, including the rights of children, in the school curriculum at all levels of education;
- (k) Ratify the Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960) and the Convention on Technical and Vocational Education (1989);
- (l) Seek further technical assistance from, *inter alia*, UNICEF and UNESCO.

358. The Committee further recommends to the State party that it take all measures, as a matter of priority, to eliminate negative impacts of the conflict (and the state of emergency) on the educational system, and to facilitate reconstruction and reopening of schools, return of teachers and pupils to schools and ensure that adequate resources are provided for these purposes.

359. The Committee welcomes the adoption in August 2004 of an official policy that is grounded on the principle of *non-refoulement*, but it regrets that the State party has not yet ratified the Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons or the Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, and that there is no domestic legislation that covers the rights of refugees and asylum-seeking persons. In this regard, and given the fact that a large population of these persons are children the Committee is concerned about:

...

- (d) The restrictions on Bhutanese refugees on their freedom of movement, as well as their

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

enjoyment of the right to health and education.

...

361. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

(b) Seek to ensure, as a matter of priority, that all internally displaced, refugee and asylum-seeking children and their families have access to health and education services, and that all their rights contained in the Convention are protected, including the right to be registered at birth;

...

373. While welcoming the abolition in 2000 of the *Kamaiya* system of bonded labour and the enactment in 2002 of the *Kamaiya* Prohibition Act, the Committee is concerned that a large number of *Kamaiya* children remain unreleased and continue to work as bonded labourers, and that many thousands of *Dalit* bonded labourers (*haliya*), including children, are reported to be working in agriculture in Western Nepal and in the plains. The Committee is particularly concerned that they continue to face serious difficulties in the areas of the right to housing, land, work and education.

374. The Committee recommends the State party to strengthen the enforcement of the existing legislation and policies to eradicate the practice of bonded labour by children. The Committee also urges the State party to make every effort, including taking preventive measures, to ensure that those children who engage in labour do not work under conditions which are harmful to them and that they continue to have access to education...

- Ecuador, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 91 at paras. 445 and 446.

445. The Committee acknowledges the remarkable improvement made in the field of education, including the forthcoming implementation of bilingual education. The Committee also takes note of the system of measurement of academic achievements (APRENDO). However, the Committee is concerned at the low level of government investment in education, the poor equipment for schools, the limited access to educational facilities for street children and the regional disparities in the full enjoyment of the right to education.

446. The Committee recommends that the State party:

(a) Increase expenditure on education, in particular in primary, pre-primary and secondary education;

(b) Increase enrolment in primary and secondary education, reducing socio-economic, ethnic and regional disparities in the access and full enjoyment of the right to education;

(c) Strengthen its measures to prevent the problem of school dropouts;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(d) Strengthen vocational training, which is linked to the requirements of the labour market and ensure street children have access to education which is suited to their specific needs;

(e) Enhance the quality of teaching and provide adequate training to teachers; and

(f) Seek technical cooperation with, *inter alia*, UNICEF and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.

- Mongolia, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 113 at paras. 556, 557, 566-568, 574 and 576.

556. The Committee expresses its grave concern about the situation of children with disabilities and regrets that discrimination against them exists... The Committee also notes with concern that the high number of children with disabilities have neither adequate access to social and health services nor to education...

557. The Committee urges the State party, taking into account the United Nations Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities and the recommendations adopted by the Committee on its day of general discussion on the rights of children with disabilities (see CRC/C/69):

...

(d) To take all necessary measures to include children with disabilities in the mainstream school system to the extent possible and, where necessary, to establish special education programmes tailored for their special needs;

...

566. While noting with appreciation the State party's efforts to improve the standard of education and to secure access to education by implementing the revised Law on Education adopted in 1995, the Committee is concerned about the remaining difficulties encountered by children, especially in rural areas of the country, in their access to education and attendance in school. The high number of primary-school-aged children not enrolled in school, including gender and regional disparities in school enrolment, the increasing rates of illiteracy and the high rate of school drop-outs, especially in rural areas, give cause for serious concerns.

567. The Committee reiterates its concern about boys belonging to herder families and living in rural areas who are at a higher risk of dropout from school and being involved in child labour. The Committee notes with particular concern that the additional fees collected in schools cause financial obstacles for many children and deny them equal access to education. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned about incidents reported where children have been subjected to violence in schools and defective school facilities, including an insufficient number of classroom seats and a low quality of textbooks. The Committee notes the State party's efforts to build and renovate school dormitories, but it is concerned

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

about their poor condition and limited capacity to accommodate children.

568. The Committee recommends that the State party take immediate measures to allocate adequate financial and human resources in order:

- (a) To progressively ensure that all children, without any distinction by gender, from all areas of the country, have equal access to quality education without any financial obstacles and to also consider the reinstatement of neighbourhood schools in order to facilitate children's access to education;
- (b) To strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment rates in primary and secondary education without any regional disparities and to secure that all children have equal opportunities to complete their education;
- (c) To strengthen its efforts to adopt and implement effective measures to decrease school dropout rates, especially among children living in rural areas;
- (d) To take additional steps to address increasing illiteracy rates;
- (e) To expand the vocational training facilities at the secondary-school level and for adolescents who have never attended school or dropped out before completion;
- (f) To increase the quality of teaching methods by providing appropriate training to teachers;
- (g) To improve school facilities, including by building new schools and improving heating and electricity installations in schools, the quality of text books and the condition of school dormitories;
- (h) To continue to include human rights in general, and the rights of the child in particular, into the school curricula, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education, and to promote a safe and non-violent school environment.

...

574. Notwithstanding the positive steps taken by the State party, the Committee is concerned at the high rate of working children in Mongolia and the various kinds of negative consequences resulting from the exploitation of child labour, including the school dropouts and negative impacts on health caused by the harmful and hazardous work...

...

576. The Committee recommends that the State party take immediate and effective measures:

...

- (c) To ensure that working children have access to quality education, including vocational and non-formal education and that they are given sufficient time off to enjoy their right to

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

education as well as to rest, leisure and recreational activities;

...

- Nicaragua, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 132 at paras. 644-648.

644. The Committee is concerned about:

- (a) The still low literacy rate (76.7 per cent of adult and 86.2 per cent of children in 2002);
- (b) Socio-economic and regional disparities - e.g. between urban and rural areas and between the Central/Pacific and Caribbean/Atlantic regions - in the access and enjoyment of the right to education, including lack of facilities in isolated and remote areas;
- (c) The lack of adequate training of teachers, teachers' low salaries, which may lead to loss of motivation, high turnover rates, migration abroad and little interest in professional development.

645. Furthermore, the Committee expresses concern at lack of adequate resources for education and at the information that annually, an average of more than 850,000 children between 3 and 16 years of age remain outside the school system, and that only a small part of enrolled children complete the six years of primary schooling.

646. The Committee encourages the State party to:

- (a) Increase the efforts to eliminate any discrepancy in access to education between urban and rural areas and between the Central/Pacific and Caribbean/Atlantic regions;
- (b) Emphasize the quality of education and devote more resources to education in the national budget;
- (c) Strengthen measures aimed at increasing enrolment and completion rates and reducing dropout rates in pre-primary, primary and secondary education;
- (d) Consider expanding the years of compulsory education with a view to eliminating the existing gap between the legal age for access to work and for compulsory education;
- (e) Expand public provision of early childhood education and raise awareness amongst parents about the value of early childhood education;
- (f) Strengthen efforts at teacher training, address the issue of teachers' salaries and expand recruitment of qualified ones;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- (g) Include human rights education as part of the curriculum;
- (h) Provide more demand-driven technical and vocational training and organize vocational counselling for children;
- (i) Provide opportunities for children outside schools and working children so that they can get as much education as possible by specific programmes tailored to their life conditions;
- (j) Ensure the provision of adequate financial and human resources for the effective implementation of the educational programmes and expand scholarship and other programmes of assistance to students;
- (k) Seek technical assistance from the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and UNICEF.

647. Furthermore, the Committee expresses concern at the information that the majority of public schools require students to pay a “voluntary quota” for their inscription fee, which, added to the expenses incumbent on families for clothing, food, school supplies and transportation, makes education of children for poor families virtually impossible.

648. In the light of article 28 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party ensure primary education for all children free of cost - including payment of a “voluntary quota” and/or school books or other school material - and provide support to families with financial problems for an adequate educational development of their children.

- Costa Rica, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 149 at paras. 687, 688, 714, 715, 726 and 727.

687. ...The Committee is concerned...at the limited access of indigenous children, migrant children and those living in rural areas, to basic education and health services, and at their low standard of living... While welcoming the revocation by resolution No. 008857-99 of articles 6 and 7 of Executive Decree (Decreto ejecutivo) No. 21989-MEP-MTSS, the Committee is concerned at information received whereby migrant children are still neither eligible for scholarships, nor entitled to take part in students’ councils.

688. The Committee encourages the State party to continue to pay due attention to the needs of indigenous people by taking appropriate measures to address the high rate of infant mortality among the indigenous communities, and to substantially increase their level of education and standard of living, and endorses the recommendation of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination in that regard (CERD/C/60/CO/3, para. 11). The Committee further recommends that the State party provide information on the number of migrant children who benefited from scholarships since the adoption of resolution No.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

008857-99. In addition, the Committee recommends that the State party take steps to disseminate the contents of the resolution to the public at large. The Committee also recommends that the State party take appropriate measures to ensure the right of migrant children to take part in students' councils...

...

714. The Committee takes note of the efforts made by the State party to increase the level of school infrastructure at the country level, and ensure that all children, including refugee children, have access to education. The Committee also notes with great appreciation that 90 per cent of children attend preschool. The Committee welcomes the variety of measures by which children are relieved from additional costs of school attendance. The Committee takes note of new projects which provide opportunities of education for children who have left school before completion. Although courses and institutions for technical and vocational training were expanded, the Committee regrets that not more children between the ages of 15 and 18 receive vocational training in order to facilitate their transition to qualified labour, and the low completion rate of secondary school, in particular in rural areas, especially of deprived children and indigenous children, as well as the lack of school infrastructure in remote areas of the country.

715. The Committee recommends that the State party continue to take effective measures to increase enrolment in primary and secondary school, reduce the high rate of drop-out students and repeaters, in particular in rural areas, and find ways to address the lack of school infrastructure in these areas, *inter alia* by finding alternative educational methods, e.g. vocational and apprenticeship programmes, which would take the specific needs of these populations into consideration. The State party should focus on the improvement of secondary education.

...

726. With respect to indigenous communities, the Committee takes note of the State party's efforts to increase the number of schools providing bilingual education. It is however concerned at the insufficient number of indigenous teachers and schools, and at the fact that education does not fully take into account indigenous culture.

727. The Committee recommends that the State party continue to increase the number of indigenous schools and adequately trained indigenous teachers, and ensure the right of indigenous children to learn to read and write in their own language through methods adapted to their own culture...

- Yemen, CRC, CRC/C/150 (2005) 161 at paras. 783, 784, 793 and 794.

783. While acknowledging the efforts made by the State party, the Committee remains concerned at the numerous problems faced by children with disabilities. It is particularly concerned at the lack of:

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

...

- (c) Integration of children with disabilities into the regular schooling system.

784. The Committee recommends that the State party:

...

- (c) Review the situation of children with disabilities, in terms of their access to employment, education, housing and health-care facilities, and allocate adequate resources to strengthen services for children with disabilities, support their families and provide training for professionals in this field;

- (d) Formulate a strategy, one which includes appropriate teacher training, to ensure that all children with disabilities have access to education, and whenever possible they are integrated into the mainstream education system;

...

793. The Committee welcomes the information regarding the efforts made by the State party to enhance the quality of education and improve the quality of teaching and working conditions of teachers. However, it remains deeply concerned that:

- (a) The quality of education remains still very deficient;
- (b) The level of illiteracy of women is high;
- (c) School enrolment rates remain very low;
- (d) Dropout rates are very high and secondary education enrolment rates have decreased;
- (e) Urban/remote/rural disparities remain very high;
- (f) Negative stereotypes of girls remain in school curricula; and
- (g) The qualifications of children entering the labour market are very low as a consequence of missing vocational training.

794. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Ensure that primary education is free and compulsory for all children, as provided for in the Constitution and in the Rights of the Child Act;
- (b) Ensure that adequate resource allocation is made for primary, secondary and vocational education;
- (c) Continue its efforts to ensure that all children have equal access to educational



## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

opportunities with a view to eliminating the prevailing disparities between girls and boys as well as in urban and rural areas;

(d) Take the necessary measures to decrease the high rate of school dropout;

(e) Taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education, strengthen its efforts to include human rights education in school curricula at all levels, particularly with respect to the development of and respect for human rights, tolerance and equality of the sexes and ethnic minorities;

(f) Enhance the quality of education at all levels and provide better quality training for teachers; and

(g) Expand the system of vocational training, including children who dropped out of school before completing their education.