





## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, CERD, A/51/18 (1996) 35 at para. 246.

Effective programmes should be established to care for the health and educational needs of the Irish Traveller community in Great Britain and Northern Ireland.

- Bolivia, CERD, A/51/18 (1996) 41 at para. 284.

Immediate attention should be paid to the development of rural areas where many indigenous communities are situated. The Government should consider the expansion of the economic and social infrastructure to enable those communities to be provided with access to clean water, energy, medical care, education, and other essential services and, in this regard, special attention is called to the situation of the Guaraní people. The Government is encouraged to seek international assistance towards this end.

- China, CERD, A/51/18 (1996) 57 at para. 420.

With respect to article 5 (e) (v) of the Convention concerning the right to education, the State party should ensure access by members of minority nationalities to education at all levels and, in autonomous areas, instruction on the history and culture of the relevant minority nationalities should be included in the school curricula.

- Venezuela, CERD, A/51/18 (1996) 65 at paras. 471 and 475.

### *Paragraph 471*

Concern is expressed about the insufficient measures to ensure bilingual education of indigenous peoples and to prevent the destruction of their cultural heritage.

### *Paragraph 475*

Further efforts should be made to strengthen the system of bilingual education in order to cover the whole of the indigenous population, 40 per cent of which remains illiterate, and to prevent the destruction of the indigenous cultural heritage.

- Namibia, CERD, A/51/18 (1996) 67 at paras. 500 and 503.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 500*

Concern is expressed about apparent delays in the process of desegregation in the field of education, as well as the persistence of serious difficulties faced by black children in their access to public and private education, particularly insofar as secondary and higher education are concerned.

### *Paragraph 503*

Affirmative measures should be adopted to overcome vestiges of the past that still hamper the possibilities for black people, including vulnerable groups among them, to have access to secondary and higher education and to enjoy just and favourable conditions of work in the private sector.

- Zaire, CERD, A/51/18 (1996) 70 at para. 526.

With regard to the full and equal enjoyment of the right to education and training, as provided for in article 5 (e) and (v) of the Convention, reports indicate that only 2 per cent of the national budget was earmarked for education which affects the life and future of disadvantaged racial and ethnic sectors of the population.

- Guatemala, CERD, A/52/18 (1997) 14 at para. 94.

Efforts should be increased to promote affirmative measures in the fields of education and training and to introduce bilingual education for all parts of the population.

- Mexico, CERD, A/52/18 (1997) 42 at para. 312.

The absence of local and federal legislation guaranteeing indigenous populations the possibility of a bilingual and bicultural education remains a source of concern.

- Algeria, CERD, A/52/18 (1997) 52 at para. 388.

It is noted with appreciation that education at all levels is free, as is public health care.

- Poland, CERD, A/52/18 (1997) 62 at para. 479.

Children belonging to minorities should have fuller access to education in their own language. It is recommended that appropriate measures be taken to meet the specific educational needs of Roma

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

children.

- Sweden, CERD, A/52/18 (1997) 65 at para. 500.

It is noted with appreciation that the State party has established a system of education for refugees and immigrants.

- The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, CERD, A/52/18 (1997) 67 at paras. 521 and 526.

### *Paragraph 521*

Concern is expressed over the low levels of participation, in particular in secondary and higher education, of certain minorities, notably Roma children and Albanian girls in rural areas.

### *Paragraph 526*

The State party should continue its efforts to facilitate the participation of different ethnic minorities in the educational system, in particular at the secondary and higher educational level, and to provide for the training of teachers in minority languages in public establishments.

- Russian Federation, CERD, A/53/18 (1998) 25 at para. 47.

Further measures should be taken in order to provide minorities and indigenous groups with elementary education in their own languages.

- The Netherlands, CERD, A/53/18 (1998) 33 at paras. 105 and 106.

### *Paragraph 105*

Further action should be taken to ensure and promote equal opportunity in economic and social life, in particular as regards education and employment.

### *Paragraph 106*

Concern is expressed at the under-representation of ethnic minorities in most areas of education and, in particular, that only an estimated 2 per cent of the total student population in higher education comes from ethnic minorities. The State party should give more attention to providing students from ethnic minorities at all levels of education, as appropriate, instruction in their mother tongue.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Yugoslavia, CERD, A/53/18 (1998) 45 at para. 207.

Efforts should be pursued in order to guarantee full enjoyment by members of all minorities of their rights to public information and cultural activities, as well as education in their own language, whenever possible.

- Armenia, CERD, A/53/18 (1998) 49 at paras. 225 and 227.

### *Paragraph 225*

It is noted with concern that teaching must be conducted in the official language and that some minority groups are therefore denied access to education in practice.

### *Paragraph 227*

The State party should consider adopting measures to ensure that ethnic and national minorities have access to education in their own language whenever possible.

- Cambodia, CERD, A/53/18 (1998) 55 at paras. 292 and 298.

### *Paragraph 292*

Concern is expressed over the limited educational facilities in the villages of ethnic Vietnamese, the lack of legislation authorizing the establishment of schools for them and the obstacles to their children learning the Khmer language.

### *Paragraph 298*

Action should be taken at the legislative, administrative and judicial levels to protect the right of everyone, including ethnic Vietnamese, to enjoy their rights under article 5 of the Convention, especially the right to security of the person and protection by the State against violence or bodily harm, to public health and medical care and to education and training.

- Finland, CERD, A/54/18 (1999) 16 at para. 71.

The recent legislation ensuring enjoyment by immigrant children of their right to education and the measures taken to facilitate education of immigrants in their own language, are welcomed.

- Romania, CERD, A/54/18 (1999) 30 at para. 282.

The situation of Roma is a subject of particular concern since no improvements have been noted in

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

the high unemployment rates and the low educational level traditionally predominant among members of this minority; this contributes to the continued unacceptable prevalence of the negative and stereotyped image of the minority in the rest of society. Given its disadvantaged situation in society, particular concern is caused by the absence of economic and social measures of the kind envisaged in article 2 (2) of the Convention in favour of this minority.

- Azerbaijan, CERD, A/54/18 (1999) 46 at para. 497.

The State party should utilize all available means, including international cooperation, to ameliorate the situation of displaced persons and refugees, especially regarding their access to education, employment and housing, pending their return to their houses under conditions of safety.

- Slovakia, CERD, A/55/18 (2000) 47 at para. 262.

Concern is expressed that despite school education being compulsory, a disproportionately large number of Roma children are not enrolled in schools, have high drop-out rates, do not complete higher education, or are segregated and placed in schools for mentally disabled children. It is recommended that the State party address the various factors responsible for the low level of education among the Roma with a view to improving enrolment and continue efforts to develop and expand strategies to facilitate the integration of minority pupils into mainstream education.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, CERD, A/55/18 (2000) 60 at paras. 361, 363 and 364.

### *Paragraph 361*

Concern is expressed that the dispersal system may hamper the access of asylum-seekers to expert legal and other necessary services, i.e. health and education. The State party should implement a strategy ensuring that asylum-seekers have access to essential services and that their basic rights are protected.

### *Paragraph 363*

Concern is expressed regarding admission and access to schools by Roma Travellers.

### *Paragraph 364*

Concern is expressed that there is racist harassment and bullying in schools and that ethnic minorities continue to be disproportionately excluded from schools. The State party should intensify its efforts to ensure full enjoyment by all of the rights provided in article 5 of the Convention, without discrimination, giving particular attention to the rights to employment, education, housing and health.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Holy See, CERD, A/55/18 (2000) 66 at para. 396.

Appreciation is expressed for the role of the Catholic Church in promoting education, particularly in developing countries. The opening up of Catholic schools to children from different religious creeds as well as the promotion of tolerance, peace and integration through education is also welcomed. It is noted with satisfaction that in many countries where the majority of the population is non-Christian, Catholic schools are places where children and young people of different faiths, cultures, social classes or ethnic backgrounds come into contact with each other.

- Greece, CERD, A/56/18 (2001) 29 at para. 133.

The State party is encouraged to pursue further its dialogues with representatives of the Roma, Pomak, Albanian and other minority populations, with a view to expanding as necessary the available range of multi-lingual educational programs and policies.

- Japan, CERD, A/56/18 (2001) 34 at paras. 173 and 174.

### *Paragraph 173*

With regard to children of foreign nationality residing in Japan, it is noted that elementary and lower secondary education is not compulsory. The position of the State party is that "since the purpose of the primary education in Japan is to educate the Japanese people to be members of the community, it is not appropriate to force foreign children to receive that education." The Committee concurs with the proposition that force is completely inappropriate to secure the objective of integration. However, with reference to articles 3 and 5(e)(V), concern is expressed that different standards of treatment in this respect may lead to racial segregation and the unequal enjoyment of the right to education, training and employment. The State party should ensure that the relevant rights contained in article 5(e) are guaranteed without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin.

### *Paragraph 174*

Concern is expressed about discrimination affecting the Korean minority. Though efforts are being made to remove some of the institutional obstacles for minority students from international schools, including Korean schools, to enter Japanese universities, it is of particular concern that studies in Korean are not recognised and resident Korean students receive unequal treatment with regard to access to higher education. The State party should undertake appropriate measures to eliminate discriminatory treatment of minorities, including Koreans, in this regard and to ensure access to education in minority languages in public Japanese schools.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- China, CERD, A/56/18 (2001) 44 at paras. 245 and 246.

### *Paragraph 245*

While recognizing efforts made which have resulted in an increased number of schools and a decrease of illiteracy in minority regions, concern remains about continuous reports of discrimination with regard to the right to education in minority regions, with particular emphasis on Tibet. The State party should urgently ensure that children in all minority areas have the right to develop knowledge about their own language and culture as well as the Chinese, and that they are guaranteed equal opportunities, particularly with regard to access to higher education.

### *Paragraph 246*

While noting efforts to facilitate integration and naturalization of Indo-Chinese refugees in mainland China, it of concern that different standards of treatment are applied to Indo-Chinese asylum-seekers on the one hand, and asylum-seekers of other national origins on the other, notably with regard to the rights to work and education. The State party should take the necessary measures to ensure that all refugees and asylum-seekers receive equal treatment. To this end, the adoption of formal legislative or administrative provisions should be considered in order to implement objective criteria for the determination of refugee status.

- Cyprus, CERD, A/56/18 (2001) 48 at para. 265.

Developments in the field of education, particularly efforts to promote human rights awareness in schools, the subsidizing of the education of minority groups and the establishment of elementary



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- United Republic of Tanzania, ICCPR, A/53/40 vol. I (1998) 57 at para. 396.

The State party should put an end to the discriminatory practices of the application of personal laws which discriminate against women with respect, *inter alia*, to marriage, divorce, land and inheritance; customary attitudes that discourage women from pursuing their full educational rights and that result in a tendency for women to lack the qualifications needed to reach higher levels of achievement in all aspects of activity, such as the senior judiciary; and the under-representation of women in political spheres. The State party should put an end to these discriminatory laws and practices. Action should be taken to increase the number of girls' schools, persuasion should be exerted on society to insist on girls' attendance at school, and support should be given to young women who wish to pursue higher education.

- Ireland, ICCPR, A/55/40 vol. I (2000) 61 at para. 449.

The State party is urged to continue its efforts to take positive action to overcome discrimination and to ensure the equal enjoyment of rights by members of the Travelling community and in particular to improve their access to health, education and welfare services, including accommodation, and their participation in political and public life.

- Czech Republic, ICCPR, A/56/40 vol. I (2001) 83 at para. 83(9).

It is of particular concern that a disproportionate number of Roma children are assigned to special schools designed for mentally disabled children, which would seem to indicate the use of stereotypes in the placement decisions in contravention of article 26 of the Covenant and which make it difficult, if not impossible, to secure admission to secondary schools (art. 26). Immediate and decisive steps should be taken to eradicate the segregation of Roma children in the educational system by ensuring that placement in schools is carried out on an individual basis and is not influenced by the child's ethnic group. Where needed, the State party should also provide special training to Roma and other minority children to secure, through positive measures, their right to education.

### ICESCR

- Luxembourg, ICESCR, E/1991/23 (1990) 24 at para. 129.

The fact that the Covenant, virtually alone among applicable international human rights treaties, is considered to be non-self-executing in its totality is questioned. It is observed that by contrast to this approach, the Covenant contains a number of provisions which the great majority of observers consider to be self-executing. These include for example, provisions dealing with non-discrimination,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

the right to strike and the right to free primary education.

- Democratic People's Republic of Korea, ICESCR, E/1992/23 (1991) 33 at para. 157.

The Government is encouraged to continue its efforts to promote an education system that will stimulate private investment in that field, thereby enabling citizens to exercise greater freedom in choosing educational institutions, in accordance with the provisions of article 13, paragraph 3 of the Covenant.

- Spain, ICESCR, E/1992/23 (1991) 60 at para. 291.

In order to comply with the obligations which derive from the Covenant, additional measures should be taken in order to eliminate:

- (a) The disparities in the employment conditions of teachers in public and private schools;
- (b) The uneven distribution of students in universities resulting in conditions detrimental to the teaching-learning environment;
- (c) The gap between theory and practice in vocational education.

- Colombia, ICESCR, E/1992/23 (1991) 68 at para. 320.

Concern is expressed at the differences in teachers' pay at private and public teaching institutions. Teachers in the private sector play a key role in giving effect to the right to education and yet they are much less well off than their counterparts in the public institutions.

- Belarus, ICESCR, E/1993/22 (1992) 22 at para. 78.

The intention of the Government to introduce fees for education in the tenth and eleventh grades is noted with particular concern.

- Poland, ICESCR, E/1993/22 (1992) 32 at para. 130.

The liberalization of the education system is noted, as is the new emphasis placed on secondary vocational education. Concern is expressed that the new thrust towards a market-oriented economy

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

is accompanied by a decrease in the budget for education. The general decline in the economy constitutes a threat to the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights. It is re-emphasized that the difficulties being experienced during the period of transition does not diminish the State's obligation to protect the more vulnerable members of society.

- Hungary, ICESCR, E/1993/22 (1992) 37 at para. 154.

Special emphasis is placed upon the need to ensure that special attention is paid to the right to education and culture of the most vulnerable and disadvantaged members of society.

- Kenya, ICESCR, E/1994/23 (1993) 24 at para. 84.

Concern is expressed over the low school attendance of children in the poorest areas of the country and in nomadic communities. It is observed that the obligation of States parties to the Covenant to ensure that "primary education shall be compulsory and available free to all" applies in all situations including those in which local communities are unable to furnish buildings, or individuals are unable to afford any costs associated with attendance at school. Attention is drawn to the obligation, contained in article 14 of the Covenant, and applying in cases where free compulsory education has not been assured, to "work out and adopt a detailed plan of action for the progressive implementation, within a reasonable number of years" of the relevant right. It is also regretted that significant gender disparities and regional differences exist with regard to access to education, that there is a significant difference in quality between the government secondary schools and the Harambee or community schools, and that there are difficulties encountered through the introduction of the new 8-4-4 system of education.

- Islamic Republic of Iran, ICESCR, E/1994/23 (1993) 32 at paras. 126 and 127.

### *Paragraph 126*

The following concerns are expressed over the situation of certain minority groups, which have not been satisfactorily answered in the course of the present session: discrimination on religious grounds in the educational system; insufficiency of the education offered to the children belonging to the Kurdish minority; prohibition of the admission to university of Baha'is; restriction of freedom of debate and choice in the university institutions; and the situation of the Kurds and the disparities that exist between the different ethnic and economic groups in the enjoyment of their rights to education, to work, to travel, to housing and to the enjoyment of cultural activities.

### *Paragraph 127*

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Concern is expressed over the non-performance of the Government's obligation under article 3 of the Covenant, under which States parties undertake to ensure the equality of men and women to the enjoyment of all economic, social and cultural rights set forth in the Covenant. In that connection it is found that the situations: in which women are not permitted to study engineering, agriculture, mining or metallurgy or to become magistrates; in which they are excluded from a very large number of specific subjects at university level; and in which they need their husbands' permission to work or travel abroad to be incompatible with the obligations undertaken by the State party under the Covenant.

- Viet Nam, ICESCR, E/1994/23 (1993) 34 at para. 140.

With regard to education, it is noted that despite the progress made, there is still no programme to guarantee free primary education. It is also noted that there are high rates of absenteeism from school and a growing number of street children involved in unlawful activities, such as prostitution, drug abuse and illicit trafficking in drugs.

- Australia, ICESCR, E/1994/23 (1993) 36 at paras. 151, 152 and 158-160.

### *Paragraph 151*

The lack of opportunities available to persons with disabilities to fully enjoy their right to education are of concern.

### *Paragraph 152*

The effects of funding accorded to non-government schools on the quality of education in government schools are of concern.

### *Paragraph 158*

The importance of taking steps to more closely monitor the general situation of Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders and other disadvantaged groups, particularly in education and culture, is emphasized.

### *Paragraph 159*

The appropriateness of the efforts being undertaken by the Government to identify the needs of disadvantaged groups and to continue to draw on the results of studies and reviews in the development of policy initiatives to respond to the needs of such groups is emphasized. The importance attached to the economic, social and cultural rights of persons with disabilities and of the elderly is emphasized. It is urged that the Government direct major efforts towards assessing and addressing the needs of these groups in relation to their rights under articles 13 and 15 of the Covenant.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 160*

Legislative efforts should be undertaken to eliminate remaining obstacles in the equitable access to educational establishments.

- Mexico, ICESCR, E/1994/23 (1993) 47 at para. 240.

Vigorous steps should be taken in the spheres of education and culture and in this connection, primary education should be compulsory and available free to all.

- Germany, ICESCR, E/1994/23 (1993) 49 at paras. 250 and 251.

### *Paragraph 250*

Despite the efforts made by the German authorities, concern is expressed over the disparity that exists in Germany between men and women with regard to educational achievements and the participation of women in all levels of education and professional careers.

### *Paragraph 251*

Positive action should be taken by the German authorities to guarantee ideological pluralism in education and equality of opportunities of men and women in that field in accordance with the relevant provisions of the International Covenants on human rights.

- Senegal, ICESCR, E/1994/23 (1993) 51 at paras. 261 and 265.

### *Paragraph 261*

It is noted with alarm that budgetary cutbacks carried out in the educational sector under the programme of structural adjustment will have serious social and economic consequences for the future of the country. In this connection, concern is expressed over the restrictions on school enrolment which have been undertaken with a view to reducing the number of qualified applicants to administrative posts in the public sector. Concern is also expressed over the high proportion of drop-outs from general technical secondary education, which has reached 35 per cent of total enrolment.

### *Paragraph 265*

A thorough review of the State party's policies should be undertaken with regard to education and vocational training, with a view to expanding budgetary allocations for this section, expanding access to education and, in particular, reducing the number of student drop-outs. In this connection, the importance of higher education and vocational training in developing a robust economy is underlined.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Romania, ICESCR, E/1995/22 (1994) 26 at paras. 92 and 98.

### *Paragraph 92*

It is noted with concern that the whole system of education in Romania is functioning on the basis of governmental decrees and that since the Revolution of 1989 no specific laws have been adopted in this respect.

### *Paragraph 98*

Particular attention should be paid by the Government to the problem of street and abandoned children, and further efforts should be made to facilitate their access to all forms of primary and secondary education.

- Morocco, ICESCR, E/1995/22 (1994) 28 at paras. 111, 112 and 124.

### *Paragraph 111*

Concern is expressed over the persistence of a "dual" society characterized by disparities in the level of modernization and enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights which especially affect persons living in rural areas. These disparities are particularly evident in the marked differences in the levels of school attendance. The rate of primary school attendance in the urban areas is double that of the rural regions.

### *Paragraph 112*

The extent to which women enjoy the rights contained in the Covenant, in particular as regards matters arising under articles 6, 7, such as equal remuneration for equal work and employment opportunities, article 10, particularly relating to status of women in the family, and article 13, particularly in relation to the right to education, is of concern.

### *Paragraph 124*

More efforts should be made in the area of education, particularly in the less favoured rural areas, and an effort should also be made in the direction of reducing the apparent disparities between the rates of school attendance of boys and girls.

- Mauritius, ICESCR, E/1995/22 (1994) 37 at paras. 181 and 183.

### *Paragraph 181*

With regard to article 13, note is taken of the flaws in the educational system. In particular, it is



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

noted that the Mauritian school system is extremely competitive, which leads to widespread, Government-encouraged and costly private tuition and thus renders access to secondary and tertiary education more difficult for the poorer segments of the population. Concern is also expressed over the reintroduction of fees at the tertiary level of education, which constitutes a deliberate retrogressive step. It is further noted with concern that Kreol and Bhojpuri, the only languages spoken by the large majority of the population, are not used in the Mauritian educational system.

### *Paragraph 183*

It is of concern that the population of the island of Rodrigues enjoys the right to health and the right to education to a markedly lesser degree than the people on the island of Mauritius itself.

- The Gambia, ICESCR, E/1995/22 (1994) 42 at para. 203.

With regard to the right to education in article 13 of the Covenant, the absence of compulsory education in the Gambia is deeply regretted, and the attention of the Government is drawn to its obligation under the Covenant to ensure that "primary education shall be compulsory and available free for all". Concern is expressed not only about the high rates of illiteracy but also the gender disparities apparent in the figures. The latest UNICEF data reports that over 75 per cent of adults between the ages of 15 and 54 are functionally illiterate and that 90 per cent of the total are women. The same data source reports how women are disadvantaged educationally, females comprising only one third of primary school students and only one fourth of high school students. It is also of concern that, as a result of the absence of compulsory education legislation and because of the paucity of secondary school opportunities, most children complete their formal education by the age of 14 and informally enter the work force.

- Austria, ICESCR, E/1995/22 (1994) 50 at para. 258.

The Austrian authorities should continue their efforts to ensure *de facto* equality between men and women, especially in the areas of access to employment, remuneration for equal work, working conditions, the right to social security and participation in higher education.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, ICESCR, E/1995/22 (1994) 52 at paras. 275, 276, 278 and 291.

### *Paragraph 275*

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

The situation of disadvantaged groups in the education system is of particular concern. Specifically noted are the grave disparities which appear to prevail in the level of education depending on the social origin of the pupil. Regional differences in the quality of the education provided to children are also of concern.

### *Paragraph 276*

Insufficient measures have been taken towards the development of a universal preschool education scheme. The relatively low proportion of 16 to 18-year-olds who continue in full-time education, the large number of children who do not complete their schooling and the growing reliance in the context of the education system reform upon voluntary contributions by parents, are matters of concern. The lack of sufficient opportunities available to persons with disabilities to pursue their right to education within the mainstream is regretted.

### *Paragraph 278*

Efforts should be made to identify the needs of disadvantaged groups in the field of education and to draw on the results of any studies or reviews in the development of policy initiatives to respond to the needs of such groups. Priority should be given to expanding access to preschool education and to developing basic skill programmes in reading, writing and numeracy, particularly to the benefit of children up to the age of seven. Appropriate school training should also be made available to long-term unemployed persons.

### *Paragraph 291*

The information received regarding the treatment of Vietnamese asylum-seekers in Hong Kong is of deep concern. Of particular concern is the situation of the children. The statements made by the Government that these children have no entitlement to the enjoyment of the right to education or to other rights in view of their status as "illegal immigrants" is alarming.

- Mali, ICESCR, E/1995/22 (1994) 64 at paras. 344 and 352.

### *Paragraph 344*

According to a recent United Nations report, females in Mali receive only 29 per cent as much

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

in the relevant age group (males 17 per cent, females 14 per cent); secondary enrolment is equivalent

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

With regard to education, it is noted that education is provided only in Dutch, the official language of the State party. It is regretted that no efforts are being made by the Government to promote the use of Sranan Tongo, which is spoken by most Surinamese, or to preserve the native languages of the various indigenous groups. Education provided in Dutch only may serve as a contributing factor to the high incidence of school drop-outs.

- Colombia, ICESCR, E/1996/22 (1995) 41 at paras. 192 and 198.

### *Paragraph 192*

Effective access to education is limited in the State party. Universal primary education, as provided for in the Covenant, is not yet attained. The decline in the quality of secondary education and the work situation of teachers are also of concern.

### *Paragraph 198*

The Government should take all necessary steps to ensure for all the right to free primary education. The Government should take measures to improve the quality of secondary education and the material conditions of teaching staff.

- Ukraine, ICESCR, E/1996/22 (1995) 50 at para. 268.

It is recalled that fulfilment of the right to education involves an obligation for the Government to provide free primary education for all, including children with disabilities and children assigned to homes or institutions.

- Algeria, ICESCR, E/1996/22 (1995) 54 at paras. 294 and 303.

### *Paragraph 294*

It is deplored that fundamental freedoms such as the right to work, to education, to freedom of movement, and the right freely to choose a spouse are not fully guaranteed for women in the State party.

### *Paragraph 303*

The Government is requested to take all necessary measures to ensure that girls are fully able to exercise their right to education and to mental and physical health. Such measures should be accompanied by the setting up of a data-collection system to enable their impact to be assessed.

- Paraguay, ICESCR, E/1997/22 (1996) 22 at para. 91.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

The Government of Paraguay should energetically pursue its efforts and increase its investment in education, particularly primary education. Greater attention should be paid to this sector in the technical cooperation programmes in which the country is involved. The Government should expand the campaign undertaken by the Directorate-General for Human Rights of the Ministry of Justice and Labour in relation to human rights education at the primary, secondary and university levels and extend its scope to include elected officials, the military, professors and the judiciary.

- Guatemala, ICESCR, E/1997/22 (1996) 29 at para. 145.

The value of the shift in health and education policy towards promoting access to health care and services and to education for the most disadvantaged groups of society is acknowledged and it is strongly recommended that this focus be maintained. Attention is also drawn to the urgent need to undertake further measures to tackle the problem of illiteracy.

- El Salvador, ICESCR, E/1997/22 (1996) 34 at paras. 168 and 180.

### *Paragraph 168*

Effective access to education by children of school age is unsatisfactory in El Salvador. The fact that the objective of universal primary education has not yet been achieved is of particular concern. The high drop-out rate, high absenteeism, failure rates and the high rates of illiteracy as a result of exclusion from the education system are also of concern. Although child labour is often necessary for the survival of the family, it is one of the factors hampering the implementation of articles 13 and 14 of the Covenant, and the apparent lack of action by the authorities to remedy the situation is disturbing.

### *Paragraph 180*

The education system should continue to be reformed in order to make primary education available to all and to reduce illiteracy. Measures should be taken by the authorities to enable working children to receive an adequate education.

- Guinea, ICESCR, E/1997/22 (1996) 39 at para. 208.

It is recalled that illiteracy persists, and the fact that the Government has not given enough priority in the structural adjustment agreement to schooling and education is regretted. It is necessary to give children the right to schooling and training that will enable them to be a part of the socio-economic fabric, which is still in great need of suitably trained people to deal with underdevelopment. It is noted that discrimination against women is on the rise, which is apparent from the adult illiteracy rate,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

access to education and the school drop-out rate among girls. Furthermore, according to information received, the school-attendance rate remains low, primary schools are overcrowded and the principle of free primary education guaranteed by law is not always applied. The Government is also apparently not willing to increase the education budget in order to deal with the serious shortage of teachers.

- Dominican Republic, ICESCR, E/1997/22 (1996) 44 at para. 228.

It is noted with great concern that State expenditures on education and training as a proportion of public expenditure are less than half the average in Latin America.

- Portugal (Macau), ICESCR, E/1997/22 (1996) 48 at para. 254.

It is noted with concern that no special programme exists to help the physically and mentally disabled to facilitate their access to employment, education and public facilities.

- Finland, ICESCR, E/1997/22 (1996) 55 at paras. 312 and 319.

### *Paragraph 312*

The recent increase in the school drop-out rate, which particularly affects children from economically disadvantaged groups and children belonging to minorities, is of concern.

### *Paragraph 319*

Attention is drawn to the emerging problem of school drop-out, which mainly affects children from vulnerable social groups, such as economically disadvantaged children and children belonging to minorities. In this regard, specific measures should be taken to ensure that these children can complete their studies to the extent of their academic capacities.

- Zimbabwe, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 24 at para. 77.

Concern is expressed about cutbacks in education expenditure, which result in non-compliance with article 13, paragraph 2 (a), of the Covenant, requiring free, compulsory and universal primary education.

- Russian Federation, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 27 at paras. 115 and 129.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 115*

The deterioration of the educational system in the State party and its effects on school achievement levels, on attendance, and drop-out rates among the young at all levels of the system are of concern.

### *Paragraph 129*

It is strongly recommended that firmer and more effective measures be adopted to reinforce the educational system, reduce the school drop-out rate and enhance the protection of children against illegal employment and other abuses.

- Peru, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 33 at paras. 141, 144 and 166.

### *Paragraph 141*

The greatest obstacles to the fulfilment of economic, social and cultural rights include the failure to address the persistent and serious problems of poverty; 60 per cent of Peruvians live beneath the poverty line and do not enjoy proper health and educational facilities and the impoverishment of State schools, coupled with a decline in teachers' salaries and the consequent deterioration in educational standards, accompanied by the increasing poverty of families.

### *Paragraph 144*

The insufficient fulfilment of the right to education of the indigenous and black populations is of concern. For example, about 22 per cent of Quechua-speaking persons in the State party, and among them 31 per cent of females over six years old, receive no schooling at any level. This situation has been aggravated lately as a result of the decline in government expenditures relative to gross domestic product.

### *Paragraph 166*

The Government should increase its investment in education. In this respect, the State party's obligation to ensure compulsory and free primary education to all children, with a view to reducing the illiteracy rate, is recalled.

- Dominican Republic, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 43 at para. 232.

The State party should take effective measures at the educational and socio-economic levels in order to fulfill its obligations under the Covenant, with a view to stemming the outflow of skilled workers from the State party.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 56 at paras. 301, 302, 312 and 314.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 301*

Concern is expressed that the educational structure in Northern Ireland is heavily segregated, with most Protestants attending Protestant schools and most Catholics attending Catholic schools and only approximately 2 per cent of the school population attending integrated schools. The current government policy, which appears to consist of a willingness to consider the conversion of existing Protestant or Catholic schools into integrated schools if it is the wish of the majority in a given school, is ineffective and likely to preserve the status quo. This situation is particularly deplorable given that it has been reported that approximately 30 per cent of parents in Northern Ireland would prefer to send their children to integrated schools.

### *Paragraph 302*

Concern is expressed at the plight of the approximately 13,000 children permanently excluded from school and at the fact that a disproportionate number of these children are of African-Caribbean origin.

### *Paragraph 312*

Appropriate measures should be considered in Northern Ireland to facilitate the establishment of additional integrated schools in areas where a significant number of parents have indicated their desire to have their children enrolled in such schools.

### *Paragraph 314*

Uniform defined criteria should be formulated for school exclusions. The State party should report on what government programmes, if any, exist to facilitate the insertion of excluded young people into alternative training or apprenticeship programmes.

- Azerbaijan, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 61 at paras. 342 and 355.

### *Paragraph 342*

It is noted with concern that the general shortage of resources is weakening the educational system and corrupting the traditionally high educational standards of the State party. Education has also become more costly, which is having a disproportionate effect on the poor.

### *Paragraph 355*

Resources should be allocated to ensure that national educational standards are strictly observed. The Government is urged to address the weakening educational system, which is having a disproportionate effect on the poor.

- Luxembourg, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 69 at paras. 398 and 406.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 398*

Concern is expressed about the high drop-out rates among the youth of secondary school age.

### *Paragraph 406*

The State party should engage in a review process with a view to decreasing the high number of school drop-outs. The State party is encouraged to adopt the draft law guaranteeing the right to continuing education.

- Saint Vincent and The Grenadines, ICESCR, E/1998/22 (1997) 72 at para. 435.

With respect to the right to education, it is noted with concern that there is no legal requirement that children attend school. Other matters of concern include the lack of teachers and teaching materials, notably at the primary level, the recent significant increase in educational fees, and the insufficiency of facilities at the post-secondary level of education. Moreover, the recent economic downturn has led to a situation in which more and more children do not attend school, thus affecting those children's right to compulsory primary education. The lack of literacy programmes for adults is also of concern.

- Sri Lanka, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 22 at para. 72.

The uncertain situation of 85,000 Tamils of Indian origin living in Sri Lanka is noted with concern. They possess neither Indian nor Sri Lankan citizenship, have no access to basic services such as education, and do not enjoy their economic, social and cultural rights.

- Nigeria, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 27 at paras. 118, 124-126, 134 and 135.

### *Paragraph 118*

Children are not better off. Many resort to prostitution to feed themselves. The rate of school drop-outs at the primary school age is over 20 per cent. Twelve million children are estimated to hold one job or another. For those who go to school, up to 80 or more are crammed into dilapidated classrooms originally meant to take a maximum of only 40.

### *Paragraph 124*

The fact that the Government's social and health allocations are consistently diminishing and that the authorities have reintroduced primary school fees in certain states and imposed hospital charges where they did not exist before is regretted.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 125*

Schoolchildren often have to carry their desks and chairs from their homes to the school. According to reports by UNICEF, there has been a marked reduction in school-age children going to school as parents cannot afford to pay the new drastically increased school fees for primary and secondary school. Recent poor educational quality is due partly to little teacher attention being devoted to schoolwork because of poor salaries, leading to incessant strikes and school closures.

### *Paragraph 126*

University fees increased dramatically in 1997 and students in some universities, especially in southern Nigeria, were required to pay 10 times as much as other students. In addition, satellite campuses were forced to close for no particular reason.

### *Paragraph 134*

Legislation should be enacted and all appropriate measures should be taken to protect children against the many negative consequences ensuing from child labour, dropping out of school, malnutrition, and discrimination against children born out of wedlock.

### *Paragraph 135*

Steps should be taken to enforce the right to compulsory, free primary education.

- Poland, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 32 at para. 157.

Special care should be taken to ensure full respect for the rights of all religious groups, particularly concerning issues of national policy such as education, gender equality and health care. The rights of all minority groups with regard to their right to participate in national political and economic life and the right to practise and teach their culture should be fully respected.

- The Netherlands, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 37 at paras. 185 and 193.

### *Paragraph 185*

The consequences of the Tuition Fees Act, which has led to a constant increase in the cost of education are of concern. Such increases are contrary to the principle of equality of opportunity between children of rich families and children of poor families.

### *Paragraph 193*

The appropriate steps should be taken to alleviate or eliminate the adverse effects of the Tuition Fees Act.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- The Netherlands (Aruba), ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 40 at paras. 207 and 208.

### *Paragraph 207*

A plan of action should be adopted urgently to move towards the provision of free compulsory primary education as required by article 14 of the Covenant.

### *Paragraph 208*

The Government should intensify its efforts to address the school drop-out problem.

- The Netherlands (Antilles), ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 41 at paras. 218 and 223.

### *Paragraph 218*

Concern is expressed at the increase in the school drop-out rate, the causes of which include the difficulties which have emerged in education due to the existence of several tongues spoken as first languages on the islands and the use of Dutch as the language of education.

### *Paragraph 223*

In addressing the school drop-out problem, the implementation of the Government's programme for education in the students' mother tongues along with the progressive introduction of Dutch should be expedited. The urgent adoption of a plan of action to move towards the provision of free compulsory primary education as required by article 14 of the Covenant is also recommended.

- Israel, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 43 at paras. 245, 252, 255, 265 and 269.

### *Paragraph 245*

The forcible separation of Palestinian families because of closures and the refusal of Israeli authorities to allow students in Gaza to return to their universities in the West Bank are of concern.

### *Paragraph 252*

It is noted with deep concern that a significant proportion of Palestinian Arab citizens of Israel continue to live in unrecognized villages without access to water, electricity, sanitation and roads. Such an existence has caused extreme difficulties for the villagers in regard to their access to health care, education and employment opportunities.

### *Paragraph 255*

The large gaps within the Israeli educational system are noted with regret. Drop-out rates are higher and eligibility for matriculation certificates is lower within certain segments of society: Arabs and Jews in poor neighbourhoods and in development towns, where many of the residents are Jews of Asian and African origin, including Ethiopian Jews. The gap in educational expenditure per capita

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

for the Arab sector, which is substantially less than for the Jewish sector, is of concern.

### *Paragraph 265*

The Government should undertake to ensure safe passage at checkpoints for Palestinian medical staff and people seeking treatment, the unhampered flow of essential foodstuffs and supplies, the safe conduct of students and teachers to and from schools, and the reunification of families separated by closures.

### *Paragraph 269*

Measures should be undertaken to address the inequalities in the educational system at the secondary and university levels, particularly in terms of budget allocations. A study should be undertaken on the viability of establishing an Arab university within Israel for the purpose of ensuring equal opportunities and access to higher education in the respective official languages.

- Germany, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 54 at paras. 321, 328 and 336.

### *Paragraph 321*

It is noted with concern that tuition fees for university education are increasing, despite the fact that article 13 of the Covenant calls for the progressive introduction of free higher education.

### *Paragraph 328*

The State party should implement various educational programmes for young people and other vulnerable groups, especially those intended to create employment and to improve the level of employment in eastern Germany.

### *Paragraph 336*

The State party should avoid increases in university tuition fees.

- Switzerland, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 59 at paras. 364 and 371.

### *Paragraph 364*

The cantonal laws should be further harmonized to ensure due respect for the provisions of the Covenant, particularly with regard to fundamental rights such as the right to work, education and culture.

### *Paragraph 371*

The State party should play a more active role in promoting equal access to higher education for women, immigrants and ethnic minorities.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Canada, ICESCR, E/1999/22 (1998) 63 at paras. 414 and 424.

### *Paragraph 414*

It is of concern that loan programmes for post-secondary education are available only to Canadian citizens and permanent residents and that recognized refugees who do not have permanent residence status, as well as asylum seekers, are ineligible for these loan programmes. It is also of concern that tuition fees for university education in Canada have dramatically increased in the past few years, making it very difficult for those in need to attend university in the absence of a loan or grant. A further subject of concern is the significant increase in the average student debt on graduation.

### *Paragraph 424*

The Government should develop and expand adequate programmes to address the financial obstacles to post-secondary education for low-income students, without any discrimination on the basis of citizenship status.

- Iceland, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 26 at para. 83.

The high rate at which young people drop out of upper secondary education is of concern. In addition, it is noted that 60 per cent of university graduates are female, and only 40 per cent male, which is explained by the fact that most males receive vocational training in secondary school and are determined to pursue a trade rather than a university education.

- Denmark, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 29 at para. 116.

In regard to the emerging problem of school drop-out, which mainly affects children coming from vulnerable social groups, such as economically disadvantaged children or children belonging to minorities, specific measures should be taken to ensure that these children can complete their studies to the extent of their academic capacities.

- Ireland, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 33 at paras. 134 and 150.

### *Paragraph 134*

While the State party's National Anti-Poverty Strategy addresses issues relating to educational disadvantage and rural poverty, the Strategy does not adopt a human rights framework consistent with the provisions of the Covenant.

### *Paragraph 150*

The State party should adequately supervise the quality of education received by students at the

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

primary school level of the formal educational system in order to ensure that the educational system is in conformity with articles 13 and 14 of the Covenant.

- Tunisia, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 36 at paras. 168, 169 and 180.

### *Paragraph 168*

The disparities of living standards, especially with regard to education, health, life expectancy, child mortality, access to piped water, electricity and employment, to be found between the prosperous north-east coast of Tunisia and the underdeveloped north-west, between the interior of the country and the south, and between the towns and rural areas, are of concern.

### *Paragraph 169*

With respect to articles 3 and 13 of the Covenant, it is noted that illiteracy still affects one third of the population, 42 per cent of women and 23 per cent of men, and that serious disparities continue to exist between the literacy rates of boys and girls at all age levels and between urban and rural areas. The serious problem of school drop-out, and especially that half of those enrolled in primary schools do not continue with secondary education, is noted. Of concern are students who drop out at the end of the first cycle of basic education, of whom 90 per cent had “exhausted their right to retake courses”. The discrepancy between the age fixed in law for the completion of mandatory education, which is 16 years, and the minimum age for employment, which is 15 years for the manufacturing sector and 13 years for the agricultural sector, is of concern. This discrepancy might encourage adolescents to drop out of secondary school.

### *Paragraph 180*

The State party should make efforts to guarantee a basic education to all children, including those who fail to keep pace with their peers. The problem areas identified with the phenomenon of drop-out, including inadequacy of pedagogical tools, excessive numbers of students per class and per teacher, lack of interest on the part of parents in sending their children to school and distance between school and home, should be addressed, particularly in the less developed rural areas. The State party should take all necessary corrective measures, including revising the minimum age of employment, particularly in agriculture, to address the problem of students dropping out of colleges and secondary schools. Further, with regard to article 13 of the Covenant, the State party is encouraged to establish separate courses on human rights, particularly at the university level.

- Solomon Islands, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 40 at para. 206.

The absence of compulsory primary education in the State party is of concern, with merely 60 per cent of school age children having access to primary education. Attention is drawn to the obligations under articles 13, paragraph 2 (a) and 14 of the Covenant, which stipulate that primary education

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

shall be compulsory and free of charge, and to General Comment No. 11 (1999) concerning plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant). In particular, concern is expressed about the low literacy rate among adults, and especially among women. Adult literacy is estimated to be as low as 23 per cent, which is to a high degree attributable to the lack of financial resources for education.

- Bulgaria, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 46 at paras. 231, 233 and 239.

### *Paragraph 231*

The lack of opportunities for minorities to receive education in their own languages is regretted.

### *Paragraph 233*

Concern is expressed that the fees introduced in higher education may represent a serious obstacle for disadvantaged groups of society seeking such an education.

### *Paragraph 239*

The State party should continue its efforts to integrate ethnic minorities into society, and undertake measures to provide the opportunity for such minorities to be educated in their own languages.

- Armenia, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 54 at paras. 306 and 310.

### *Paragraph 306*

The marked decline in the percentage of government allocations for education relative to allocations for other sectors is noted with concern, as is the increase of the fee-paying educational sector.

### *Paragraph 310*

The State party should take measures to ensure that the quality of the education system is monitored and guaranteed, particularly in private educational institutions.

- Cameroon, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 56 at paras. 341-343 and 357.

### *Paragraph 341*

It is noted with deep concern that there is no legislation in the State party which provides for free primary education. The requirement of a parental contribution in the form of compulsory fees levied by primary schools which, in view of high levels of poverty, greatly restrict access to primary education, particularly for girls, is regretted.

### *Paragraph 342*

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

The inadequate salaries earned by teachers and the lack of school buildings and other infrastructure and of services, particularly in rural areas, are matters of deep concern. The imbalance in the distribution of education resources between the State party's 10 provinces is deplored.

### *Paragraph 343*

The high level of illiteracy still existing in the State party is of concern, as is the cultural preference given to the education of male children. This is reflected in the higher illiteracy rate of women, which is 49.9 per cent compared with 30 per cent for men.

### *Paragraph 357*

The Government should take effective measures to end all forms of compulsory parental contribution for primary education. The State party is urged to allocate increased resources to education, in particular for infrastructure and human resources, especially in rural areas. Attention is drawn to General Comment No. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant).

- Mexico, ICESCR, E/2000/22 (1999) 62 at para. 380.

The persisting plight of indigenous populations is of concern, particularly those of Chiapas, Guerrero, Veracruz and Oaxaca, who have limited access to health services, education, work, adequate nutrition and housing.

- Italy, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 34 at paras. 124, 125, 139 and 141.

### *Paragraph 124*

With respect to education, the high rate of young people dropping out of secondary education is noted with concern.

### *Paragraph 125*

Concern is expressed about the controversial proposal in the State party's school education reform programme to give private schools some public funding.

### *Paragraph 139*

It is recommended that the State party draw up a national strategy and plan of action to address the significant problems relating to school drop-outs and youth unemployment.

### *Paragraph 141*

With regard to the public funding of private schools, the State party is reminded that any such funding must be without discrimination on any of the prohibited grounds.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Egypt, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 38 at paras. 163, 166 and 182.

### *Paragraph 163*

Deep concern is expressed over reports that children under 12 years of age work more than six hours daily in the agricultural sector, which deprives them of their right to education.

### *Paragraph 166*

It is noted with concern that despite the achievements of Egypt in the field of education, inequality of access to education between boys and girls, high drop-out rates for boys and high illiteracy rates among adults, particularly women, persist.

### *Paragraph 182*

The State party is urged to undertake measures to address the economic, social and cultural factors that are the root causes of the problem of inequality of access to education, high drop-out rates for boys and high illiteracy rates among adults, in particular women.

- Congo, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 43 at paras. 202, 208 and 214.

### *Paragraph 202*

Deep concern is expressed about discrimination against women. Marriage and family laws overtly discriminate against women (for instance, adultery is illegal for women but, in certain circumstances, not for men; while the Legal Code provides that 30 per cent of the deceased husband's estate goes to the wife, in practice the wife often loses all rights of inheritance). Domestic violence, including rape and beatings, is widespread but rarely reported, and there are no legal provisions for punishing the offenders. Furthermore, despite the provision in Congolese legislation that endorses the principle of equal pay for equal work, women in the formal sector are under-represented and encounter discriminatory promotion patterns. Women in rural areas are especially disadvantaged in terms of education and employment conditions, including wages.

### *Paragraph 208*

Profound dissatisfaction is expressed about the education system in the Congo. Although the Congo used to have quite a developed education system, it has seriously deteriorated as a result of economic mismanagement, the shortage of resources and political unrest. According to the delegation, there are fewer children enrolling in school, a shortage of teachers and teaching materials, and the school buildings are in a deplorable state.

### *Paragraph 214*

The State party is urged to pay due attention to the rehabilitation of the educational infrastructure by allocating the necessary funds for teachers' salaries, teaching materials and school building repairs.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Jordan, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 49 at para. 227.

The State party's commitment towards improving access to education, especially for girls, is welcomed.

- Mongolia, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 53 at paras. 265, 275 and 284.

### *Paragraph 265*

The Committee notes with appreciation that the State party is developing international cooperation with a view to resolving the social and economic problems of its population. In particular the "Poverty Partnership Agreement" signed by the State party with the Asian Development Bank is noted. This agreement allows Mongolia to draw US\$ 40 million per year for poverty reduction, the achievement of full primary education and the reduction of infant mortality rates by 50 per cent by 2005.

### *Paragraph 275*

The Committee regrets to learn about the decrease in government spending on education since 1990 and the subsequent deterioration in the quality of education. Particular concern is expressed about the high incidence of school drop-out, most common among herder families where children have to work.

### *Paragraph 284*

It is recommended that the State party address, independently and through international cooperation, the problems it is facing in enhancing the quality of school curricula, and in addressing the educational difficulties confronting Mongolia, such as its high drop-out rate.

- Sudan, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 57 at para. 299.

The State party's efforts in the field of education are welcomed, in particular the establishment of 16 new universities, located in each department of the country, and the increased enrolment of women at all levels of education.

- Kyrgyzstan, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 62 at para. 362.

The State party is called upon to take special care to ensure the right to education, in particular of the girl child.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Portugal, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 70 at para. 417.

The relatively high school drop-out rates and the rate of high illiteracy in the State party are noted with concern.

- Finland, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 73 at para. 459.

The State party is called upon to take special care in ensuring the equality of standards in education for all in accordance with article 13 of the Covenant and the Committee's General Comments Nos. 11 and 13.

- Belgium, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 77 at paras. 477 and 489.

### *Paragraph 477*

It is of deep concern that the State party has not established adequate mechanisms to ensure uniformity in the application of educational standards, including international norms on education, in all regions, owing to the fact that the regional governments have primary responsibility in the formulation of educational policy.

### *Paragraph 489*

It is recommended that the State party establish an adequate mechanism to monitor and ensure uniformity of educational standards, such as those arising from international legal obligations, throughout the country.

- Yugoslavia (preliminary), ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 80 at para. 509.

In the context of article 13 of the Covenant, the State party is referred to General Comment No. 13 (1999) on the right to education, paragraphs 38-40, and urged to introduce legislation and other measures which ensure the academic freedom of all staff and students throughout the educational sector.

- Morocco, ICESCR, E/2001/22 (2000) 82 at paras. 543 and 566.

### *Paragraph 543*

Deep concern is expressed about the low level of primary school attendance. Currently less than 50 per cent of children of both sexes are being regularly educated. In addition, access of young girls to education is considerably more limited, particularly in the rural areas, which accounts for the fact that

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

the adult illiteracy rate is 65 per cent for women, as against 40 per cent for men.

### *Paragraph 566*

The State party is strongly urged to ensure access to free and compulsory primary education for all, especially for women and girl children, and particularly in the rural areas, taking into consideration General Comments Nos. 11 and 13 on the right to education, including primary education.

- Venezuela, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 29 at paras. 84 and 103.

### *Paragraph 84*

The Committee is concerned that the non-issue of personal documentation to refugees and asylum-seekers by the State authorities seriously hinders their enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights, including the rights to work, health and education.

### *Paragraph 103*

It is recommended that the State party implement, with the assistance of UNESCO, a comprehensive National Education for All Plan as required by the UNESCO Dakar Framework for Action: Education for All. It is also recommended that the State party reflect in the Plan articles 13 and 14 of the Covenant and General Comments 11 and 13.

- Honduras, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 33 at paras. 136, 157 and 159.

### *Paragraph 136*

Concern is expressed about the limited possibilities for indigenous peoples to education and to have access to the judicial system in their native languages.

### *Paragraph 157*

The State party is urged to adopt a comprehensive National Education for All Plan (EFA), as anticipated by paragraph 16 of the Dakar Framework of Action. When formulating and implementing its EFA Plan, the State party is urged to take into account the Committee's General Comments 11 and 13 and to establish an effective monitoring system for the Plan. The State party is also encouraged to seek technical advice and assistance from UNESCO in relation to both the formulation and implementation of its EFA Plan.

### *Paragraph 159*

The State party should undertake measures to ensure that indigenous populations are able to be educated and to have access to the judicial system in their own languages.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Republic of Korea, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 45 at paras. 237, 239 and 252.

### *Paragraph 237*

It is noted with concern that the low quality of education in public schools is compelling families to supplement the education of their children with private instruction, thereby placing undue financial burden especially on lower-income groups.

### *Paragraph 239*

It is noted that education is free and compulsory only at the primary school level, which is not commensurate with the State party's high level of economic development.

### *Paragraph 252*

It is recommended that the State party establish a plan to strengthen the public education system in conformity with article 13 of the Covenant and General Comment Number 13 and in accordance with the State party's high level of economic development. The plan should include the following elements: a reasonable timetable for specific actions for the introduction of free and compulsory secondary education; a re-examination of the functions and quality of the public education system relative to private education, with a view to strengthening the former and easing the burden on low-income groups imposed by the latter; a study of accessibility of schools at all levels, including tertiary education, and specific actions to be taken to ensure equal access by all sectors of society; and a reassessment of the curricula at all levels of instruction directed at promoting respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms.

- Bolivia, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 52 at paras. 269, 279 and 299.

### *Paragraph 269*

Particular concern is expressed about the marginalization of, and discrimination against, indigenous communities who constitute the majority of Bolivia's rural population, and suffer from inadequate access to basic education, adequate housing, and health services. Moreover, it is of concern that the State party does not acknowledge the economic, social and cultural rights of indigenous populations as a distinct group.

### *Paragraph 279*

Concern is expressed about the limited possibilities for indigenous populations to enjoy education in their mother tongue and to use their mother tongue in their dealings with public authorities.

### *Paragraph 299*

It is recommended that the State party give priority to education in its budget, establish literacy programmes for adults, in particular in the rural areas, and make efforts to increase the school attendance levels of children under the age of nine. In this regard, the State party is urged to

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

implement a comprehensive National Education for All Plan, as anticipated by paragraph 16 of the Dakar Framework of Action, taking into account General Comment numbers 11 and 13.

- Senegal, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 61 at paras. 333, 360 and 383-385.

### *Paragraph 333*

The high proportion of government expenditure allocated to public education is welcomed.

### *Paragraph 360*

The low rate of primary school enrolment and high rate of illiteracy, especially among women are matters of concern. Also, there is concern that the State party is no longer always hiring trained teachers, but employs unskilled teachers as volunteers at lower wages, and that the number of drop-outs among primary and secondary school pupils is significant.

### *Paragraph 383*

Literacy programmes should be established for adults. Efforts should be intensified to increase the school attendance of children, especially at the primary level, to address the problem of drop-outs among primary and secondary pupils.

### *Paragraph 384*

The State party should review its current practice of employing unskilled teachers instead of hiring trained ones.

### *Paragraph 385*

The State party is urged to implement a comprehensive National Education for All Plan, as anticipated by paragraph 16 of the Dakar Framework for Action, taking into account General Comments No. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant).

- Syrian Arab Republic, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 67 at paras. 398, 399 and 434.

### *Paragraph 398*

The measures taken to provide health services and education for nomadic peoples, such as mobile first aid facilities and dispensaries and mobile schools and libraries, are noted with satisfaction.

### *Paragraph 399*

The measures taken pursuant to the Dakar Framework for Action, adopted at the World Education Forum in April 2000 to elaborate on a National Education For All Plan are welcomed.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 434*

The State party is urged to implement its comprehensive National Education For All Plan, as anticipated by paragraph 16 of the Dakar Framework for Action, taking into account General Comments No. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant) and General Comment No. 1 (2001) of the Committee on the Rights of the Child on the aims of education (art. 29, para. 1, of the Convention on the Rights of the Child). The State party is also urged to ratify the Convention against Discrimination in Education adopted by the General Conference of UNESCO in 1960.

### *See also:*

- Panama, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 73 at para. 478.
- Nepal, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 83 at para. 574.
  
- Panama, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 73 at paras. 461 and 479.

### *Paragraph 461*

Inadequate resources have been allocated to address the problems of primary and secondary education.

### *Paragraph 479*

Measures should be taken that are aimed at increasing the resources available to fight illiteracy and promote primary and secondary education.

- Ukraine, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 78 at paras. 498 and 513.

### *Paragraph 498*

It is noted with concern that the budgets allocated for education and scientific research have fallen sharply, leading to a deterioration in the quality of education. There is particular concern about obsolete teaching materials and equipment in schools and colleges, and the low levels of remuneration for teachers.

### *Paragraph 513*

All necessary measures should be taken to allocate the required resources to implement effectively the Law on Education adopted in 1991. The State party should ensure that General Comments No. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant), as well as General Comment No. 1 (2001) of the Committee on the Rights of the Child on the aims of education (art. 29, para. 1, of the Convention on the Rights of the Child), are duly taken into consideration when elaborating its educational policies. It is also recommended that the State party promote the participation of parents and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

communities, especially ethnic minorities, in school governance in order to improve enrolment rates and monitor the quality of education.

- Nepal, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 83 at paras. 545, 552 and 570.

### *Paragraph 545*

It is noted with concern that only Tibetans who arrived in Nepal before 1990 and the Bhutanese are recognized as refugees by the authorities. It is further noted that while the Tibetan refugees benefit from appropriate treatment, the Bhutanese refugees are not allowed to work, are not allowed freedom of movement outside their refugee camps, and do not have access to the same health and educational facilities as Nepalese citizens.

### *Paragraph 552*

Although the State party has initiated free primary education, the policy of compulsory education is yet to be implemented. Further, the great disparity in enrolment in primary schools between girls and boys, the high drop-out rate among pupils, and the low quality of education in public schools is noted.

### *Paragraph 570*

The State party should acknowledge people other than those from Tibet and Bhutan as refugees and provide the same kind of treatment to all refugees.

- Japan, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 90 at paras. 610, 611, 637 and 639.

### *Paragraph 610*

Concern is expressed about the frequently excessively competitive and stressful nature of all levels of education, which results in school absence, illness, and even suicide by students.

### *Paragraph 611*

Concern is expressed that there are very limited possibilities for children of minorities to enjoy education in their own language and about their own culture in public schools. It is also of concern that minority schools, such as Korean schools, are not officially recognized, even when they adhere to the national education curriculum, and therefore neither receive central government subsidies nor are able to provide qualification for university entrance examinations.

### *Paragraph 637*

A comprehensive review of the educational system be undertaken, taking into consideration General Comments No. 11 (1999) on plans of education for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant), and No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant), as well as General Comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education (art. 29, para. 1, of the Convention on the Rights of the Child) .



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

In particular, the review should focus on the frequent excessively competitive and stressful nature of all levels of education, which results in school absence, illness, and even suicide by students.

### *Paragraph 639*

Mother-tongue instruction should be introduced in the official curricula of public schools enrolling a significant number of pupils belonging to linguistic minorities. Minority schools should be officially recognized, in particular Korean schools, when they comply with the national education curriculum. Consequently subsidies and other financial assistance should be made available to these schools and their school leaving certificates should be recognized as university entrance examination qualifications.

- Germany, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 97 at paras. 671, 674 and 689.

### *Paragraph 671*

It is of concern that several Länder have abandoned the principle of free higher education by requiring the payment of fees, which in some cases are allocated to cover administrative costs of the Länder, and not university expenditure.

### *Paragraph 674*

Institutional arrangements within the public administration should be reviewed to ensure that its obligations under the Covenant are taken into account at an early stage in the formulation of legislation and policy on issues relating to social welfare and assistance, housing, health and education. The introduction of "human rights impact assessments", comparable to environmental impact assessments, is further encouraged to ensure that the provisions of the Covenant are given due attention in all legislative and administrative policy and decision-making processes.

### *Paragraph 689*

The Federal Government should introduce a reduction of tuition fees in the national framework legislation regulating higher education, with a view to abolishing them.

- Israel, ICESCR, E/2002/22 (2001) 103 at para. 704.

Deep concern is expressed about the continuing gross violations of economic, social and cultural rights in the occupied territories, especially the severe measures adopted to restrict the movement of civilians between points within and outside the occupied territories, severing their access to food, water, health care, education and work.

## CEDAW

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Tunisia, CEDAW, A/50/38 (1995) 52 at paras. 267 and 276.

### *Paragraph 267*

The high rate of illiteracy among women is of concern, since access to education is fundamental to the empowerment of women. Equally important is the fact that the number of school drop-outs among girls is high.

### *Paragraph 276*

Ways and means should be envisaged to encourage women and girls to enrol in science fields.

- Uganda, CEDAW, A/50/38 (1995) 61 at paras. 334, 342 and 343.

### *Paragraph 334*

The privatization of pre-school education, which is an impediment to early education for children, particularly for those in the rural areas, is of concern.

### *Paragraph 342*

Pre-school facilities should be made accessible and affordable, particularly for low means families.

### *Paragraph 343*

Programmes should be instituted that allow for continued education for school drop-outs and family life education should be part of the school curriculum.

- Russian Federation, CEDAW, A/50/38 (1995) 99 at para. 547.

Concern is expressed over the inadequate public health financing which led to a reduction in guaranteed state medical aid to women and children, while state expenditure for education in general was being curtailed.

- Paraguay, CEDAW, A/51/38 (1996) 16 para. 130.

The State party should strengthen and broaden its initiatives to extend bilingual education to all citizens, in particular women, and to combat the social, economic and cultural factors causing the high drop-out and illiteracy rates among women.

- Ethiopia, CEDAW, A/51/38 (1996) 19 at para. 158.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Measures, including temporary special measures and programmes, must be adopted to give girls and women equal access to high quality education and training.

- Slovenia, CEDAW, A/52/38/Rev.1 part I (1997) 15 at paras. 104 and 113.

### *Paragraph 104*

Concern is expressed over the fact that less than 30 per cent of children under three years of age and slightly more than half of all children between three and six were in formal day care, and that the remaining children, while cared for by family members and other private individuals, might miss out on educational and social opportunities offered in formal day-care institutions.

### *Paragraph 113*

Systematic efforts should be made to ensure that women students are encouraged to enter diverse disciplines so as to overcome the clustering of female students in certain disciplines at schools and universities. Such measures could include special counselling and gender-specific temporary measures with numerical goals and timetables. Women's studies should also be formally established at universities and made part of the school curriculum. The Government should review its gender-neutral educational framework and develop positive measures to counteract hidden stereotypical educational messages and practices.

- Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, CEDAW, A/52/38/Rev.1 part I (1997) 21 at para. 138.

Concern is expressed over the fact that the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women is not taught in schools. The high rate of teenage and pre-teen pregnancy, which sometimes forces children to be mothers with very serious, negative consequences for their future, in particular, the interruption of their education, is also of concern.

- Turkey, CEDAW, A/52/38/Rev.1 part I (1997) 24 at para. 201.

Continuing support should be given to female students in order to increase the rate of female university graduates and their participation in non-traditional fields.

- Namibia, CEDAW, A/52/38/Rev.1 part II (1997) 82 at paras. 106 and 108.

### *Paragraph 106*

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

The low level of participation of women in higher education and the high drop-out rate of girls from the formal education system are noted with serious concern.

### *Paragraph 108*

Concern is expressed that pregnant teenage women are punished by expulsion from school.

- Israel, CEDAW, A/52/38/Rev.1 part II (1997) 87 at para. 176.

Measures taken to guarantee the exercise of human rights of non-Jewish women, including those living in the rural areas, particularly in relation to health, education and employment, should be intensified. Special measures should be taken to close the gap between Arab and Jewish schools and to address the higher drop-out rates of Arab and Bedouin girls. Adequate resources should be allocated for school facilities and education opportunities, including scholarships.

- Australia, CEDAW, A/52/38/Rev.1 part II (1997) 111 at para. 406.

The Government should strengthen its support for women's studies, provide funding for research and teaching, and facilitate international academic exchange and cooperation in that field.

- Indonesia, CEDAW, A/53/38/Rev.1 part I (1998) 24 at para. 291.

Women's low rates of participation in education, as well as the high level of illiteracy among women, especially in the rural areas, is of concern. Education is a basic human right and while the State party has made some efforts to facilitate the education of poor but gifted children, concern is expressed about the access to education of all children, including those from minority groups.

- Mexico, CEDAW, A/53/38/Rev.1 part I (1998) 32 at para. 403.

Efforts should be continued to reduce poverty among rural women, particularly indigenous women, and to work together with non-governmental organizations, making special efforts to promote education, employment and health programmes conducive to the integration of women into the development process, both as beneficiaries and as protagonists.

- Slovakia, CEDAW, A/53/38/Rev.1 part II (1998) 55 at para. 85.

The establishment of and increase in "household management schools", which cater to female

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

students and train them for traditional roles, thus promoting gender stereotyping, are of concern.

- Nigeria, CEDAW, A/53/38/Rev.1 part II (1998) 61 at para. 167.

Efforts should be increased through the implementation of a specific programme to reduce illiteracy among women, particularly in rural areas, and promote access by girls to secondary education. The Government should ensure that primary education is free.

### *See also:*

- Democratic Republic of the Congo, CEDAW, A/55/38 part I (2000) 21 at para. 224.
- Panama, CEDAW, A/53/38/Rev.1 part II (1998) 64 at para. 199.

Concern is expressed at the fact that 53 per cent of the female population is illiterate, the majority of these being indigenous women. The persistence of gender stereotypes, which results in a large number of adolescent girls terminating their education at an early age to marry or to undertake domestic work, is also of concern.

- China, CEDAW, A/54/38/Rev.1 part I (1999) 26 at para. 295.

The Government should adopt a specific time-frame, with budgetary and resource allocation, for the achievement of universal literacy and primary education. It should also abolish official and unofficial school fees, which often result in the exclusion of girls from enjoying their right to education, particularly in poor rural areas. Special measures and incentives should be introduced to ensure that girls are able to fully utilize access to primary education, and are given opportunities for secondary and higher education and vocational training.

- Belize, CEDAW, A/54/38/Rev.1 part II (1999) 49 at paras. 52 and 53.

### *Paragraph 52*

The consequences of the Church-State system of education on girls' and young women's right to education are of serious concern. In this regard, the concern is that schools are free to expel girls from school because of pregnancy and only a few secondary schools allow girls to continue their education after pregnancy. This violates not only the Convention but also the Constitution of Belize. That under the same system, schools are allowed to dismiss unwed teachers who become pregnant is a further concern. This is also in violation of the Convention.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 53*

The Government is urged to place the highest priority on eliminating discrimination against women and girls in education because of pregnancy, through both legislative provisions and adequate policy measures.

- Nepal, CEDAW, A/54/38/Rev.1 part II (1999) 57 at paras. 141 and 142.

### *Paragraph 141*

The Government is urged to introduce and implement policies and programmes for free and compulsory education for all girls at the primary level; vocational and skill development training for income generation, especially for marginalized rural women; and the facilitation of women's access to non-traditional and non-stereotypical education. The Government should take concrete measures to increase the number of women in higher education, in particular in non-traditional fields. School curricula and textbooks should also be reviewed in order to eliminate gender stereotypes.

### *Paragraph 142*

Effective measures, including incentives, should be taken to ensure that parents comply with the obligation of compulsory education. Massive social awareness campaigns should be undertaken to encourage women's education.

- India, CEDAW, A/55/38 part I (2000) 7 at paras. 64 and 65.

### *Paragraph 64*

The fundamental right to education under the Constitution and recognized by the Supreme Court has not been realized by providing girls with access to primary and secondary education. Budgetary allocation for education is still far below India's commitment with regard to the Beijing Platform for Action.

### *Paragraph 65*

The Government is urged to take affirmative action, set a time-frame and provide adequate resources for primary and secondary education so as to give girls equal access to education and eradicate adult illiteracy among women. The Government should make primary and secondary education compulsory by introducing and enforcing relevant regulations.

- Jordan, CEDAW, A/55/38 part I (2000) 16 at para. 159.

Satisfaction is expressed over the level of education that girls and women have achieved, in particular, the parity in enrolment rates in the basic and secondary cycles and the fact that the gap between

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

women and men in university education is closing. The Government's efforts to further reduce women's illiteracy rate are also commended.

- Burkina Faso, CEDAW, A/55/38 part I (2000) 25 at para. 268.

It is recommended that the Government accord priority to the education of girls and women, including through seeking international assistance, to ensure and promote universal enrolment of girls and preclude drop-out. The Government is called upon to allocate more financial and human resources to the education sector, to recruit more women teachers and to ensure that school textbooks no longer carry negative images of women.

- Germany, CEDAW, A/55/38 part I (2000) 29 at para. 318.

The Government is requested to undertake a comprehensive assessment of the situation of foreign women, including their access to education and training, work and work-related benefits, health care and social protection. The Government is also urged to strengthen its efforts for the social integration of foreign women through educational and employment services, and through awareness-raising of the population.

- Cameroon, CEDAW, A/55/38 part II (2000) 53 at paras. 44, 57 and 58.

### *Paragraph 44*

It is recognized that implementation of the structural adjustment programme, coupled with privatization, especially in the health and education sectors, poses serious challenges to the full implementation of the Convention.

### *Paragraph 57*

Despite the Government's efforts in the area of education, concern is expressed over the low rate of female literacy, the high female dropout rate, and the low rate of female enrolment in basic education.

### *Paragraph 58*

The Government is encouraged to intensify its efforts to promote female access to basic and secondary education and to develop programmes specifically designed to reduce female illiteracy.

- Republic of Moldova, CEDAW, A/55/38 part II (2000) 56 at para. 88.

The Government is commended for its efforts to ensure continued high levels of education in the

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

population in general, and women in particular.

- Iraq, CEDAW, A/55/38 part II (2000) 66 at paras. 197 and 198.

### *Paragraph 197*

The level of illiteracy among women, the increasing rate at which girls drop out of secondary and higher education, and the low representation of women in technical schools, are noted with concern.

### *Paragraph 198*

The Government is called upon to eradicate illiteracy and to ensure primary and secondary education for girls by preventing school dropouts. Furthermore, educational and training opportunities should be broadened for girls and young women at the secondary and tertiary levels and in technical fields. Particular attention should be given to ensuring that girls and women have equal access to new specializations, including the opportunity to acquire skills and knowledge to participate on a basis of equality with men in the labour market and in the future reconstruction of the country.

- Austria, CEDAW, A/55/38 part II (2000) 70 at paras. 231 and 232.

### *Paragraph 231*

Concern is expressed over the high percentage of the female population in Austria which has no education beyond the compulsory level. The continuing gender role stereotyping in the area of education and vocational training for girls and boys is also a matter of concern.

### *Paragraph 232*

Measures should be taken to encourage girls to continue their education beyond the compulsory level and particularly in the areas of science and technology.

- Burundi, CEDAW, A/56/38 part I (2001) 7 at paras. 57 and 58.

### *Paragraph 57*

The high prevalence of illiteracy among women and the low level of schooling of girls, especially in rural areas, are matters of concern. Education is a key to the empowerment of women, and low levels of education of women remain one of the most serious impediments to national development.

### *Paragraph 58*

The Government is urged to continue its efforts to improve the access of girls to all levels of education and to prevent their dropping out of school. The Government is also encouraged to introduce corrective measures that address all stakeholders involved, including incentives for parents,



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

and to consider requesting international assistance to improve women's and girls' education.

### *See also:*

- Guinea, CEDAW, A/56/38 part II (2001) 55 at para. 126.
- Maldives, CEDAW, A/56/38 part I (2001) 15 at para. 136.

Early marriage and domestic responsibilities contribute to high dropout rates for girls. Minimum age of marriage laws and other programmes should be introduced to prevent early marriage, in line with the obligations of the Convention.

- Uzbekistan, CEDAW, A/56/38 part I (2001) 18 at paras. 180, 181, 189 and 190.

### *Paragraph 180*

While noting with appreciation the high level of education among women, concern is expressed about the recent decline in the total number of women students.

### *Paragraph 181*

Urgent measures should be taken to prevent the decline of women in higher education. Raising awareness and providing incentives to encourage young women to enter male-dominated fields of study are recommended.

### *Paragraph 189*

Concern is expressed over the situation of rural women, who comprise 60 per cent of all women in Uzbekistan, including their access to health-care services, education and income-generating activities.

### *Paragraph 190*

Attention should be paid to the specific situation of rural women and special strategies, policies and programmes should be developed that are aimed at the economic empowerment of rural women, ensuring their access to capital and productive resources, as well as to health care services and educational and social opportunities.

### *See also:*

- Kazakhstan, CEDAW, A/56/38 part I (2001) 10 at paras. 109 and 110.
- Viet Nam, CEDAW, A/56/38 part II (2001) 68 at paras. 268 and 269.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Mongolia, CEDAW, A/56/38 part I (2001) 26 at paras. 245, 249, 250, 267 and 268.

### *Paragraph 245*

The progress made in providing women with access to education and the achievement of high levels of participation at the tertiary level are commended.

### *Paragraph 249*

The deteriorating situation of women in Mongolia in a period of economic transformation is noted with deep concern. The fact that the Government has failed to prevent the erosion of women's rights to economic advancement, health, education, political participation and personal security is of particular concern.

### *Paragraph 250*

The Government should protect and promote women's human rights and utilize the development and technical resources available as well as the human resources of the country, including civil society and women's groups, so as to reverse this trend.

### *Paragraph 267*

Concern is expressed over the negative impact of privatization on women's access to adequate health care and education.

### *Paragraph 268*

The State party is called upon to ensure that health care and education services are not reduced, and that, in particular, the areas of health and education do not suffer as a result of privatization.

- Egypt, CEDAW, A/56/38 part I (2001) 33 at paras. 338 and 339.

### *Paragraph 338*

Taking note of the successful efforts to reduce the drop-out rate for girls in primary education, the remaining high level of illiteracy among women and the rate at which girls and young women drop out of secondary school and university are noted with concern.

### *Paragraph 339*

The Government is called upon to continue to strengthen its efforts to eradicate female illiteracy, particularly in the rural areas. Programmes to prevent drop-outs by girls in primary education and to reduce the drop-out rate of girls and young women at secondary school and university should be continued, including through the use of incentives for parents, so as to provide young women with the necessary skills and knowledge to allow them to participate, on the basis of equality, with men in the labour market.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Singapore, CEDAW, A/56/38 part II (2001) 51 at paras. 69, 92 and 93.

### *Paragraph 69*

The achievements of low rates of maternity and infant mortality, long life expectancy and high literacy rates for women and the provision of access to all levels of education are commended.

### *Paragraph 92*

The imposition of a maximum quota on the number of women medical students is of concern.

### *Paragraph 93*

The maximum quota on the number of women medical students should be removed and childcare arrangements and flexible working hours provided, so as to encourage and enable women doctors to pursue their profession.

- Guinea, CEDAW, A/56/38 part II (2001) 55 at para. 127.

The Government is encouraged to strengthen its efforts to improve the literacy level of girls and women, to improve the access of girls and young women to all levels of education and to prevent girls dropping out of school. Further special measures should be introduced in the area of education, including incentives for parents to send girls to school and the recruitment of women teachers.

- Viet Nam, CEDAW, A/56/38 part II (2001) 68 at paras. 264 and 265.

### *Paragraph 264*

Despite the efforts and the progress made with regard to primary and secondary education, concern is expressed about the high female drop-out rate from schools, and particularly higher education, in rural areas. It is noted that the increase in the rate has coincided with the transformation to a market economy, and it is of concern that the gains that have been made in regard to women's and girls' education may not be sustained.

### *Paragraph 265*

Efforts to promote the access of women and girls to higher education and their retention in the system should be intensified. Incentives should be provided to parents in order to encourage them to ensure that their daughters attend school.

## CRC

- Russian Federation, CRC, CRC/C/16 (1993) 21 at para. 81.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Regarding the implementation of article 28 of the Convention, the situation of the girl child in rural areas is of concern.

- Egypt, CRC, CRC/C/16 (1993) 24 at paras. 98, 101, 102 and 104.

### *Paragraph 98*

Although Egyptian laws and regulations guarantee equality between the sexes, there is in reality still a pattern of disparity between boys and girls, in particular as far as access to education is concerned.

### *Paragraph 101*

Specific concern is expressed regarding the very large number of children between 6 and 14 years of age who are enrolled in the labour force and therefore lack, wholly or partly, the possibility to go to school. Although children may to a certain extent contribute to seasonal activities, care should always be taken that primary education is available to them and that they are not working in hazardous conditions.

### *Paragraph 102*

The quality of education in schools also gives cause for concern and may be an explanation for high drop-out rates; the problem relates to pedagogical methods, curricula and the lack of adequate educational material.

### *Paragraph 104*

The principle of non-discrimination must be vigorously applied. A more active approach should be taken to eliminating discrimination against certain groups of children, in particular girl children and children in rural areas. With regard to the gap in literacy and school enrolment mentioned in the report, obstacles facing girls should be adequately addressed so that they can enjoy their right to go to school; further measures might be taken to increase the awareness of parents in this regard.

- Sudan, CRC, CRC/C/20 (1993) 22 at para. 117.

Attention should be given to extending the provision of primary health care and primary education in order to improve the general health and nutritional and educational status of children. In addition, future development plans should accord priority to the situation of disabled children.

- Colombia (preliminary), CRC, CRC/C/24 (1994) 18 at para. 81.

Steps should be taken to strengthen the educational system, particularly in the rural areas. The quality

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

of teaching should be improved and the high number of school drop-outs should be reduced.

- Romania, CRC, CRC/C/24 (1994) 21 at para. 103.

The Government should adopt an active non-discrimination policy with respect to children of minorities. This would also, particularly in relation to the Roma (gypsy) population, require proactive measures to encourage participation and break a vicious circle of widespread prejudices resulting in hostility or neglect. The problem of low school attendance among children from the Roma minority should be urgently addressed.

- Pakistan, CRC, CRC/C/29 (1994) 10 at para. 44.

The effectiveness of measures to attain the goal of primary education for all, particularly for girls, is of serious concern.

- Burkina Faso, CRC, CRC/C/29 (1994) 15 at para. 68.

The persistence of discrimination against girls and women is of serious concern. The low school attendance and high drop-out rates among girls, especially at the primary level, are also of concern.

- Honduras, CRC, CRC/C/34 (1994) 11 at para. 58.

Greater attention should be accorded to improving children's access to the education system and reducing the high incidence of school drop-out. In this regard, the Government's suggestion to organize the school year around the agricultural seasons with a view to organizing school vacations at sowing and harvesting periods is noted. Equally, it is suggested that consideration be given to the provision of meals and to complement the provision of health care through the schools.

- Philippines, CRC, CRC/C/38 (1995) 12 at para. 63.

There has been little progress in implementing the right to education principles and provisions of the Convention, in particular with respect to girl children. The lack of vocational training opportunities, the high drop-out rate in primary education and the low rate of enrolment in secondary education are of concern.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Jamaica, CRC, CRC/C/38 (1995) 25 at para. 166.

Measures should be envisaged to improve the quality of education, and to intensify teacher training and vocational training.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, CRC, CRC/C/38 (1995) 35 at paras. 234 and 242.

### *Paragraph 234*

Children's right to appeal against expulsion from school should be effectively ensured. It is also suggested that procedures be introduced to ensure that children are provided with the opportunity to express their views on the running of the schools in matters of concern to them.

### *Paragraph 242*

Proactive measures should be taken for the rights of children belonging to Gypsy and Traveller communities, including their right to education, and a sufficient number of adequately appointed caravan sites for these communities should be secured.

- Nicaragua, CRC, CRC/C/43 (1995) 10 at paras. 48 and 65.

### *Paragraph 48*

The sufficiency of measures being taken to improve access to education and to reduce the high rates of school drop-out and repetition of classes is of concern.

### *Paragraph 65*

Greater efforts should be directed to developing low-cost but effective strategies to substantially increase the enrolment and attendance rates of children in education and to improve the quality and appropriateness of education. The Government should consider extending the provision of compulsory education to nine years of schooling, thereby ensuring at the same time that the age of completion of compulsory education would be harmonized with the minimum age for employment.

- Canada, CRC, CRC/C/43 (1995) 16 at paras. 80, 85 and 94.

### *Paragraph 80*

The emerging problem of child poverty, especially among vulnerable groups and the increasing number of children who are brought up by single parent families, or in other problematic environments, are matters of concern. The need for special programmes and services to provide the necessary care, especially in terms of education, housing and nutrition, for such children is

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

emphasized.

### *Paragraph 85*

The special problems still faced by children from vulnerable and disadvantaged groups, such as aboriginal children, with regard to the enjoyment of their fundamental rights, including access to housing and education, are of concern.

### *Paragraph 94*

Efforts should be strengthened to ensure that children from vulnerable and disadvantaged groups, such as aboriginal children, benefit from positive measures aimed at facilitating access to education and housing.

- Belgium, CRC, CRC/C/43 (1995) 20 at para. 104.

The application of the law and policy concerning children seeking asylum, including unaccompanied children, is of concern. Of particular concern is that unaccompanied minors who have had their asylum request rejected, but who can remain in the country until they are 18 years old, may be deprived of an identity and denied the full enjoyment of their rights, including health care and education.

- Germany, CRC, CRC/C/46 (1995) 15 at para. 109.

Greater priority should be given to an analysis of the occurrence of child poverty. Such an analysis should be undertaken from a holistic perspective, taking into account the possible linkages between such matters as housing conditions, family support to the child at home and in school, and the risk of dropping out of school. The results of this research could serve as a vehicle for discussion of these matters both in Parliament and with the relevant authorities as well as for the development of a more comprehensive and integrated approach for responding to the problems identified.

- Senegal, CRC, CRC/C/46 (1995) 21 at paras. 126 and 142.

### *Paragraph 126*

The insufficient measures taken to ensure the effective implementation of the principle of non-discrimination are of concern. In this regard, the persistent discriminatory attitudes towards girls, also reflected in their notably lower school attendance and their higher drop-out rate, are noted.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 142*

Further steps should be taken to strengthen the education system, particularly in the rural areas, to improve the quality of teaching and to reduce drop-out rates. Furthermore, all necessary measures should be taken to ensure a system of compulsory and free primary education, on the basis of equal opportunity, paying due regard to the situation of girls.

- Yugoslavia (Serbia and Montenegro), CRC, CRC/C/50 (1996) 17 at paras. 97 and 108.

### *Paragraph 97*

Concern is expressed that the costs of children's education may be growing beyond the reach of certain families. It is also noted that a decline in preschool education has been recorded in recent years. Reports of the progressive exclusion of teaching in languages other than Serbian, such as Bulgarian, are also disquieting.

### *Paragraph 108*

The State party should give further consideration to the need to allocate greater resources to education and to reverse any trends in the education system which may perpetuate gender discrimination or stereotyping as well as to addressing other problems, including those relating to teaching in national languages.

- Republic of Korea, CRC, CRC/C/50 (1996) 26 at paras. 154, 171 and 178.

### *Paragraph 154*

The Committee notes with satisfaction the importance attached by the Government to education, considered as the "driving force of social and economic development".

### *Paragraph 171*

Legislative measures should be adopted with a view to ensuring the basic rights of all disabled children, in particular the right to education, in the light of article 23.

### *Paragraph 178*

The State party is encouraged to review its education policy, with a view to reflecting fully the aims of education set out in article 29 of the Convention.

- Finland, CRC, CRC/C/50 (1996) 35 at para. 212.

It is noted with satisfaction that the Government provides a comprehensive social security system and a wide range of welfare services for the benefit of children and their parents, particularly free health



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

care, free education, extended pregnancy leave rights and a large day-care system.

- Lebanon, CRC, CRC/C/54 (1996) 7 at paras. 42 and 54.

### *Paragraph 42*

The need for further reform in the school sector to improve the quality of education and to prevent drop outs is noted. Specific needs appear to exist in the fields of health education and, as recognized by the delegation, teaching about values and about the environment.

### *Paragraph 54*

In relation to the growing role of private educational and health institutions, a stronger emphasis should be placed on public education and the social welfare system with a view to ensuring that all children subject to the jurisdiction of the State party enjoy these fundamental rights, as well as to prevent any risk of discrimination.

- Zimbabwe, CRC, CRC/C/54 (1996) 13 at para. 102.

The State party should consider the recommendations made by the International Labour Organization in its mission statement of 1993 and, in particular, prohibit the employment of young persons below 18 in hazardous activities as well as to make education free and compulsory up to age 15.

- China, CRC, CRC/C/54 (1996) 18 at para. 123.

The number of children in China who still do not attend school is of concern. Concern is also expressed about reports that school attendance in minority areas, including the Tibet Autonomous Region, is lagging behind; that the quality of education is inferior; and that insufficient efforts have been made to develop a bilingual education system which would include adequate teaching in Chinese. These shortcomings may disadvantage Tibetan and other minority pupils applying to secondary and higher level schools.

- Nepal, CRC, CRC/C/54 (1996) 25 at paras. 167 and 181.

### *Paragraph 167*

The fact that primary education is not compulsory for all children is of deep concern.

### *Paragraph 181*

The State party should take all necessary measures to reduce the drop-out rate of girls in rural and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

urban areas and to prevent their involvement in child labour or prostitution, and to reinforce the access to basic services (health, education and social care) for children in rural areas and for disabled children throughout the country.

*See also:*

- Senegal, CRC, CRC/C/46 (1995) 21 at para. 128.
  
- Guatemala, CRC, CRC/C/54 (1996) 31 at paras. 216, 227 and 231.

*Paragraph 216*

The State party should set the age for completion of compulsory schooling at 15 and consider raising the minimum age of employment to 15.

*Paragraph 227*

Greater efforts should be focused on providing for compulsory and free primary education, eradicating illiteracy and ensuring the availability of bilingual education for indigenous children. Moreover, greater efforts should be made in training qualified teachers. Such measures will contribute to the prevention of any form of discrimination on the basis of language with regard to the right to education.

*Paragraph 231*

As a means of tackling the interrelated issues of education and child labour, all necessary measures should be adopted to ensure that children have access to education and that they are protected from involvement in exploitative activities.

- Nigeria, CRC, CRC/C/57 (1996) 12 at paras. 91 and 94.

*Paragraph 91*

The informal and formal education systems should be harmonized, particularly with respect to the application of a national curriculum within all schools. Further steps should be taken to develop guidelines for the participation of all children in the life of the school. The implementation of measures to improve school enrolment and school retention, especially for girls, is also encouraged.

*Paragraph 94*

All children should have access to health care, education should be made compulsory as a measure to prevent the economic exploitation of children and further measures should be undertaken to combat exploitation, such as that of child domestic workers, including legislative measures to ensure the effective protection of the child against the performance of any work that is likely to be hazardous

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

or to interfere with the child's education, or to be harmful to the child's health or full and harmonious development.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (Hong Kong), CRC, CRC/C/57 (1996) 23 at para. 153.

The efforts being undertaken to integrate disabled children into regular schools, including through investment in structural changes to schools and support to the training of teachers to assist them in adjusting and adapting their teaching methods to the needs of disabled children, are encouraged.

- Mauritius, CRC, CRC/C/57 (1996) 29 at para. 175.

The educational system may not be consistent with the provisions of the Convention regarding the right to education. Deep concern is expressed at the high school drop-out rates, especially at the end of the primary education level, and at the high rate of illiteracy. The absence of supervision of private schools and the difficulties encountered by disabled children in gaining access to regular primary schools are also matters of concern.

- Slovenia, CRC, CRC/C/57 (1996) 34 at paras. 208 and 216.

### *Paragraph 208*

Concern is expressed over children dropping out of school during the compulsory stage of education that have insufficient alternative educational programmes, such as vocational training.

### *Paragraph 216*

All appropriate measures should be taken to reduce school drop-out by, *inter alia*, promoting vocational training and alternative educational programmes.

- Ethiopia, CRC, CRC/C/62 (1997) 12 at para. 76.

The low levels of school enrolment and the high drop-out rates, especially among girls, the lack of learning and teaching facilities and the shortage of trained teachers, in particular in rural areas, are matters of concern. Concern is also expressed over the fact that the school curricula is divorced from cultural and social realities, and does not yet include a programme of education on human rights and children's rights. Moreover, primary education has not yet been made compulsory and this is of

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

concern.

### *See also:*

- Ghana, CRC, CRC/C/66 (1997) 15 at para. 96.
  
- Panama, CRC, CRC/C/62 (1997) 19 at paras. 115, 116 and 129.

### *Paragraph 115*

The persisting disparities in the low access to education of children living in rural areas, indigenous children and refugee children, who do not enjoy a system of education adequate to their cultural values and identity, are matters of concern. The low rates of retention, the high rates of repetition and school drop-outs, especially at the end of primary education, and the persistent problem of illiteracy amongst these groups are also worrisome.

### *Paragraph 116*

The insufficient legal protection and the lack of adequate procedures for refugee children, especially unaccompanied minors, are of concern. The difficulties encountered by those children in securing access to education, health and social services are also of concern.

### *Paragraph 129*

Greater efforts should be focused on eradicating illiteracy and on increasing access to school education by indigenous children and children living in rural areas. This will require greater efforts in training teachers. Furthermore, all necessary measures should be taken to fight school drop-outs and ensure retention.

- Ghana, CRC, CRC/C/66 (1997) 15 at para. 117.

Measures should be implemented to improve school enrolment and pupil retention, especially of girls. A system for the regular evaluation of the effectiveness of these and other educational measures, including of the quality of teaching, must be ensured. Further steps should be taken to develop guidelines for the participation of all children in the life of the school.

- Paraguay, CRC, CRC/C/66 (1997) 29 at paras. 195 and 217.

### *Paragraph 195*

Concern is expressed over the inadequate measures taken to fully guarantee in practice the right of indigenous students to education in their native language.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 217*

All appropriate measures should be taken to guarantee the full implementation of the right of the child to be educated in his/her own language.

- Algeria, CRC, CRC/C/66 (1997) 35 at para. 257.

Further steps should be taken to ensure that nomadic children have access to education and health-care services through a system of specifically targeted education and health-care schemes which will allow these children to enjoy their right, in community with other members of their group, to their own culture.

- Azerbaijan, CRC, CRC/C/66 (1997) 41 at paras. 287, 288 and 296.

### *Paragraph 287*

The impact of armed conflict on education, and the lack of measures to implement programmes to reduce the drop-out rate are of concern.

### *Paragraph 288*

The substantial number of refugees and internally displaced persons resulting from the armed conflict since 1990, especially children, many of whom have been living in tents for three years, is of concern. These children do not always have equal access to basic services, especially health, education and social services.

### *Paragraph 296*

All appropriate measures should be undertaken to integrate children with disabilities into mainstream education.

- Lao People's Democratic Republic, CRC, CRC/C/69 (1997) 8 at paras. 51 and 75.

### *Paragraph 51*

The legislation does not specifically mention that primary education is free and this is of concern. The low level of school enrolment and the high drop-out and repetition rates, the disparities between urban and rural areas and between ethnic groups in terms of enrolment and quality of education provided, the shortage of physical infrastructure, school materials and teachers, and the low qualifications of teachers, in particular in rural areas, remain matters of concern. The lack of vocational training opportunities, in particular in rural and remote areas, is of particular concern.

### *Paragraph 75*

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Efforts to make free primary education available for all and to train teachers should be encouraged. Measures should be taken to improve school enrolment and pupil retention, especially of girls, children belonging to minorities and children living in rural areas. A system for the regular evaluation of the effectiveness of all educational measures taken, including those related to the quality of teaching, must be ensured.

- Australia, CRC, CRC/C/69 (1997) 16 at para. 95.

The special problems still faced by Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders, as well as by children of non-English-speaking backgrounds, with regard to their enjoyment of the same standards of living and levels of services, particularly in education and health, are of concern.

- Uganda, CRC, CRC/C/69 (1997) 21 at paras. 135 and 150.

### *Paragraph 135*

The principle of free and compulsory primary education is not yet fully and equally implemented and this is of concern. Furthermore, the low level of school enrolment and the high drop-out rates for girls due to, *inter alia*, early marriage, the lack of learning and teaching facilities and materials, and the shortage of trained teachers, are also matters of concern.

### *Paragraph 150*

Greater efforts should be directed to training teachers, improving learning and teaching facilities and the school environment, increasing enrolment and fighting school drop-out.

- Czech Republic, CRC, CRC/C/69 (1997) 28 at para. 177.

The insufficient measures taken to ensure effective access of children with disabilities to health, education and social services, and to facilitate their full inclusion into society are matters of concern.

- Trinidad and Tobago, CRC, CRC/C/69 (1997) 33 at para. 219.

The shortage of trained teachers and the high pupil-teacher ratio are matters of concern.

- Togo, CRC, CRC/C/69 (1997) 39 at paras. 264 and 288.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 264*

The low level of school enrolment and the high drop-out rate, especially among girls, resulting in high illiteracy rates, the lack of learning and teaching facilities and the shortage of trained teachers, particularly in rural areas, are matters of concern. Furthermore, the lack of appropriate playgrounds is also of concern.

### *Paragraph 288*

The efforts to make primary education compulsory and available free to all are encouraging. Measures should be implemented to improve school enrolment and school retention, especially for girls. A system for the regular evaluation of the effectiveness of these and other educational measures, including quality of teaching, must be ensured. Furthermore, the State party is encouraged to provide more appropriate playgrounds for children.

- Ireland, CRC, CRC/C/73 (1998) 14 at para. 84.

The situation of children who are excluded from schools because of sanctions imposed by teachers and the adverse effects generated, which may sometimes impact on drop-out rates and school attendance, are of concern.

- Hungary, CRC, CRC/C/79 (1998) 7 at para. 59.

Further measures should be undertaken to prevent and redress unequal access to health services and to the education system between the rural and urban population, and in particular to facilitate the access of Roma children to health and education. Schools and vocational training should be made accessible to poor children and those living in rural areas, especially children belonging to the Roma population.

- Fiji, CRC, CRC/C/79 (1998) 18 at paras. 121 and 140.

### *Paragraph 121*

The high drop-out rates as well as the unequal access to quality education are matters of concern. Furthermore, the absence of a public pre-school system is also of concern.

### *Paragraph 140*

All appropriate measures should be taken to accelerate the full implementation of the compulsory education system and to improve the access to education of the most vulnerable groups of children.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Japan, CRC, CRC/C/79 (1998) 25 at para. 166.

With regard to children with disabilities, the insufficient measures taken, notwithstanding the principles laid down in the Fundamental Law for People with Disabilities, 1993, to ensure effective access of these children to education and to facilitate their full inclusion in society, are of concern.

- Maldives, CRC, CRC/C/79 (1998) 31 at paras. 215, 216 and 236.

### *Paragraph 215*

The insufficient measures taken to ensure effective access of children with disabilities to health, education and social services, and to facilitate their full inclusion into society are of concern.

### *Paragraph 216*

The fact that education is not compulsory by law, the high drop-out rate between primary and secondary school, the shortage of trained teachers, the existing gender disparities in secondary school enrolments and the disparities in the access to education between the capital and the atolls are matters of concern.

### *Paragraph 236*

Primary education should be made compulsory and free to all. The training of school teachers and the access to education of the most vulnerable groups of children, including girl children and children living on remote islands, should be improved. International assistance should be sought from UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Ecuador, CRC, CRC/C/80 (1998) 9 at para. 49.

The educational system and its policies should be strengthened in order to reduce gender and geographical disparities and to establish retention programmes and vocational training for drop-out students.

- Kuwait, CRC, CRC/C/80 (1998) 28 at para. 143.

The recent increase in the number of children living and/or working on the streets, especially children of the Bedoon community, is of concern. All appropriate measures should be taken to provide access to school to all children and prevent and combat school drop-out. Vocational training projects and adequate social programmes should be developed.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Thailand, CRC, CRC/C/80 (1998) 35 at para. 179.

The legislative framework should be clarified to ensure adequate protection of unaccompanied and asylum seeking children, including in the fields of physical safety, health and education.

- Austria, CRC, CRC/C/84 (1999) 7 at paras. 51 and 54.

### *Paragraph 51*

All appropriate measures should be taken to increase the number of places in kindergarten and pre-school facilities, such as day care.

### *Paragraph 54*

Budgetary austerity measures have affected the working of the school system, for example by introducing some family contributions for school books and enrichment activities, or by reducing the choice of optional subjects. These measures should be examined carefully with regard to their impact on the progressive implementation of the child's right to education and leisure activities.

- Belize, CRC, CRC/C/84 (1999) 12 at paras. 75 and 86.

### *Paragraph 75*

The measures adopted to ensure that all children are guaranteed access to education and health services and are protected against all forms of exploitation are insufficient and remain of concern. Of particular concern are certain vulnerable groups of children, including children with disabilities; children belonging to minority and indigenous groups, such as Maya and Garifuna children; children living in remote rural areas; children living in poverty; children living and/or working on the street; refugee and asylum-seeking children; illegal immigrant children; children in the juvenile justice system; children of single-parent families; children born out of wedlock and institutionalized children. Efforts should be increased to ensure implementation of the principle of non-discrimination, particularly as it relates to these vulnerable groups.

### *Paragraph 86*

The situation of education, particularly as regards overcrowding, the high drop-out rate, the lack of basic training materials, poorly maintained infrastructure and equipment, shortages of textbooks and other materials, the limited number of trained teachers and the lack of play space and recreational facilities, is of concern. All appropriate measures should be taken to improve the quality of education and to provide access for all children. In this regard, the educational system should be strengthened through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO. Additional measures should also be taken to encourage children to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

the rights of the child to rest and leisure and to engage in play and recreational activities should be ensured. Educational policies and programmes should be reviewed with a view to ensuring that they adequately reflect the cultural and ethnic diversity of the population.

- Guinea, CRC, CRC/C/84 (1999) 21 at para. 119.

The persistence of high school drop-out, repetition, absenteeism and illiteracy rates, as well as the low enrolment rate and limited access to education in rural areas are of concern. Concern is also expressed at the shortage of trained teachers, insufficient school infrastructure and equipment, and gender disparities in school attendance. All appropriate measures should be undertaken to improve access to education, especially of the most vulnerable groups of children, and to reinforce training programmes for the teaching personnel. To this effect, seeking international cooperation from UNESCO and UNICEF is recommended.

- Sweden, CRC, CRC/C/84 (1999) 29 at para. 147.

The impact of budgetary cuts on the child's right to education remains of concern. The State party should restore higher levels of funding for remedial education and extend coverage to children in need of special assistance. The policy on access to day-care services for children of unemployed parents should be reviewed taking into consideration the child's right to education and leisure activities, particularly as it relates to current efforts to increase the educational role of pre-school and day-care centres.

- Yemen, CRC, CRC/C/84 (1999) 33 at para. 178.

The persistence of high school drop-out, repetition, absenteeism and illiteracy rates as well as the low enrolment rate and limited access to education in rural and remote areas remain of concern. All appropriate measures should be undertaken to improve the school infrastructure and update its equipment; to accelerate the implementation of the compulsory education system; to improve access to education for boys and girls, including of the most vulnerable groups; and to strengthen training programmes for the teaching personnel. To this effect, international cooperation from UNESCO and UNICEF should be sought.

- Saint Kitts and Nevis, CRC, CRC/C/87 (1999) 17 at paras. 88 and 89.

### *Paragraph 88*

In light of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

(General Assembly resolution 48/96) and the Committee's recommendations adopted at its day of general discussion on "The rights of children with disabilities," the State party should develop early identification programmes to prevent disabilities, increase efforts to implement alternatives to the institutionalization of children with disabilities, establish special education programmes for children with disabilities and further encourage their inclusion in society. Technical cooperation for the training of professional staff working with and for children with disabilities should be sought from UNICEF and WHO.

### *Paragraph 89*

Educational programmes should be reviewed with a view to improving their quality and relevance and ensuring that students receive an adequate mix of academics and life skills, including communication, decision-making and conflict-resolution skills. Additional measures should be implemented to encourage children, especially boys, to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education. In this regard, all necessary measures should be taken to ensure the full implementation of the Government's policy regarding the readmission of teenage mothers into the school system in all regions of its territory. The implementation of the Caribbean Community Multi-agency Health and Family Life Education Project which facilitates the retraining of teachers as well as the development of appropriate curricula and public education campaigns should be accelerated. The educational system should also be strengthened through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Honduras, CRC, CRC/C/87 (1999) 26 at para. 124.

The low enrolment rates, especially in rural and remote areas, high drop-out rates from primary and secondary schools, and the lack of attention to the special needs of working children and children with disabilities, remain of concern. Efforts should be continued in the field of education by strengthening educational policies and the system in order to reduce regional disparities in access to education and to establish retention programmes and vocational training for drop-outs. Technical assistance in this area from UNESCO is encouraged.

- Benin, CRC, CRC/C/87 (1999) 35 at para. 159.

The practice of denying access to education to girls and resisting the new educational policies based on the assertion that the nonpayment of school fees for girls impacts negatively on school budgets, are matters of concern. In this connection, there is also the concern that some children, including those living in poverty and in remote rural communities, still do not have access to education. With respect to the general situation of education, the extent of overcrowding; high dropout, illiteracy and repetition rates; lack of basic training materials; poorly maintained infrastructure and equipment;

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

shortages of textbooks and other materials; and the limited number of trained teachers are all matters of concern. Efforts to promote the school attendance of girls and to introduce measures to limit the impact of the Government's policy concerning the nonpayment of fees for girls on school budgets are encouraged. All appropriate measures should be taken to improve the quality of education and to provide access for all children. In this connection, the educational system should be strengthened through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO. Additional measures should be implemented to encourage children to stay in school, at least during the period of compulsory education.

- Nicaragua, CRC, CRC/C/87 (1999) 54 at para. 241.

The high drop-out rates from primary and secondary schools, especially in rural areas, the poor condition of schools and the scarcity of textbooks remain of concern. Efforts should be continued in the field of education to strengthen educational policies and the system in order to establish retention programmes and vocational training for drop-outs, to improve school infrastructure, to continue with curricular reform, including teaching methodologies, to eradicate urban/rural disparities with reference to school enrolment and attendance, and to implement special education programmes taking into account the needs of working children.

- Venezuela, CRC, CRC/C/90 (1999) 10 at para. 55.

The high drop-out and repetition rates in primary and secondary schools, the regional disparities in access to education, the insufficient number of well-trained teaching staff and children's limited access to material and textbooks remain of concern. Efforts should be continued in the field of education to strengthen policies and the system in order to improve ongoing retention programmes and vocational training for drop-out students; to improve school infrastructure; to continue with curricular reform, including teaching methodologies; to eradicate regional disparities with reference to school enrolment and attendance; and to implement special education programmes, taking into account the needs of working children.

- Russian Federation, CRC, CRC/C/90 (1999) 18 at paras. 76, 84, 85 and 111-114.

### *Paragraph 76*

All appropriate measures should be taken to the maximum extent of available resources to ensure that budgetary allocations for health, education and other social services for children are adequately protected, in particular for children belonging to vulnerable and marginalized groups.

### *Paragraph 84*

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

The growing disparities between regions, including notably the far north, and between urban and rural children, in legislation, budgetary allocations, policies and programmes regarding health, education and other social services and the situation of children in need of special protection, remain matters of concern.

### *Paragraph 85*

The disadvantaged situation of girls in rural areas, particularly with regard to access to education, health and protection from sexual abuse and exploitation, is of concern.

### *Paragraph 111*

The growing drop-out rates, the reduction in enrolment rates for vocational and technical secondary education - especially among girls - and the deterioration of school and the conditions of service for teachers, including low wages and delays in payment, remain of concern.

### *Paragraph 112*

The collection of information on drop-out rates and their causes, and on the situation of children expelled for disciplinary reasons is encouraged. Efforts to shelter the education system from the impact of the economic crisis and, in particular, to give further attention to the conditions of service of teachers, should be continued. The subjects of human rights, including children's rights, should be introduced into the school curricula as an independent subject.

### *Paragraph 113*

The practice by some municipal administrations of preventing parents and their children from having access to medical, educational, and other social services in a city for which they do not have a residency permit is particularly harmful to internally displaced children, migrants and asylum-seekers, and children working and living in the street and this is of concern.

### *Paragraph 114*

The practice of discrimination against children without residence permits should be ended through training and awareness-raising for local government and law-enforcement officials.

- Vanuatu, CRC, CRC/C/90 (1999) 29 at para. 156.

It is of grave concern that primary education is not compulsory and free to all children. The limited access to education, the low rate of enrolment of girls, the low literacy rate, the poor quality of education, the general lack of relevant learning material and other resources, and the insufficient numbers of trained/qualified teachers are matters of concern. Many parents continue to see education as having a negative impact on the behavior of their children. A study of the educational system should be undertaken with a view to improving access to education at all levels of the system,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

increasing the enrolment rate of girls, particularly at the secondary level, introducing local languages as additional tools of instruction, and improving the overall quality of education. Technical cooperation from UNICEF and UNESCO should be sought.

- Mexico, CRC, CRC/C/90 (1999) 34 at para. 187.

The high drop-out and repetition rates in primary and secondary schools and the disparities in access to education between rural and urban areas remain of concern. The situation of children belonging to indigenous groups regarding their access to education and the low relevance of the current bilingual educational programmes available for them is especially of concern. Efforts should continue to be taken to strengthen educational policies and the system in order to reduce regional disparities in access to education and to strengthen ongoing retention programmes and vocational training for drop-out students. Effective measures should be taken to improve the educational situation of children belonging to the most vulnerable groups, in particular, through bilingual education programmes for children belonging to indigenous groups. Technical assistance in this area from UNICEF and UNESCO should be considered.

- Mali, CRC, CRC/C/90 (1999) 43 at para. 223.

The fact that many children, particularly girls, still do not attend school remains a concern. With respect to the general situation of education, the extent of overcrowding; high drop-out, illiteracy and repetition rates; lack of basic training materials; poorly maintained infrastructure and equipment; shortages of text books and other materials; and the insufficient number of trained teachers, remain matters of concern. The continuation of efforts to promote school attendance of girls is encouraged and additional measures should be taken to encourage children to stay in school, at least during the period of compulsory education. All appropriate measures should be taken to improve the quality of education and to provide access for all children. In this connection, the educational system should be strengthened through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO.

- The Netherlands, CRC, CRC/C/90 (1999) 53 at para. 260.

The possibility of providing further assistance to children at risk and the need to provide assistance to families from ethnic minorities with socioeconomic problems, thus addressing the root causes of poor educational performance, should be considered.

- India, CRC, CRC/C/94 (2000) 10 at paras. 88 and 89.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 88*

Concern is expressed at the prevailing poor situation in the State party with respect to education, which is characterized by a general lack of infrastructure, facilities and equipment, insufficient numbers of qualified teachers and a drastic shortage of text books and other relevant learning materials. There is serious concern regarding the striking disparities in terms of access to education, attendance at primary and secondary levels and drop-out rates between: different states, rural and urban areas, boys and girls, the affluent and poor, and children belonging to scheduled castes and tribes. The importance of focusing attention on improving the provision and quality of education is emphasized, especially in view of its potential benefit for addressing various concerns, including the situation of girls and reducing the incidence of child labour.

### *Paragraph 89*

In line with the 1993 and 1996 Supreme Court decisions (*Unni Krishnan*; and *M.C. Mehta vs. State of Tamil Nadu and Others*, respectively), the State party should implement measures designed to comply with article 45 of the Constitution, which mandates free and compulsory education for all children up to 14.

- Sierra Leone, CRC, CRC/C/94 (2000) 24 at paras. 180 and 181.

### *Paragraph 180*

Deep concern is expressed about the right to education of children in the State party. The drastic fall in the number of primary schools, with the remaining schools concentrated primarily in the main towns to the exclusion of the rural population, is a particular concern. The fact that 70 per cent of primary schoolteachers are not qualified and the very high drop-out rates of children from primary school are matters of concern. In addition, while recognizing the State party's efforts to provide free education to children in the first three years of primary school, it is noted that the State party's assistance to pupils and parents only covers school fees and does not provide for other education related costs. Children in other classes must carry the entire burden of the cost of their education.

### *Paragraph 181*

Recognizing the efforts made by the State party to establish schools in displaced persons camps and to raise the levels of enrolment among both girls and boys, the State party is urged to rapidly reopen primary schools in all regions of the country, including in rural areas, so as to ensure that every child has access to primary education. With a view to assuring a better quality of education, the State party is urged to encourage trained teachers who have left the State party to return. Teacher training courses should be strengthened so as to increase the number and standard of teachers, and sufficient resources invested in the education system to provide adequate school facilities, materials and salaries for teachers. The State party is urged to ensure that education is entirely free for all students, including through the provision of assistance to purchase uniforms and school books.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Costa Rica, CRC, CRC/C/94 (2000) 37 at para. 233.

With regard to education, the State party's budget allocation to education is one of the highest among developing countries. However, concern remains that there is an increase in drop-out rates between primary and secondary school, due to the limited relevance of the school curricula, as well as to economic and social factors, such as the early insertion of children in the informal labour market. Concern is also expressed about discrepancies in access to education between urban and rural areas and the decrease in the quality of schools infrastructure. It is recommended that the State party continue with its efforts in the field of education by strengthening its educational policies and system in order to reduce regional disparities in access to education and to establish retention programmes and vocational training for drop-out students. The State party should conduct continuous training programmes for teachers on human rights, including children's rights.

- The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, CRC, CRC/C/94 (2000) 45 at paras. 280-283.

### *Paragraph 280*

Recent increases in the enrolment of children in primary schools and other increases in secondary and university enrolment are noted. However, a significant proportion of school-aged children do not attend primary and, notably, secondary school. Specifically, the low proportion of girls in general, and children from the Roma minority in particular, who enrol in educational establishments at all levels is a concern. Concern is also expressed about the low numbers of children from all minority groups who enrol at the secondary school level. The extremely high drop-out rates of girls from primary and secondary education is a concern.

### *Paragraph 281*

It is recommended that the State party pursue its efforts to increase the enrolment levels of all children from minorities in primary and secondary schools, with special attention to girls in general and children from the Roma minority in particular.

### *Paragraph 282*

Concern is expressed that many primary and secondary schools are under-resourced and, in particular, that primary and secondary school education available in minority languages is of a lower standard than that available in the Macedonian language. The Committee notes, further, the inevitable effect of poor primary and secondary education in discouraging enrolment, raising the number of children who drop out and in limiting the numbers of children from minorities who are able to pass examinations leading to university education.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 283*

With reference to articles 2 and 28 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, and with a view to ensuring an equal standard of educational services in all schools, to encouraging increased enrolment, to discouraging children from dropping out and to increasing the numbers of children from minorities who follow higher education, it is recommended that the State party review the allocation of financial and other resources to all primary and secondary schools, with particular attention to raising the quality of education in minority language schools. The State party should consider increasing the numbers of hours of teaching of the Macedonian language in minority language schools, on a voluntary basis, with a view to ensuring that children who are minority language speakers are able to participate on a more equal level with Macedonian-speaking children at higher education levels at which entrance examinations and teaching are conducted primarily in the Macedonian language. The curricula in all schools should include a greater focus on the personal development and vocational training of students and on inter-ethnic tolerance.

- Grenada, CRC, CRC/C/94 (2000) 72 at paras. 388 and 408.

### *Paragraph 388*

The State party's initiatives in the school environment are appreciated. The establishment of a school nutrition programme for children enrolled at the pre-school and primary school levels, and the textbook programme established to help children from economically disadvantaged families acquire books and other relevant learning materials are welcomed. The establishment of the Programme for Adolescent Mothers, which offers educational programmes, skills-training and child-care services to pregnant teenagers and teenage mothers who are no longer in the school system is noted with appreciation. The introduction of Health and Family Life Education as a core subject in the primary school curriculum is welcomed.

### *Paragraph 408*

Concern is expressed about the high incidence of truancy (in particular for boys), limited access to secondary education, lack of relevant learning material, insufficient numbers of trained qualified teachers, and the tendency towards the use of teaching methods that are almost exclusively examination oriented. Concern is also expressed at the increasing incidence of violence among students. Insufficient resources have been allocated to ensure the sustainability of the school nutrition programme. The lack of health and counselling services in schools are a concern. It is recommended that the State party review its educational programme with a view to improving its quality and relevance and ensuring that students are taught an adequate mix of academic subjects and life skills, including communication, decision-making and conflict resolution skills. The State party should take all appropriate measures to increase access to secondary education. It is further recommended that the State party seek to implement additional measures to encourage children, especially boys, to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education. In this regard, the State party is urged to take all necessary measures to ensure that adequate resources are allocated to the school

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

nutrition programme and that adequate health and counselling services are made available in schools.

- South Africa, CRC, CRC/C/94 (2000) 81 at paras. 421 and 447.

### *Paragraph 421*

The State party's initiatives within the school environment are appreciated. In this regard, the Committee welcomes the enactment of the South African Schools Act (1996) which has led to enhanced participatory rights for children within the educational system; the right of children to choose their own language of learning (multilingualism); and the abolition of corporal punishment in schools. The establishment of an integrated National Primary School Nutrition Programme intended to encourage enrolment and facilitate attendance of all children, especially those from economically disadvantaged families is welcomed. It is noted that under "Curriculum 2005", additional initiatives are envisaged within the school environment, including programmes to encourage non-discrimination and facilitate inclusion, especially of children with disabilities and those with HIV/AIDS. "Curriculum 2005" also aims to address the inequalities within the educational system established during apartheid.

### *Paragraph 447*

While noting that the law provides for compulsory education between the ages of 7 and 15 years, concern is expressed that primary education is not free. Concern is also expressed that inequality in access to education remains in some areas, particularly among Black children, girls and children from economically disadvantaged families, many of whom still do not attend school. The continued practice of discrimination in some schools, particularly against Black children in racially mixed schools, is a concern. With respect to the general situation of education, the following is noted with concern: the extent of overcrowding in some areas; high drop-out, illiteracy and repetition rates; lack of basic training materials; poorly maintained infrastructure and equipment; shortages of textbooks and other materials; insufficient number of trained teachers, particularly in traditionally Black communities; and low morale of teachers. Many children, especially in Black communities, do not enjoy the right to leisure, recreation and cultural activities. The State party is encouraged to continue its efforts to promote and facilitate school attendance, particularly among previously disadvantaged children, girls and children from economically disadvantaged families. In light of article 28 of the Convention, it is recommended that the State party take effective measures to ensure that primary education is available free to all. The State party should take additional measures to ensure non-discrimination within the school environment. Furthermore, effective measures should be taken to improve the quality of education and to provide access for all children within the State party. The State party is further urged to implement additional measures to encourage children to stay in school, at least during the period of compulsory education. In light of article 31, it is recommended that the State party take effective measures to ensure that children, especially those in Black communities, enjoy the right to leisure, recreation and cultural activities.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Georgia, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 18 at paras. 128 and 129.

### *Paragraph 128*

While the Constitution provides for the right to education and while the 1997 Education Act was adopted with a view to improving the situation of education in the State party, concerns remain about the situation of education, particularly of children in conflict zones and the mountainous regions. In this connection, concern is expressed about the impact of the economic situation on the education system; the decline in enrolment and attendance rates, particularly at the secondary level; the poor infrastructure, including inadequate heating, classrooms and other facilities for instruction; the limited availability of learning materials; insufficient resources, both human and financial; and inadequate instruction in local languages. It is noted with concern that the current economic conditions in the State party and the increasing cost of child care services have led to a significant decline in the enrolment of children in pre-school.

### *Paragraph 129*

All appropriate measures should be taken, including the allocation of adequate financial, human and technical resources, to improve the situation of education and ensure that all children enjoy the right to education. Additional measures should be implemented to encourage children to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education, and to facilitate pre-school education. The State party is encouraged to take all appropriate measures to improve the quality of teaching, to develop child-friendly schools, and to facilitate the introduction of traditional languages into the school curricula. It is recommended that the State party seek to strengthen its educational system through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Jordan, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 31 at paras. 199 and 200.

### *Paragraph 199*

Noting the significant achievements by the State party in improving access to education, attention should be focused on improving quality in this sector. Concern is expressed about the persistence of high drop-out and absenteeism rates, especially at the secondary level, due to, *inter alia*, lack of interest in school and poverty.

### *Paragraph 200*

The required resources should continue to be allocated, human and financial, to repairing and upgrading infrastructure, equipment and teaching materials and improving teachers' salaries, particularly in rural areas. The State party should undertake a process of curriculum reform which stresses the importance of critical thinking and the development of problem-solving skills. Retention programmes and vocational training should be established for drop-outs. The State party should promote the importance of early childhood care and development programmes, especially among low-income households, and encourage informal community schemes in this regard. The State party is

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

urged to continue to promote the participation of parents and communities in school governance, to improve enrolment rates and to monitor the quality of education. The State party is encouraged to seek assistance from UNICEF, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and relevant NGOs.

- Norway, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 43 at paras. 253-256.

### *Paragraph 253*

The Committee joins the State party in expressing concern at limitations, and the lack of specialization, in the educational background of some teachers and notes that such limitations have a negative impact on education and pupils and are a consequence of numerous factors, including teachers' low salaries.

### *Paragraph 254*

The impact of low teachers' salaries and other factors on education should be studied and efforts should be made to address the problems identified.

### *Paragraph 255*

That many Roma children and the children of other itinerant groups in the State party do not complete the required years of obligatory education is of concern.

### *Paragraph 256*

Means of making formal education more accessible to children who travel for a part of the year should be explored, such as through the use of mobile communications facilities and distance learning programmes.

- Kyrgyzstan, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 51 at paras. 308, 309, 318 and 319.

### *Paragraph 308*

The prevailing poor situation of children with disabilities is a concern. In particular, concern is expressed about the practice of institutionalizing children with disabilities, and about the fact that access to services such as rehabilitation and education are limited and severely strained.

### *Paragraph 309*

The State party should provide early childhood care and special education for children with disabilities; develop entry-grade detection capacity within the primary school system; and provide

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

services for children with learning disabilities and behavioural disorders. Awareness campaigns which focus on prevention, inclusive education, family care and the promotion of the rights of children with disabilities need to be undertaken. Adequate support, supervision and training should be given to persons working with these children.

### *Paragraph 318*

Concern is expressed about the deterioration in the quality of education, especially infrastructure, teaching and curricula. Declining pre-school enrolment and the persistence of high drop-out, repetition and absenteeism rates in primary and secondary schools are of concern.

### *Paragraph 319*

All necessary measures should be taken to allocate the required resources, both human and financial, to implement effectively the Education for All Programme. The State party should take due regard of the aims of education laid down in article 29, and consider introducing human rights, including the Convention on the Rights of the Child, into the school curricula, including at the primary level. The importance of early childhood care and development programmes should be promoted, especially among low-income households, and in this regard informal community schemes should be stimulated. The State party should promote the participation of parents and communities, especially ethnic minorities, in school governance to improve enrolment rates and monitor the quality of education.

### *See also:*

- Tajikistan, CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 53 at paras. 309 and 310.
  
- Cambodia, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 64 at paras. 384 and 385.

### *Paragraph 384*

While welcoming the current efforts being carried out by the State party, in cooperation with international agencies, to improve its educational system, concern is expressed about the fact that primary education is not compulsory; that although enrolment rates in primary school are relatively high, equal access to quality education is not ensured owing to a lack of schools in rural and remote areas; that there are gender disparities in school attendance; that there are high repetition and drop-out rates; and that a majority of children belonging to minority groups do not have access to any form of education.

### *Paragraph 385*

The State party should continue to undertake effective measures to make primary education free and compulsory for all children; to increase the enrolment rates and decrease drop-out and repetition rates; to increase access to schools, in particular for poor children, girls, children belonging to minority groups and children living in remote areas. It is further recommended that the State party

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

continue to take measures to improve its education system by increasing budget allocations for the education sector; providing training to upgrade teachers' skills; making the school curricula more relevant to children's needs; expanding opportunities for vocational training and non-formal education, including at pre-school and secondary levels; and establishing an evaluation system to measure the effectiveness of the education system.

- Malta, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 75 at paras. 438 and 439.

### *Paragraph 438*

The State party's achievements in the field of education are welcomed. However, concern is expressed about issues of illiteracy and absenteeism and bullying in schools.

### *Paragraph 439*

The State party should continue strengthening its educational programme with a view to improving its quality and relevance. The State party should seek to implement additional measures to encourage children to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education.

- Suriname, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 84 at paras. 471, 472, 495, 499 and 500.

### *Paragraph 471*

It is noted that education is compulsory for children between the ages of 7 and 12 years and that the legal minimum age for employment is 14 years. Concern is expressed that insufficient legal and other measures have been taken to protect adequately the rights of children between the ages of 12 and 14 years, who are beyond the age of compulsory education but too young to be legally employed.

### *Paragraph 472*

The legal maximum age of compulsory education should be raised from 12 to at least 14 years to protect the rights of those children between the ages of 12 and 14 years, who are beyond the age of compulsory education but too young to be legally employed.

### *Paragraph 495*

The absence of legal protection and the lack of adequate facilities and services for children with disabilities is of concern. Insufficient efforts have been made to facilitate the inclusion of children with disabilities into the educational system and generally within society.

### *Paragraph 499*

The efforts of the State party within the school environment are noted, including the establishment of a school nutrition programme, the introduction of school transportation in some regions of the country, the implementation of a programme that provides allowances for the rental of books and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

subsidies for school uniforms and other relevant learning materials for economically disadvantaged children; the establishment of a programme that allows teenage mothers to continue their education; and the decision to host a National Education Congress in December 2000. However, concerns remain about the situation of education, particularly in the interior. It is noted that there is still limited access to education, high drop-out and repetition rates, insufficient numbers of trained teachers actually in the classroom, insufficient schools and classrooms, and a general lack of relevant learning material. It is noted with concern that the budgetary allocations for education have been progressively reduced during the past decade. The insufficient efforts made by the State party to incorporate the use of local languages into the educational curriculum is also a matter of concern.

### *Paragraph 500*

All appropriate measures should be taken, including the allocation of adequate financial, human and technical resources, to improve the situation of education and ensure that all children enjoy the right to education. It is further recommended that all appropriate measures be taken to increase access to education, especially as regards children living in the interior, and to encourage trained teachers to stay in teaching. The State party should seek to implement additional measures to encourage children, especially girls in the interior and boys in urban communities, to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education. The State party is encouraged to reinforce its efforts to include the use of traditional languages in the school curricula. The State party is encouraged to follow through with its proposal to host a National Education Congress to improve the overall situation of education in all regions of the country, and in this context, the Congress is strongly encouraged to include the general principles of the Convention, as well as articles 28, 29 and 31, in its discussions and recommendations to the State party. It is recommended that the State party encourage child participation within the school environment, including in disciplinary matters.

- Djibouti, CRC, CRC/C/97 (2000) 96 at paras. 556 and 557.

### *Paragraph 556*

The Committee is seriously concerned about the low rates of school enrolment and attendance and the high drop-out and illiteracy rates, as well as about the extent of gender disparities in this respect. It is also concerned about the limited number of trained teachers and school facilities, and further concerned by information indicating that refugee children are denied access to education outside of refugee camps.

### *Paragraph 557*

The State party should continue its efforts to promote and facilitate school attendance, particularly among girls and refugee children. In light of article 28 of the Convention, the State party should take

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

effective measures to ensure that primary education is available to all. The State party should improve the quality of teaching and reduce drop-out rates. The State party is encouraged to strengthen its education system by seeking further international assistance from UNICEF and UNESCO, among others.

- Burundi, CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 17 at paras. 149, 150, 152 and 153.

### *Paragraph 149*

The Committee is very concerned at the dramatic fall in the number of children attending primary and secondary school in the State party, at the insufficient number of qualified teachers working in rural communities and in camps, at the lack of adequate teaching equipment and at repeated attacks by armed persons on schools. Concern is also expressed about the limited access of children with disabilities to formal or vocational educational opportunities and at the proportionally low number of girls attending primary or secondary school.

### *Paragraph 150*

The State party is urged to continue and strengthen its efforts to rebuild and reopen schools, recruit qualified teachers in those areas where they are needed, make available adequate teaching equipment and ensure that all children, including indigent and displaced children, have equal access to education opportunities. A clear programme of action for increasing children's access to formal education should be developed. The State party should ensure that children with disabilities have access to formal and vocational educational opportunities and every effort should be made to ensure that girls and boys have equal access to educational opportunities.

### *Paragraph 152*

Deep concern is expressed at the very large numbers of persons who have become refugees or internally displaced within the country and at the situation of those displaced children who are unaccompanied. The Committee is disturbed in particular by the massive numbers of people who have been forcibly regrouped within the country and by the very poor, sometimes life-threatening conditions in displaced and regrouped persons camps, and the poor health and education services available to camp populations. It is noted that the State party has publicly promised to end the regroupment policy, but has failed to do so.

### *Paragraph 153*

The State party is urged to make every effort to protect the civilian population from displacement and to implement its plans to end regroupment, giving particular attention to the situation of unaccompanied children and the need for effective family tracing. The State party is urged to ensure that all displaced children and their families, including those who have been regrouped, have access to essential health and education services and to consider the need for continued access to such services during the often slow process of return to communities of origin.



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (Isle of Man), CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 31 at para. 195.

Additional efforts should be made to: enhance early identification programmes to prevent disabilities; strengthen special education programmes for children with disabilities; and, where possible, encourage the inclusion of children with disabilities in the regular school system and more generally in society.

- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (Overseas Territories), CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 40 at paras. 251-254.

### *Paragraph 251*

The increasing incidence of truancy and the number of drop-outs from school in some of the Territories, especially the Turks and Caicos Islands and Montserrat is of concern. With regard to access to education, it is noted with concern that the travelling teacher service in the Falkland Islands does not include secondary schools and that children from Camp must attend secondary school in Stanley, where they are accommodated in government hostels for which their parents must pay. The academic under-achievement of boys in some of the Overseas Territories, including the Falkland Islands and the Caribbean Territories is noted. It is also of concern that while the new nationality policy of the United Kingdom provides full citizenship to nationals of the Overseas Territories, students from these Territories who wish to pursue further studies in the United Kingdom continue to pay more in tuition fees than students from the United Kingdom.

### *Paragraph 252*

All appropriate measures should be taken to prevent and discourage truancy and to encourage children, especially boys, to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education. The State party is urged to undertake a study on the academic under-achievement of boys, with a view to understanding the scope and nature of the problem and to enhancing the academic achievement of boys, particularly in the Caribbean Territories and the Falkland Islands. The Falkland Islands should take all appropriate measures to ensure that the inability to pay does not limit or prevent adequate and equal access to education for children from Camp. The State party should review its higher education policies to ensure non-discrimination against nationals from the Overseas Territories in the payment of fees when they pursue studies in the United Kingdom.

### *Paragraph 253*

The situation of families in Montserrat who have been displaced since the volcanic eruption in 1997 is of concern. Concern is also expressed about the relatively slow pace at which programmes and services, including access to adequate housing, education and health services, are being re-established in Montserrat for internally displaced families.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 254*

All appropriate measures should be taken to improve the situation of internally displaced families, including their access to adequate housing, education and health services.

Colombia, CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 64 at paras. 374 and 375.

### *Paragraph 374*

The Government's achievements in the field of education are acknowledged. Concerns remain about the high drop-out and repetition rates in primary and secondary school, and at the disparities in access to education between rural and urban areas. Particular concern is expressed about the situation of children belonging to Afro-Colombian and indigenous groups, as well as those living in camps for the displaced regarding their access to education and the low relevance of the current bilingual educational programmes available for them.

### *Paragraph 375*

In the light of articles 28, 29 and other related articles of the Convention, efforts to strengthen its educational policies and system should be continued, in order to improve ongoing retention programmes and vocational training for drop-out students; to extend coverage and to improve the quality of education, respecting geographical and cultural diversity; and to improve the relevance of bilingual education programmes for children belonging to indigenous and Afro-Colombian groups. Furthermore, in view of the ongoing armed conflict, the State party should strengthen its programmes on human rights education, including on the rights of the child, in its teacher training programmes and school curricula, and ensure that every child receives such an education.

- Central African Republic, CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 77 at paras. 467 and 468.

### *Paragraph 467*

Deep concern is expressed about the low education levels among children in the State party, the number of children who are several years behind in their primary education, the high drop-out rate of children who do attend school and the closing of many schools and classes because of a lack of teachers. The difficulties linked to the introduction of the national language into schools is a concern.

### *Paragraph 468*

The State party should make every effort to raise the level of educational achievement among children through, *inter alia*, increasing the number of available schools and classes, providing for the initial and ongoing training of more teachers and school inspectors, developing standard national textbooks, increasing the rates of enrolment and providing assistance with school fees, uniforms and other equipment for poor families. The State party is urged to seek international assistance in this regard,

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

including from UNICEF and UNESCO. The State party should continue to make every effort, including through the allocation of relevant material and other resources, to standardize the use of the Sango language in schools.

- Marshall Islands, CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 89 at paras. 532, 535 and 536.

### *Paragraph 532*

The State party should allocate the necessary resources for programmes and facilities for children with disabilities. The State party should also develop early identification programmes to prevent disabilities, establish special education programmes for children with disabilities and further encourage their integration into the educational system and inclusion into society.

### *Paragraph 535*

Concern is expressed about the low enrolment rate in elementary and secondary schools; the high drop-out rate of students in high schools; the insufficient numbers and low standard of trained/qualified teachers and schools available, in particular in the outer islands; the poor quality of education and the lack of vocational training in schools.

### *Paragraph 536*

In light of article 28 of the Convention, it is recommended that appropriate measures be undertaken to ensure regular attendance at schools, the reduction of drop-out rates and the incorporation of vocational education in school curricula. The State party is urged to continue to strengthen the teacher training programme in order to increase the number of trained teachers and improve the quality of teaching.

- Slovakia, CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 100 at paras. 588 and 589.

### *Paragraph 588*

It is acknowledged with appreciation that 10 years of schooling is compulsory in the State party and that it is free. However, it is of concern that children do not have the right to participate in the evaluation of their school achievements.

### *Paragraph 589*

Education should be directed towards the development, with the active participation of the child, of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential, in accordance with article 29 of the Convention.

- Comoros, CRC, CRC/C/100 (2000) 110 at paras. 640 and 641.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 640*

School enrolment ratios are low and equal access to education is not ensured. The high level of illiteracy in the country, the gender disparities in school attendance and high drop out rates are also matters of concern. The education system is affected by a general lack of facilities and equipment, insufficient qualified teachers, and a drastic shortage of text books and other learning materials.

### *Paragraph 641*

Efforts should be continued to promote and facilitate school attendance, particularly among girls. In the light of article 28 of the Convention, the State party should take effective measures to ensure that primary education is available to all, to improve the quality of teaching and to reduce drop-out rates. The State party is encouraged to strengthen its educational system, if necessary by seeking further international assistance, from *inter alia*, UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Latvia, CRC, CRC/C/103 (2001) 9 at paras. 65, 70 and 71.

### *Paragraph 65*

The necessary resources should be allocated for programmes and facilities for all children with disabilities up to the age of 18, especially the ones living in rural areas, and community-based programmes should be developed in order for children to be able to stay at home with their families. The State party should further encourage their integration into the educational system and inclusion into society, including by providing special training to teachers and by making schools more accessible.

### *Paragraph 70*

The high number of children not attending compulsory primary school is noted with concern. A number of schools in rural areas have been closed. The quality of education provided in rural areas is inferior to that in urban areas.

### *Paragraph 71*

In light of article 28 of the Convention, appropriate measures should be undertaken to ensure regular attendance at schools and the reduction of drop-out rates. The “School is waiting for you” campaign carried out by the National Centre for Protection of Children’s Rights to inform society of the need to ensure that all children attend primary school should be continued. Local governments should be assisted in their work to implement regulations on the registration of children. Measures should be undertaken to facilitate the regular attendance at school of children from poor and/or dysfunctional families.

- Ethiopia, CRC, CRC/C/103 (2001) 24 at paras. 166, 167, 182 and 183.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

### *Paragraph 166*

Concern is expressed at the predominant use of institutional responses to provide assistance to children in difficulty and that children who are cared for in institutions for many years, and until the age of 18, are not given the educational and vocational skills necessary for them to make an independent living once they leave the institution.

### *Paragraph 167*

While urging the State party to avoid recourse to the institutionalization of children as a form of alternative care, the State party should ensure that children cared for by State or private institutions are given all the assistance they need, including an education and suitable vocational training, to enable them to establish a life for themselves after leaving the institution.

### *Paragraph 182*

Deep concern is expressed at the very low rates of primary and secondary school enrolment, at the especially low rate of enrolment among girls and at the very high drop-out rate. In addition, concern is expressed that insufficient resources among education authorities, schools and parents are having a negative impact on children's enrolment in and completion of primary and secondary school.

### *Paragraph 183*

The State party should pursue its efforts to increase enrolment, build additional schools, supply better school equipment, improve teacher training and recruit more teachers in order to improve the quality of education, giving particular attention to those regions most in need of such assistance. Action should be taken to assist with the costs of education, *inter alia*, school uniforms and fees, for those children with insufficient means. Every effort should be made to increase the enrolment of girls at both primary and secondary school levels and to ensure that all children enrolled are able to complete their education.

- Egypt, CRC, CRC/C/103 (2001) 36 at paras. 242 and 243.

### *Paragraph 242*

In light of previous concluding observations and taking note of significant efforts by the State party to improve education coverage, enrolment and retention levels and the inclusion of the Convention in the school curricula, concerns remain about the poor quality of education in general. The lack of success of literacy programmes for school dropouts is also a concern.

### *Paragraph 243*

The State party is encouraged to continue its efforts to pursue universal access to education, targeting the girl child and children belonging to the most vulnerable groups. A process of curriaph 243c3( pr)-11reform



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

enrol in school and complete their education. The Convention should be fully integrated into the curricula at all levels of the educational system. In addition, the State party should significantly increase the availability of pre-school places.

### *Paragraph 363*

It is noted with deep concern that girls who become pregnant whilst still attending school are often excluded from school and that such action is not only discriminatory against girls but also a violation of the right to education.

### *Paragraph 364*

The State party is urged to ensure that pregnant girls are permitted to continue attending school both during and after their pregnancy.

- Palau, CRC, CRC/C/103 (2001) 79 at paras. 468-471.

### *Paragraph 468*

The insufficient efforts and the reluctance of teachers to facilitate the inclusion and acceptance of children with disabilities into the regular school system, despite requirements under law, are matters of concern.

### *Paragraph 469*

The State party should strengthen its efforts to develop early identification programmes to prevent disabilities; establish special education programmes for children with disabilities; and implement the law that provides for their inclusion within the school system. The State party should reinforce its efforts to raise awareness and sensitize the public about the rights and special needs of children with disabilities, including children with mental health concerns.

### *Paragraph 470*

The Master Plan for Education 2000 is noted, and aims to improve the quality and relevance of education and prepare students for adult life. However, concern is expressed about inadequate performance of students and the continually high drop-out rates, particularly at the secondary school level. There is insufficient teacher support in smaller schools in the rural areas and the outer islands, and overcrowding in the larger schools in the urban centres. There is no physical education programme in the school system. It is noted with concern that the budgetary allocations for education have been progressively reduced since independence in 1994. The lack of clear policy and practice on the incorporation of Palauan, as a parallel language, in the educational curriculum is also a matter of concern.

### *Paragraph 471*

All appropriate measures should be taken, including the allocation of adequate financial, human and

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

technical resources, to improve the situation (including the quality and relevance) of education and to ensure that all children enjoy the right to education. The State party should seek to implement additional measures to encourage children, especially boys, to stay in school, particularly during the period of compulsory education. In this connection, a study on school drop-out and the linkages between the drop-out rate and the relevance of educational material and methods of teaching should be undertaken. In the light of article 31, a physical education programme should be introduced into the school curriculum. In addition, efforts to establish clear policy and practice regarding the use of Palauan as a parallel language in the school curriculum should be reinforced.

- Dominican Republic, CRC, CRC/C/103 (2001) 91 at paras. 522 and 523.

### *Paragraph 522*

The State party's efforts in the field of education are welcomed, particularly the inclusion of human rights teaching, including children's rights, in the school curricula. However, concerns remain about the high drop-out and repetition rates in primary and secondary schools, disparities between urban and rural areas in terms of access to education and to quality education, the insufficient number of well-trained teaching staff and children's limited access to materials and text books. Concern is also expressed at various forms of discrimination and exclusion which still affect the right to education of certain groups of children, such as pregnant adolescents, unregistered children, children with disabilities and children of Haitian origin born in the State party's territory or belonging to Haitian migrant families, reflecting insufficient attention to article 29 of the Convention.

### *Paragraph 523*

In the light of article 28 and other related articles of the Convention, the State party should continue its efforts in the field of education by strengthening its policies and system in order to: improve on-going retention programmes and vocational training for drop-out students; improve schools infrastructure; continue with curricular reform, including teaching methodologies; eradicate regional disparities with reference to school enrolment and attendance; and implement special education programmes taking into account the needs of vulnerable children. The explicit inclusion of the aims of education as mentioned in article 29 of the Convention in the school curricula is recommended.

- Turkey, CRC, CRC/C/108 (2001) 18 at paras. 85, 91, 92 and 135-139.

### *Paragraph 85*

The fact that the duration of compulsory education has been increased to eight years is welcomed.

### *Paragraph 91*

The reservations to articles 17, 29 and 30 of the Convention are noted with concern. It is also noted that, in some cases, in particular in the fields of education and freedom of expression and the right



## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

to enjoy one's own culture and use one's own language, these reservations may have a negative impact on children belonging to ethnic groups which are not recognized as minorities under the Treaty of Lausanne of 1923, in particular children of Kurdish origin.

### *Paragraph 92*

The State party is encouraged to consider withdrawing its reservations to articles 17, 29 and 30 of the Convention.

### *Paragraph 135*

Of concern are the high drop-out rates among girls after the third grade, particularly in rural areas; the decline in the quality of education and the insufficiently participatory teaching methods; the lack of trained personnel and insufficient infrastructure, especially classrooms, in particular in large metropolitan areas and in the south-east.

### *Paragraph 136*

Appropriate measures should be undertaken to ensure regular attendance at school and the reduction of drop-out rates, particularly for girls. Efforts should be continued to introduce pre-school education and to take further steps to ensure the enrolment of children in secondary schools. The State party should continue to strengthen the teacher training programme in order to increase the number of trained teachers, improve the quality of education and to direct education toward the aims mentioned in article 29(1) of the Convention and the Committee's General Comments on the aims of education.

### *Paragraph 137*

It is of concern that only asylum-seekers from European countries are granted refugee status, and thus, child asylum-seekers of non-European origin, who represent the majority, can be granted asylum only on a temporary basis until they find a third country and, therefore, do not always have access to education and health care.

### *Paragraph 138*

The State party is encouraged to consider withdrawing the geographical limitation on the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Optional Protocol in order that non-European child refugees to be granted refugee status. It is further recommended that measures be strengthened in order to allow all child asylum-seekers and refugee children full access to education.

### *Paragraph 139*

The large number of internally displaced children who were forced to leave their home towns in 1990 owing to the high level of violence in the south-east region is of concern. Concern is also expressed at their limited access to housing, health services and education.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Democratic Republic of the Congo, CRC, CRC/C/108 (2001) 31 at paras. 193, 194, 209 and 210.

### *Paragraph 193*

Concern is expressed at the practice of “fictitious” care for children deprived of their parents, as replacement for genuine adoption, which deprives these children of care and education. Mechanisms for the monitoring of respect for the rights of children in institutions and the provision of assistance are inadequate.

### *Paragraph 194*

The State party should ensure greater legal and effective protection of the rights of children deprived of their parents to emotional care and to education and health services, including in the context of informal adoption procedures. The State party should also strengthen its mechanisms for the monitoring of respect for the rights of children in need of, and receiving, alternative care assistance.

### *Paragraph 209*

Great concern is expressed at the high numbers of children who never attend school or who drop out early from their formal education. It is of further concern that in practice primary education is not free and that many parents have to pay school fees as well as related costs such as for uniforms and equipment, which remain too expensive for most families. Furthermore, the low rate of school enrolment of girls, their high drop-out rate and the high female illiteracy rate, especially in rural areas, are matters of deep concern. Further, some girls are the victims of sexual harassment by teachers. It is of concern that school infrastructure and equipment are very inadequate, the quality of education is poor, that teachers are not well trained, and that some students are required to pay teachers for their grades.

### *Paragraph 210*

Legislation should be adopted and implemented that establishes a minimum age for the completion of compulsory education and provides for genuinely free primary and, as far as possible, secondary education, with emphasis on assisting children from the most disadvantaged backgrounds. Measures should be implemented to increase enrolment of children in school and reduce the drop out rate. It is further recommended that the State party strengthen efforts to improve the access of girls to education, including by establishing specific programmes to reduce female illiteracy and information campaigns promoting this right. Measure should also be implemented to end the harassment of girls in school. The State party should pursue efforts to improve the quality of education and strengthen education infrastructure, including through improvements to teacher training, the introduction of human rights education and education for peace, building additional classrooms and more schools, and by providing free transport to schools for children who live far away. It is recommended that assistance be sought from UNICEF and UNESCO in this regard.

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

- Guatemala, CRC, CRC/C/108 (2001) 47 at paras. 249, 250, 266, 274 and 282.

### *Paragraph 249*

Concern remains about the disparity between the legal minimum age for admission to employment (14 years) and the age for the end of compulsory education (15 years).

### *Paragraph 250*

The minimum age for admission to employment should be redefined so that it corresponds to the age at which compulsory education ends.

### *Paragraph 266*

The State party should further encourage the integration of disabled children into the regular educational system and their inclusion in society, including by providing special training to teachers and by making schools more accessible.

### *Paragraph 274*

Appropriate measures should be taken to increase budgetary allocations for education, ensure regular attendance at schools and the reduction of drop-out rates, and strengthen the quality of education. The State party should continue to strengthen the teacher training programme in order to increase the number of trained teachers and improve the quality of teaching and the bilingual education programme is reiterated. In this respect, the State party is encouraged to seek additional technical cooperation from, among others, UNESCO and UNICEF.

### *Paragraph 282*

The State party should expedite the adoption of a National Plan for the Care of Street Children and ensure that children living in the streets are provided with nutrition, clothing, housing, health care and educational opportunities, including vocational and life-skills training, in order to support their full development.

### *See also:*

- Mauritania, CRC, CRC/C/111 (2001) 8 at paras. 48 and 49.
  
- Côte d'Ivoire, CRC, CRC/C/108 (2001) 59 at paras. 307, 308, 337 and 338.

### *Paragraph 307*

It is of deep concern that no minimum age has been set for the end of compulsory education and that the practice of early marriage is still widespread.

### *Paragraph 308*

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

Legislation should be reviewed with a view to eliminating all disparities regarding minimum-age requirements, and greater efforts should be made to enforce the requirements. It is strongly recommended that the State party set a minimum age for the end of compulsory education.

### *Paragraph 337*

While noting the adoption of the Education Act (1995) and of a national programme for the development of education (2000), as well as the current project to make education free and compulsory for all up to the age of 16 years, deep concern remains that primary education is not compulsory and free for all in the State party. Also of concern are the low education levels among children in the State party, gender and rural-urban disparities in school attendance, the limited access of children with disabilities to formal or vocational educational opportunities, the number of children who are several years behind in their primary education, and the high drop-out rate of children who do attend school. It is also of concern that Koranic schools are placed under the authority and administration of the Ministry of the Interior.

### *Paragraph 338*

The State party is urged to adopt and implement the project to make primary education free to all and compulsory. The level of educational achievement among children should be raised through increasing the number of available schools and classes, providing for the initial and ongoing training of more teachers and school inspectors, developing standard national textbooks, increasing the rates of enrolment and providing assistance with school fees, uniforms and other equipment for poor families. The State party is urged to seek international assistance in this regard, including from UNICEF. In addition, it should be ensured that children with disabilities have access to formal and vocational educational opportunities and every effort should be made to ensure that girls and boys, as well as children from urban and rural areas, have equal access to educational opportunities. In this regard, assistance should be sought from UNICEF and UNESCO. Furthermore, appropriate measures should be taken to ensure that Koranic schools respect national school curricula and aims of education and are placed under the authority of the Ministry for Education.

- United Republic of Tanzania, CRC, CRC/C/108 (2001) 71 at paras. 408 and 409.

### *Paragraph 408*

The Education Sector Development Programme, which focuses on access and equity in education, and the Complementary Basic Education Programme which seeks to improve drop-out rates, especially of girls, are welcomed. It is noted with appreciation that the Government is considering the possibility of abolishing school fees and other types of payments for primary school children. However, concern remains about the limited access to education, especially for girls, including pregnant girls, children from economically disadvantaged families and those living in remote rural communities. Concern is also expressed regarding high drop-out and repetition rates, insufficient numbers of trained teachers, insufficient schools and classrooms, and the lack of relevant learning

## EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION

material. In light of article 29(1) of the Convention, the quality of education within the State party is also of concern. The reported incidents of sexual abuse and exploitation of girls within the school environment are noted with regret.

### *Paragraph 409*

All appropriate measures, including the allocation and distribution of adequate financial, human and technical resources, should be taken to enhance the quality of education and ensure that all children enjoy the right to education. The State party should reinforce its efforts to increase access to education by abolishing user fees at the primary level. In this regard, the State party is encouraged to further consider rationalizing user fees at the secondary and tertiary levels. Particular attention should be paid to the quality of education, in light of article 29(1) of the Convention and the Committee's General Comment No. 1 on the aims of education. All effective measures should be taken to protect children, especially girls, against sexual abuse and violence within the school environment and to facilitate the rehabilitation of child victims in this regard. The State party should seek to strengthen its educational system through closer cooperation with UNICEF and UNESCO.

- Bhutan, CRC, CRC/C/108 (2001) 85 at paras. 452, 453, 470 and 471.

### *Paragraph 452*

Concern is expressed about the impact on children of reports of discrimination against individuals belonging to the Lhotshampas. Of particular concern are reports that these children face *de facto* discrimination in access to education and other services and on the basis of status, activities or opinions of their parents or relatives.

### *Paragraph 453*

Effective measures, including enacting or rescinding legislation where necessary, should be taken to prevent and eliminate discrimination, in accordance with article 2 of the Convention, in all fields of civil, economic, political, social and cultural life. Accessible, prompt and effective mechanisms should be established to monitor, receive and address complaints of discrimination (e.g. prompt appeal in circumstances of denial of school enrolment). The State party should also take all appropriate measures, such as comprehensive public education campaigns, to prevent and combat negative societal attitudes towards different ethnic groups.

### *Paragraph 470*

Although noting significant achievements in education indicators, it is of concern that primary education is not compulsory; that there is still a significant gender gap in enrolment; and that there are deficiencies in access to education and the quality of teacher training.

### *Paragraph 471*

The State party should ensure that primary education is free and made compulsory; make greater

## **EDUCATION - RIGHT TO EDUCATION**

efforts to close the gender gap; and allocate the required resources to address access to education and the quality of teacher training.

- Monaco, CRC, CRC/C/108 (2001) 97 at paras. 529 and 530.

### *Paragraph 529*

Noting the attention given by the State party to children under 16 working in a family context, there is concern that such work may interfere with children's right to education.

### *Paragraph 530*

The State party should continue and strengthen its efforts to ensure respect for the rights of children under 16 working in a family context, and particularly the right to education.